EDITORIAL STAFF
Melvin T. Smith, Editor
Stanford J. Layton, Managing Editor
Miriam B. Murphy, Assistant Editor

ADVISORY BOARD OF EDITORS
Thomas G. Alexander, Provo, 1977
Mrs. Inez S. Cooper, Cedar City, 1978
S. George Ellsworth, Logan, 1978
Glen M. Leonard, Bountiful, 1976
David E. Miller, Salt Lake City, 1976
LaMar Petersen, Salt Lake City, 1977
Richard W. Sadler, Ogden, 1976
Harold Schinuler, Salt Lake City, 1978
Jerome Stoffel, Logan, 1977

Utah Historical Quarterly was established in 1928 to publish articles, documents, and reviews contributing to knowledge of Utah's history. The Quarterly is published by the Utah State Historical Society, 603 East South Temple, Salt Lake City, Utah 84102. Phone (801) 533-5755.

Members of the Society receive the Quarterly and the bimonthly Newsletter upon payment of the annual dues; for details see inside back cover. Single copies, $2.00.

Materials for publication should be submitted in duplicate accompanied by return postage and should be typed double-spaced with footnotes at the end. Additional information on requirements is available from the managing editor. The Society assumes no responsibility for statements of fact or opinion by contributors.

The Quarterly is indexed in Book Review Index to Social Science Periodicals, America: History and Life, and on Biblio Cards.

Second class postage is paid at Salt Lake City, Utah.

ISSN 0042-143X
Contents

IN THIS ISSUE .............................. 111

MEN, MOTIVES, AND MISUNDERSTANDINGS:
A NEW LOOK AT THE MORRISITE
WAR OF 1862 .............................. G. M. Howard 112

ARCHAEOLOGICAL AND CRYPTOLOGICAL
ANALYSES OF THE
MANTI INSCRIPTIONS ............. William James Adams, Jr.,
and Ray T. Matheny 133

CATHOLICISM AMONG THE MORMONS, 1875–79 . Francis J. Weber 141

THE UTAH GOSPEL MISSION, 1900–1950 . Stanley B. Kimball 149

AN ANARCHIST DEFENDS THE MORMONS:
THE CASE OF DYER D. LUM ........ John S. McCormick 156

MORMON RELIGION IN NAUVOO:
SOME REFLECTIONS ............... Marvin S. Hill 170

BOOK REVIEWS .......................... 181

BOOK NOTICES ........................... 193

RECENT ARTICLES ........................ 196

HISTORICAL NOTES ........................ 199

THE COVER An unidentified church, photographed by members of the Utah Gospel Mission, symbolizes the unusual role played by many churches in the history of the West. Photograph courtesy of Bowling Green State University.

© Copyright 1976
Utah State Historical Society
CHARLES S. PETERSON. *Look to the Mountains: Southeastern Utah and the La Sal National Forest*. Jay M. Haymond 181


JUANITA BROOKS. *Emma Lee*. Ralph J. Roske 185

**Books reviewed**

W. L. RUSHTO and C. GREGORY CRAMPTON. *Desert River Crossing: Historic Lee's Ferry on the Colorado River*. Melvin T. Smith 186

JOSEPH STIPANOVICH. *The South Slavs in Utah: A Social History*. Norman Lederer 186

J. HOGUE CASE. *Salt Lake Sketchbook: Historic Buildings from an Artist's View*. Peter L. Goss 188


JAMES H. SHIDELER. *Agriculture in the Development of the Far West*. Lee Scamehorn 191

FRANK RUSSELL. *The Pima Indians*. Joseph C. Winter 192
In this issue

Sectarian interaction has figured prominently in defining the color and direction of Utah history. It has assumed various forms and produced a great many results—some tragic, some beneficial, nearly all profound and interesting. The half-dozen articles featured in this issue are representative of this variety and those consequences.

The Morrisite War was a complex event that appears to have been oversimplified in traditional historiography. The new analysis offered here illuminates many facets heretofore obscure and begins to assign a dimension to the sectarian impulse of mid-nineteenth-century Utah.

The next four articles—dealing with inscriptions, letters, photographs, and biography—illustrate that sectarian zeal in Utah has manifested itself in ways both customary and peculiar, that it is a twentieth-century as well as a nineteenth-century phenomenon, and that its implications have extended deep into the national mainstream.

The concluding article focuses on the Nauvoo, rather than Utah, period of Mormon history. Discerning and detailed, it is a fitting capstone to this issue, explaining as it does the compatibility of mitre and scepter in early Mormon thought. This perception is not only essential to an understanding of Utah’s specific history in all its phases but in a more general way is appropriate to everyone at all times. It is a timely reminder of the enormous influence of things historical in shaping the consciousness of, and providing the continuity for, a people.
Men, Motives, and Misunderstandings:  
A New Look at the  
Morrisite War of 1862

BY G. M. HOWARD

Above: Nauvoo Legion cannon, now part of a Daughters of Utah Pioneers monument at Farmington, was used against the Morrisites. Photograph by G. M. Howard.

As the United States was struggling for its very existence on the Civil War battlefields, the territory of Utah faced an internal crisis of its own. Though small in comparison to the national strife, it nevertheless

Dr. Howard is a retired dentist living in Bountiful, Utah.
resulted in great anguish, bloodshed, and lasting scars. Ostensibly, the issue was enforcement of the law. Given the church-state union in Utah at the time, however, legal controversy was certain to be political and religious as well. At stake in this instance was nothing less than the unity and leadership of the territory itself. Reflecting the spirit of the times, it too was decided by force of arms—with the final chapter unfolding at Kingston Fort near the mouth of Weber Canyon in the spring of 1862. For want of a more accurate term, the tragedy is known as the Morrisite War.

Joseph Morris, after whom the incident took its name, was the fifth child in a family of eight children. He was born in Burswardly, Cheshire, England, in 1824 and as a young man worked as a farmhand and a coal miner. Small in stature, he stood not more than five feet six inches tall, but his frame was well knit and muscular. His dark eyes and long dark hair, which tended to hang in ringlets, stood in remarkable contrast to his fair skin which was almost feminine in its whiteness and texture. Although generally timid and reserved, Morris could become passionate and outspoken when expressing deep personal beliefs. At age twenty-three he was converted by Mormon missionaries and baptized into the church. Not long afterward he married Mary Thorpe and both left England for Utah.

The Morrises did not proceed directly to the Great Basin. Instead, they tarried in Saint Louis for two years where Joseph worked as a fireman on a boat plying the Mississippi River. From there they moved to Pittsburgh where Joseph served for a time as branch president of the Mormon congregation there. Upon being relieved of that assignment, apparently due to the congregation's dissatisfaction with his teachings, Joseph brought his wife and child to Utah, arriving at Salt Lake City in the fall of 1853.1

For their first six months in Utah, the Joseph Morris family lived with Joseph’s brother, George Morris, in Salt Lake City. From there they moved to Sanpete County and took up residence with Mary’s brother at Ephraim. Within a few months, Mary, at the urging of the ward bishop, left Joseph, taking with her their one child and all their belongings. In 1855 Joseph remarried, but this union was not successful either. Within six months his new wife, the widow Elizabeth Mills, had initiated divorce proceedings.2

2 George Morris Diary, Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo.
CONFlicTS wITH Church AUTHORITIES

In the early spring of 1857 Morris removed to Provo and married again, this time to Elizabeth Jones. This was the time of the impassioned religious revival in Utah generally known as the Reformation. Speaking of blood atonement and calling for repentance and rebaptism, the church leaders sought to promote among the Saints a renewed loyalty to themselves and the church teachings. There was an evangelism, even a frenzy, in the air which Joseph Morris found irresistible. Being rebaptized and set apart as a special teacher, he dedicated himself to the Reformation and began proclaiming passionately against the evils he saw around him.

Before very long, however, Joseph's preaching ran him afoul of local church authorities. Apparently, the issue was polygamy. Morris had received no inkling of the plural marriage practice until his arrival in Salt Lake City in 1853, and he had never been able to reconcile himself to it. To him it was nothing less than adultery, and his Reformation rhetoric probably reflected that conviction.

Whatever the cause, Morris soon came to feel abused by his stake president, James C. Snow. Snow summarily relieved Morris of his teaching assignment, turned his back on him, and had no further conversation or dealing with him. The local bishop and ward members also withdrew their friendship. His wife then left him, for which he blamed the direct counsel of President Snow, and his ostracism was complete.3

Utterly cast down, Morris sought solace in prayer. He had prayed many times before and had in fact won the nickname "Praying Joe" in Provo and Springville. But this experience was special; it resulted in a revelation. There in Provo in 1857 it was revealed to Joseph Morris that he was chosen "from before the foundation of the world to be a mighty man, yea, to be a prophet in Israel." 4

Greatly buoyed by this experience, Morris sent a letter to Brigham Young, president of the church, informing him of this calling. He proposed a type of dual presidency for the church in which he and Young would share administrative responsibilities but he (Morris) would hold the keys of prophet, seer, and revelator. This and succeeding letters of a similar nature were apparently not answered.

3 The Spirit Prevails, Containing the Revelations, Articles, and Letters Written by Joseph Morris (San Francisco, 1886), pp. 1-3. The first eight pages of this volume consist of an introduction penned by George S. Dove, a disciple of Morris.
4 Ibid., p. 9.
Morris soon left Provo, drifting north to American Fork for a time and then, in 1858, taking up brief residence in Salt Lake City. Spring of 1860 found him in Slaterville, just north of Ogden, where he lingered for six months. He continued to preach of his divine commission and to seek further guidance in prayer. In 1859 he received his second revelation, taking from it the full keys of the kingdom. By August 1860 he had received two more revelations; in September he received thirteen. From that point they became a regular occurrence, and the outline of his ministry became increasingly well defined.

The revelations of 1860 confirmed Morris in his initial belief that the Mormon hierarchy had become vitiated and that the whole church was in a state of apostasy through the treachery of one of its members. The Judas, specifically, was Brigham Young's first counselor, George A. Smith. He, in fact, was revealed to Morris as a fallen angel who fell with Lucifer in the first estate. Using satanic guile, he had succeeded in pre­empting Brigham Young as the real leader of the church and from that position was rushing the church headlong to destruction. Among the many wicked deeds Smith had already instigated, according to Morris, was the Mountain Meadow Massacre.5

It was during his sojourn to Slaterville in 1860 that Joseph began to earn a following. Hired as a farm laborer, he asked his employer, a Mr. Jones, “Do you know who I am.” “Yes,” replied Jones, “I do know that you are a prophet of God, for the spirit has told me so.” 6 This was the first expression of testimony Morris had ever received and it must have been immensely gratifying to him. It may have been responsible for the flood of revelations he then began to have. One of these revelations, in September 1860, occurred immediately after the appearance of a comet and explained the significance of this celestial phenomenon in terms of Joseph's own calling:

It is the seventh Star spoken of by John the Revelator, representing the seventh angel that has come forth; and the tail that was attached to it is a representation of the army of heaven that was to follow the seventh angel.

5 Ibid., p. 12, and Mark H. Forscutt Manuscript, Archives Division, Historical Depart­ment, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City (hereinafter cited as LDS Archives). Forscutt was one of Morris's twelve apostles; his handwritten account of the Morrisite incident, penned several years afterward, is detailed and generally judicious.

6 Banks, "A Document History," p. 12. See also H. Orvil Holley, "The History and Effect of Apostasy on a Small Mormon Community" (Master's thesis, Brigham Young University, 1966), pp. 21-28. According to Holley, many Slaterville families were then experimenting with a form of spiritualism and were therefore receptive to a new religious experience.
Behold, I am Jesus Christ, and I testify unto all men that dwell upon the face of the earth that I have sent forth the seventh angel to preside over my Church upon the earth, and it will be woe unto them if they do not humble themselves and obey my gospel, for I will cut them off until there is none left upon the earth to cumber it.\(^7\)

This was the most explicit statement of Joseph's mission yet articulated, and its impact on the Slaterville ward was profound. A congregation began to form around him immediately. Following his exodus from the community that fall—under pressure from the ward bishopric—his entire following of thirty-one persons was excommunicated for apostasy.

Morris left Slaterville carrying two letters which he had written to Brigham Young and which he intended to deliver in person. At Warm Springs, northwest of Ogden, he met John Cook and entered into conversation with him. Cook was sufficiently intrigued with Joseph's message to invite him to his home in South Weber. There he introduced him to his brother, Richard Cook, the ward bishop. Bishop Cook listened to Joseph's preaching and was soon convinced of its truthfulness. The radius of belief spread quickly through the ward. News of a new faith taking root in South Weber was not long in reaching the General Authorities in Salt Lake City, and they responded by notifying Bishop Cook that two apostles, John Taylor and Wilford Woodruff, were being dispatched to South Weber for an inquiry into the state of affairs there.

The meeting was held February 11, 1861. Among the many people who crowded the little adobe schoolhouse that evening, in addition to Cook, Morris, Woodruff, and Taylor, were Lorin Farr, stake president and mayor of Ogden, and James Brown and Abraham Palmer, his counselors in the Ogden stake presidency. The inquiry generally proceeded with little acrimony; when a Mr. Watts shouted that the Morrisites should be “cut off below the chin and laid behind the bushes,” he was rebuked by Apostle Taylor. Bishop Cook, when asked to define his conviction, asserted his belief that Joseph Morris was a prophet and that Brigham Young was not. Nine men and seven women followed with similar testimonies. They, Cook, and Morris were promptly excommunicated for apostasy.\(^8\)

The meeting closed with a vigorous denunciation of Morris by Wilford Woodruff, a denunciation that included a prophecy that Morris's

\(^7\) *The Spirit Prevails*, pp. 18-19.

\(^8\) Forscutt manuscript. Minutes of the meeting are included in "History of Brigham Young," pp. 58-72, manuscript, LDS Archives, and also in Wilford Woodruff Journal, holograph, LDS Archives.
influence would rapidly diminish. Later, in reflecting upon this prophecy, Joseph Morris penned: “Since that time, however, the spirit of the Lord has rested upon the people, and they have come from almost all parts of the Territory to inquire after these strange things that have so mysteriously been brought about.”

That the Morriseite star suddenly began rising to new heights was due in no small measure to the remarkable influence of a frustrated Pleasant Grove farmer, John Banks.

A journeyman stonemason by trade, Banks was one of England’s first converts to Mormonism. Baptized by Parley P. Pratt, he was soon ordained a high priest and set apart as a missionary. He did not labor in that capacity long before being appointed president of the London Conference of the British Mission. Not only was Banks an intelligent man but an inspirational and gifted speaker as well. According to Andrew Jenson, Banks was “one of the ablest and most eloquent” missionaries to serve in the British Mission.

He converted scores of people to Mormonism.

Upon his release from the British Mission, John Banks and his family emigrated to Utah and were part of the original seven families that established Pleasant Grove in September 1850. After building a home and getting his family situated, Banks journeyed to Salt Lake City and met with Brigham Young. His specific purpose was to request appointment as presiding bishop of the church. He left the meeting with the understanding that upon completing a two-year mission to Ohio the office would be his.

Banks soon left for the eastern mission where he labored with much the same success that he had enjoyed in England. Upon completion of the mission he returned to Utah with a new broadcloth Prince Albert suit, a new wagon, two yoke of oxen, and a large stock of household furniture, all of which had been given him by the Saints of Cleveland.

Calling upon Brigham Young to claim the office of presiding bishop, John Banks was chagrined to learn that the office was no longer available. Words were exchanged between these two men. The exchange grew heated and physical jostling ensued. In the melee the church president was severely choked by his larger and stronger antagonist. A few days

---

*Morris to George Leslie, July 9, 1861, reproduced in *The Spirit Prevails*, pp. 670-74.

later Banks was excommunicated for "unchristian-like conduct." A frustrated and despondent man, he returned to Pleasant Grove and began farming, an occupation for which he was ill-fitted by both temperament and experience.\footnote{Karl Banks, "A Brief History of John Banks and the Morrisite Movement," manuscript, pp. 2-3, Utah State Historical Society.}

John Banks became acquainted with Joseph Morris during the latter's stay in nearby American Fork in 1857-58. They came together frequently to discuss their mutual problems with the church hierarchy. Each considered himself a devout Mormon at the time, disillusioned less with the doctrine than with leadership of the church. In 1858 Morris moved to Salt Lake City, and Banks was rebaptized into the church.

It was not until the spring of 1861, shortly after the Slaterville excommunications, that Banks and Morris came together again. The prelude to this reunion was Morris's revelation of September 6, 1860:

Behold! Verily I say unto you, my servant Joseph, that inasmuch as I have chosen you to stand at the head of my Church as the Prophet, Seer, and Revelator of the same, you shall take my servant Brigham to be your first counselor, and place upon him the presidency of my Church; under your direction. . . .

As concerning my servant Heber [C. Kimball], I, the Lord, am not well pleased with him, for he has committed a grievous [sic] sin against me. . . .

I, the Lord, have ordained that another shall act in his place—even my servant John Banks. . . .\footnote{The Spirit Prevails, p. 17.}

Hearing of this revelation sometime later, Banks left his children and adamant wife in Pleasant Grove and joined the excommunicate Morris at South Weber in the spring of 1861.
The Morrisite War 119

MORRIS FOUND HIS CHURCH

The Morris schism was consummated on April 6, 1861—the thirty-first anniversary of the founding of the Mormon church—when Joseph Morris officially organized his church. Like the parent organization, this sect also began with six members. Joseph stood at its head as prophet, seer, and revelator; his first and second counselors were, respectively, Richard Cook and John Banks. A quorum of twelve apostles, which the prophet began naming almost immediately, completed the organizational hierarchy. 13

The dominating feature of Morris’s theology was millennialism. The earth was just one of many millions such worlds in the universe, each presided over by a god. Christ was the god of this earth, and despite opposition from the devil He would soon reign supreme. The Second Coming was imminent. As it occurred, the Morrisites would assume ownership of the homes, meetinghouses, and other property of the Mormons. The righteous Mormons would take their rightful place as servants of the Morrisites; the unrighteous Mormons would be slain by the hosts of heaven.

Other Morrisite tenets rejected polygamy, condemned racial discrimination, opened the priesthood to women, and called for the consecration of all personal property to the Lord with stewardship left to the individual until needed by the group. Morris also held a notion of reincarnation, though he seems never to have clarified its exact implications for his theology.14 Regardless, the growth of the Morrisite church was phenomenal. Within a week of its organization the church claimed fifty-three members; within three months, two hundred members. At the time of the Morrisite War fourteen months later the following approached a thousand, although only about half that number were baptized members. For the Mormons generally, not yet reconciled to the concept of a pluralistic society and greatly relieved at the recent exodus of federal troops from the territory, this was a most unwelcome development. Almost immediately the Morrisite congregation began to be harrassed and victimized by the rowdier element of Mormonism’s rank and file.

Joseph Morris established his following in South Weber, two and a half miles west of the mouth of Weber Canyon. Sitting on the county line, most of the encampment was in Davis County but a portion of

13 Ibid., pp. 79, 672.
14 Ibid., passim.
it extended into Weber County. The site was the original Kingston Fort, established in 1853 when the church authorities issued the order to "fort up." Named after the local bishop, James Kingston, the fort was a ten-acre square with a number of small log cabins built around the perimeter. It was not completely enclosed and when the Saints there evacuated at the approach of Johnston's Army in 1858, a number of gaps still remained between the perimeter cabins. A large tent was set up inside the fort for public meetings, and in 1856 a large adobe schoolhouse was added. During the early phases of the fort's development a bowery was also built—this being just west of the fort in a small grove of trees. On both the north and the south the fort was rimmed by low-rising hills.

The original Kingston settlement was small, consisting of twenty-five families in late 1854. The evacuation of 1858 seriously retarded the community's prosperity, and when Joseph Morris made his appearance there in 1860 he was struck by the fact that the people were as destitute of clothing and provisions as he. Most of these settlers later joined the Morrisite congregation as it burgeoned in 1861 and 1862, and even those that did not join generally remained in the community.

As Morrisite converts poured into Kingston Fort they were forced to make temporary quarters in tents, wagon boxes, and jerry-built hovels until adequate permanent dwellings could be constructed. An energetic building program did begin almost immediately, with the building materials being primarily willows and dirt. In most cases the new dwellings consisted of an outer and inner wall of woven willow reeds; secured to posts in each of the four corners, the reed walls had a space of nearly a foot between them which was then filled with loose dirt for strength and insulation. Some of the homes had walls made of only one row of woven willows, plastered on both sides with mud. The roofs in either case were made of boughs set on a supporting timber frame and covered with earth. The floors were also earthen. Provisions were made for small windows and doors.

In the spring of 1862, when attack from his enemies seemed imminent, Morris directed his following to fill gaps between the buildings with a heavy wall, thereby enclosing the community entirely. The wall was to be six feet high and eighteen inches thick, again dirt supported by two rows of woven willow forms. Apparently this work was not completed by the time of the ultimate confrontation.

Difficulties between the Morrisites and their Mormon neighbors began immediately after the establishment of the congregation at Kings-
William Kendall, bearded man holding child, was among the first to join Morris's church and was one of its more affluent members. The photograph was taken in 1869 at Kendall's residence, formerly part of the Morrisite encampment, in Uintah, south Weber County. Courtesy of Parley P. Kendall.

The instances seldom involved gunplay and resulted in no deaths or serious injuries. Their nature, rather, was one of tedious harassment wherein the Morrisites were subjected to obscene threats, physical humiliation, disruption of their religious services, and pilfering of their livestock by a small group of rowdy neighbors. As a result of these forays the Morrisites became increasingly defensive and grew steadily more disenchanted with established agencies of civil government.12

Typical of the situation was the instance in the summer of 1861 when several horses were stolen from the Kingston encampment. Scouting parties soon discovered them in the custody of familiar antagonists some two miles from the camp. When voices were raised in favor of forming a posse to recover the stock, Morris himself demurred. It had just been revealed to him, he advised the agitated men, that such precipitous action would bring an unfortunate collision with the authorities.13 Shortly
afterward the thieves rode into Kingston Fort on the stolen animals, flourished their revolvers, and sought to provoke a fight. The Morrisites did not react, instead facing their tormentors with silence. But as these incidents became increasingly frequent, the Morrisites placed their stock under continuous armed guard and posted sentries around the camp each night. These precautions were well taken. Not long afterward, two would-be rustlers—later identified as escaped convict Delos Johnson and a local troublemaker named Watts—were repelled by the guards.

Less serious, but deeply annoying to the Morrisites, were the numerous instances of rowdyism which their detractors staged in their midst. These disturbances took various forms, sometimes consisting of nothing more than visitors attending the Morrisite meetings with their guns and knives in plain view. At other times the rowdies would ride into camp and announce their intent to disrupt or destroy the Morrisites' food supply, forcing them into starvation or subsistence living on "boiled wheat." Still other incidents involved obscene language and physical scuffles. In November 1861 a half-dozen well-armed young toughs burst into the adobe schoolhouse and began to insult and jostle Alonzo Brown and his wife, who were living there temporarily, and their guest, a Mrs. Moss. After several long minutes of uncouth merriment, the intruders left, snatching Brown's hat on their way out. Upon exiting the schoolhouse they were confronted by a group of residents who had come to investigate the disturbance. Overpowering the rowdies through sheer force of number, the group retrieved the hat and hastened the departure of their unwelcome visitors.17

The hat incident did not end in the schoolyard. On December 8, 1861, two of the original group of intruders, Amos Hawkes and George T. Peay, swore out a complaint against Alonzo Brown, James Cook, Peter I. Moss, and eight other Morrisites involved in the fray. Davis County sheriff Lot Smith thereupon issued a warrant "for the apprehension of A. Brown and others." Peter I. Moss was the only one taken into custody. Tried in March 1862, he was convicted of assault and sentenced to imprisonment at hard labor for forty days and fined fifty dollars plus court costs.18 The verdict was a momentous one. It served to strengthen the growing suspicion among the Utah public that the Morrisites were a band of religious fanatics who drew no distinction between right and wrong and who fully deserved the name, suggested by the Deseret Even-

17 Forscutt Manuscript, p. 39.
18 Davis County, Probate Court Records, Davis County Courthouse, Farmington, Utah.
ing News, of “the Davis County bandits.” Conversely, the judgment confirmed the Morrisites in their fear that they would find no justice in court. From then on, they would accept no more warrants, writs, or other legal orders from civil authorities. When, in April 1862, Weber County deputy sheriff William Brown attempted to serve an execution against John Banks, he was intercepted by two guards at the camp entrance and escorted to Banks who immediately ordered, “take him out.” Brown’s simple summation, “I went home unsuccessful,” was studiously modest. The last word was far from being written.

ARMED CONFRONTATION

Conflict with intolerant neighbors was only part of Joseph Morris’s difficulties. Equally troublesome was the problem of restlessness and dissension within his own ranks. Several men in the organizational hierarchy, including John Banks and Richard Cook, became increasingly insistent about advancing their own views on matters of policy and administration. In turn, Morris’s revelations began reflecting increasingly dire predictions of disaster if his counsel were not obeyed explicitly. Following each such revelation the prophet’s lieutenants were quieted for a time, but the problem of restless ambition among them continued to simmer just below the surface.

To add to his other worries, Morris again experienced connubial turbulence within his household. In August 1861 he had remarried, this time to the Danish convert Mary Olsen, and signs of discord were visible from the beginning. To deal with this embarrassing situation he employed the same tactic as that used with his hierarchy, divine injunction. According to one of his revelations of September 1861:

You wish to know my will concerning your companion. You are in trouble concerning her. What can I do with her, if she will not stand by you and take your counsel? If she fights against you, she fights against me. If she refuses to hearken to you and obey you, she has no part with me, for I shall cast her off.19

Although Morris managed a tenuous grip on the allegiance of his wife and his first echelon subordinates, instances of apostasy began to occur within the congregation. The general cause seems to have been disillusionment with Morris’s prescience as a seer. Several times his congregation had witnessed him designate a certain day for the Second

19 The Spirit Prevails, p. 149.
Coming, only to see that day come and go uneventfully. Each time this happened a number of people gathered their belongings and quietly left the congregation.

As the pace of apostasy quickened, however, more and more questions arose over the matter of property entitlement. Typically, those who stayed felt that those who left were taking better quality stock than they had originally consecrated to the community. Accordingly, the custodians of the herd, under Morris's counsel, became increasingly penurious, and friction began to characterize these reckonings. When, in early 1862, William Jones, John Jensen, and Louis C. Gurtson left the community with bitter feelings of having been cheated on their property settlement, they vowed revenge. Not long afterward they hijacked a wagonload of wheat being transported from Kingston Fort to Kaysville for milling. The Morrisites responded by dispatching a group of men, under the direction of Peter Klemgard, to apprehend the men and recover the wheat. This done, the group returned to the encampment and confined the three men in a cabin.

In a daring escape attempt, Gurtson managed to gain his freedom, but Jones and Jensen were less successful and remained in custody. Their wives, learning of the detention, appealed to the legal authorities for assistance. On May 24, 1862, Deputy United States Marshal Judson Stoddard obtained a writ of habeas corpus from Territorial Chief Justice John J. Kinney. He proceeded to Kingston Fort where he was allowed to read the writ to Morris, Banks, and Klemgard. These men were not willing to receive the document, however, and let it fall to the ground in their midst. Another writ was similarly dishonored three weeks later. With that, Chief Justice Kinney asked the acting territorial governor, Frank Fuller, to activate the territorial militia as a posse comitatus “for the arrest of the offenders.” Fuller complied, and on June 12 an armed posse of five hundred men departed Salt Lake City for South Weber.

At the head of the posse rode Robert T. Burton. Although he held the rank of colonel in the territorial militia, it was not in that capacity that he directed the posse; rather, he rode as deputy territorial marshal. Territorial Marshal Henry W. Lawrence expressed opposition to such an armed confrontation with the Morrisites and left the territory rather

---

20 Forscutt Manuscript, p. 46. William Jones was the same who had recognized Morris as a prophet at Slaterville in 1860.

than be a part of it. Responsibility then devolved to his deputies, Burton and Theodore McKean.

No stranger to military forays, Burton noted in his journal: "The proper arrangements having been made, I left Salt Lake with an ample force on the 12th of June." His artillerymen and infantrymen were augmented by numerous Davis County volunteers as the force moved northward toward South Weber. Arriving there on the morning of June 13, Burton had approximately a thousand armed men at his command. He deployed them generally on the high ground overlooking the encampment on the southwest, also positioning contingents to flats on the east and west. With militiamen from Ogden to the north, Kingston Fort was surrounded. Satisfied that this show of force would awe Morris into submission, Burton then dispatched a proclamation to the encampment demanding surrender within thirty minutes.

Immediately upon receiving the proclamation, Joseph Morris retired to privacy and inquired of the Lord as to the proper course of action. He emerged with another revelation, this one similar to a number of previous ones, promising absolute safety to his people and destruction of their enemies. "The enemies shall go so far, and then I will stop them—they have almost gone far enough—I will stop them at the right time," Morris was assured.

Morris and his counselors then decided to assemble their congregation and read them the revelation and the surrender proclamation. Accordingly, the bugle was sounded and the Morrisites hurried from their homes to the bowery. The meeting was opened with a brief prayer. John Parsons, who had a voice remarkably suited for the occasion, read the revelation. As he finished, Richard Cook stood and began expounding on the significance of the revelation. His remarks were suddenly interrupted by the thunder of cannon fire from the distant hillside and then screams and bedlam within the bowery as the ball crashed into the congregation, just a few feet from where Cook stood, killing two women and shattering the lower jaw of a third. Perceiving what had happened, Cook shouted above the din and confusion for the people to return to their homes and use every possible means to defend themselves. Within a few short minutes the bowery was virtually empty, its silence broken only by the voices and sobs of those evacuating the dead and wounded.

23 Robert T. Burton Journal, holograph, LDS Archives.
23 The Spirit Prevails, p. 627.
24 Forscutt Manuscript.
The Morrisites were not well armed; only a few of the men owned rifles and shotguns. Within their fragile cabins they clutched these short-range weapons desperately and waited in fear throughout the rest of the day as intermittent cannon fire shook the area around them. Rain began falling that afternoon and continued throughout the night and the next day, heightening the mood of desperation among the Morrisites as they awaited deliverance with the Second Coming.

The third day of the siege, Sunday, June 15, broke bright and clear. It was also quiet, the militia having expended its cannon ball the previous day. If ever the moment seemed right to the beleaguered Morrisites for the Second Coming, it must have been that peaceful Sabbath morning. But as the morning hours passed and the sun moved into the afternoon sky, the quiet of the day was broken by the sound of rifle fire and shouts. Streaming toward the encampment was a wagon chassis, covered by brush and boards, carrying a half-dozen riflemen and being pushed by a number of foot soldiers. This had the desired effect. The Morrisites, dispirited by the long siege, raised the white flag of surrender. At that sign, Burton rode forward at the head of a group of men and entered the encampment.

Typical of such events, details of the skirmish that followed are muddled. Only a few salient points are known with some certainty. Burton commanded Morris to surrender to his custody, Morris refused,
and gunplay ensued, leaving Joseph Morris and two women dead and John Banks mortally wounded. Confusion then reigned for several long minutes as the panicky crowd dashed for cover amid the screams of women and children. Only after bringing forward a cannon was Burton able to restore order. He then took ninety men prisoner, fed them and let them rest that night, and then started the two-day march back to Salt Lake City the next morning.

Months later, in March 1863, seven of the prisoners would be convicted in Judge Kinney’s court of second degree murder, in conjunction with the death of two posse members, and sentenced to prison terms ranging from five to fifteen years. Sixty-six others would be tried for resisting arrest and fined $100 each. Gov. Stephen S. Harding, sensing an injustice, would grant them all pardon three days after the conviction and drive another wedge in the widening gulf between him and the Mormon community. But for Joseph Morris and John Banks there would be no more legal technicalities. Their bodies were loaded on a wagon and dispatched to Salt Lake City for a brief public viewing and quiet burial.

IN RETROSPECT

Just as controversy surrounded Joseph Morris during his lifetime, so it has continued these many years after his death. Many people, then and later, viewed him as a true prophet of the Lord, and several sects in various places have worshiped in his name through the years. But historian Orson Whitney showed little liking or sympathy for Morris, viewing him and his followers as militant and lawless. Richard W. Young held similar views, as did B.H. Roberts, who added the charge of insanity to Morris. Stenhouse, on the other hand, saw Morris as a rather pitiable character driven to distraction by an unfeeling Mormon hierarchy. Modern scholarship, though limited in volume, tends toward a militant posture for Morris and suggests that bloodshed was made inevitable by his intransigence.

---

25 In a letter to J. H. Beadle, Harding explained the tragedy as “the old story over again: ’There is not room in the Roman Empire for two Caesars.’” This may have his rationale in granting the pardons. See J. H. Beadle, Brigham’s Destroying Angel . . . Bill Hickman (New York, 1872), p. 212.

Exactly what happened as Burton entered Kingston Fort that fateful day in 1862 may never be known—even though the incident was aired twice in court and has been scrutinized in various historical accounts. It is unfortunate that Mark H. Forscutt, Morris’s scribe, was not present to observe the event. His Morristite experience, written sometime later, is a relatively dispassionate and credible record heretofore neglected in historical inquiry. But sensing the hopelessness of the Morristite situation during the second day of the siege, he slipped quietly from the encampment that night.

The classic first-hand account of the surrender scene is that of Alexander Dow. His deposition to Associate Justice Charles B. Waite on April 18, 1863, is quoted as follows:

In the spring of 1861, I joined the Morristites, and was present when Joseph Morris was killed. The Morristites had surrendered, a white flag was flying, and the arms were all grounded and guarded by a large number of the posse.

Robert T. Burton and Judson L. Stoddard rode in among the Morristites. Burton was much excited. He said, “Where is the man? I don’t know him.” Stoddard replied, “That’s him,” pointing to Morris. Burton rode his horse upon Morris, and commanded him to give himself up, in the name of the Lord. Morris replied “No, never, never!” Morris said he wanted to speak to the people. Burton said, “Be d———d quick about it.” Morris said, “Brethren, I’ve taught you true principles.” He had scarcely got the words out of his mouth before Burton fired his revolver. The ball passed in his neck or shoulder. Burton exclaimed: “There’s your prophet.” He fired again, saying: “What do you think of your prophet now?”

Burton then turned suddenly and shot Banks, who was standing five or six paces distant. Banks fell. Mrs. Bowman, wife of James Bowman, came running up crying, “Oh! You blood-thirsty wretch.” Burton said, “No one shall tell me that and live,” and shot her dead. A Danish woman then came running up to Morris, crying, and Burton shot her dead also. Burton could easily have taken Morris and Banks prisoners, if he had tried. I was standing but a few feet from Burton all this time.27

On the basis of this statement, Burton was indicted in 1870 for the murder of Bella Bowman. Owing to a number of legal technicalities, however, the trial was not held until 1879, nearly seventeen years after the event. It lasted two weeks. The jury, composed of a like number of Mormons and non-Mormons, deliberated two days and returned a verdict of not guilty.

Burton's account of the event, presented at the trial, differed from Dow's in a number of important particulars. He testified that upon entering the encampment he positioned himself and his small contingent of men between the congregation of Morrisites and their stacked arms. He then announced his intention of taking into custody all those who had borne arms in resistance to his authority. Upon request that Morris be allowed to speak, he assented. With that, Morris stepped forward and called his followers to arms. The crowd immediately charged toward their weapons. Burton gave the command to halt, then fired his revolver twice at Morris. Additional posse members rushed in from all directions and quickly established control. "I did not see any women when I fired at Morris, and shot only at him," Burton testified. "No woman addressed me, nor did I see one. Every shot I fired was aimed at Mr. Morris." ²⁸

Even though details of the Morrisite tragedy will probably always be in controversy, a number of generalizations are nevertheless possible. They should provide some illumination of this complex and little-understood incident in Utah history.

Whatever else may be said about Robert T. Burton, it seems certain at this distance that he was guilty of overreaction. At the time of his march upon Kingston Fort, the Morrisites were destitute and demoralized. Defections were becoming increasingly common and the leadership echelon was feeling the stress of dissension. Under these circumstances it is altogether conceivable that the siege would have been successful with-

²⁸ Whitney, History of Utah, 3:42.
out cannon fire. Furthermore, the one or two initial shots fired from the militia cannon and falling on the camp were not interpreted by the Morrisites as a warning. At that point, of course, the Morrisites felt they had to resist by force of arms. Regardless, a possibility exists—and was given implicit voice in Burton's testimony—that the cannon ball which ricocheted into the bowery was actually a warning shot.

Robert T. Burton was a man accustomed to thinking in terms of military solutions. He had been a member of the Nauvoo Legion since 1844 and had participated in skirmishes during Nauvoo's turbulent last months. Within his first three years in Salt Lake Valley he took part in six campaigns against Indians and quickly distinguished himself as being aggressive in battle. Promoted to major in 1855 and to colonel in 1857, he was also one of the principals in the guerrilla activity against Johnston's Army. Early in May 1862 he led a contingent of militiamen on another foray against the Indians, this time proceeding as far east as the Green River in Wyoming.

Joseph Morris, on the other hand, was not a militant man. He suffered abuse without complaint and continually counseled his congregation to do the same. Members of his congregation did scuffle with rowdy neighbors on occasion, but their actions were defensive only and followed serious provocation. Even the apprehension and detention of Gurton, Jones, and Jensen was of that nature. Morris did not form his army until May 16, 1862, just one month before the siege, and its ranks never exceeded one hundred fifty poorly armed men. It is immediately obvious from a perusal of Joseph Morris's many revelations that he saw his war as being fought by the Lord and the hosts of heaven. Even during the last few days at Kingston Fort he was assured by revelation that the Lord expected the Morrisite congregation to present only a show of resistance; when their ammunition was gone He would come to their rescue.29

Burton, of course, did not know these things, but the essential point is that he seemed not to care. Deeply committed to a religious point of view, his zeal having been tempered in the fires of persecution, he had strong notions about who were friends, who were enemies, and how each should be treated.

29 Eli Smith claimed in a letter to Brigham Young that on January 24, 1862, he heard John Banks publicly read a revelation from Joseph Morris directing that Morrisite apostates be killed. But such a position was clearly inconsistent with Morris's published revelations as well as his subsequent actions. Other reports from Smith to Young are marked by serious errors and exaggerations, suggesting that he simply was not a credible source. See Brigham Young Papers, file 16-17, LDS Archives.
To what extent Burton’s actions were motivated by sectarian commitment is difficult to determine exactly, but it may be presumed substantial. Mormon authorities took a hard line toward apostate groups at that time, and Burton was close to Brigham Young and the heartbeat of Mormon orthodoxy. Young himself, traditionally uncharitable toward his enemies, publicly equated the Morrisites with the devil, directed that they be ostracized, and forbade their reentry into Mormonism. “Let them wait a thousand years,” he enjoined the Saints from the pulpit of the Salt Lake bowery shortly after the siege.30

One team of scholars has argued with persuasive effect that Brigham Young figured prominently in the decision to send a military expedition against the Morrisites,31 but the evidence remains circumstantial. It seems beyond dispute, however, that Young chafed at the spectacular success enjoyed initially by Joseph Morris. Almost all of the thousand followers, of course, came from Mormonism’s ranks. Yet, in the ultimate analysis, the number of Morrisites is less significant than their ethnic background. Most of them were Scandinavians,32 especially Danes, generally unschooled in the English language, unfamiliar with American customs and legal procedures, and disenchanted with Mormon orthodoxy.

The source of disillusionment among these Danish converts was not with religious dogma—though many of them seem to have been poorly prepared for the shock of polygamy—as much as with the practical matter of how one wore the mantle of prophet. Unlike his predecessor, Joseph Smith, who founded Mormonism upon a series of revelations, Brigham Young was not a visionary man. He did sometimes find divine messages in dreams, but he did not profess to walk and talk with heavenly hosts or to proclaim direct revelation. Was this a proper way for a prophet of God to act? Particularly one who claimed to be the spiritual heir of Joseph Smith? Joseph Morris, on the other hand, projected great confidence in his own ability to converse directly with God. “I am Jesus Christ. Even so, Amen and Amen,” was asserted at the conclusion of each missive. These words were a balm to many troubled souls and explain why Morris was able to command such powerful allegiance from so many people under such desperate circumstances.

30 Charles L. Walker Diary, pp. 377–78, LDS Archives. After the 1863 trial and pardon, the Morrisites scattered, mainly in the western states. At least two returned to England. A few “lost themselves” among the Mormons in Davis and Salt Lake counties. Only one lived on in South Weber.
31 Anderson and Halford, “The Mormons and the Morrisite War.”
32 Lars Christian Christensen, “A Short Sketch of My Life,” p. 11, manuscript, LDS Archives.
The only Morrisite building still standing in south Weber County near site of old Kingston Fort. Courtesy of May Anderson.

The makeup of the Morrisite congregation also explains why this group has been burdened with the historical judgment of lawlessness. They simply did not understand that the army that marched upon them, demanded unconditional surrender, and opened fire with cannon was a federal posse. Rather, they saw it as a force of Mormons carrying the offensive in a religious war. Time and time again their prophet had told them it would be this way. This, surely, was Armageddon, the final battle between the forces of good and evil. The Lord had commanded them, through his prophet, to do battle for a time. Then He would come. Writs of habeas corpus, writs of attachments, warrants for arrests, federal judges, federal marshals—these abstractions had neither meaning nor relevance to people charged with the task of ushering in the Second Coming.

That Judge Kinney, Acting Governor Fuller, Marshal Burton and the other principals did not understand this about the Morrisites is the tragedy of the event. More than a dozen people died needlessly, and scores of others were uprooted and scarred as a result of their precipitous action. Some of these scars are still evident today among third- and fourth-generation descendants. They are visible reminders of a national era, now thankfully past, when groups were quick to resort to force of arms in the ongoing clash of ideas and wills.
Archaeological and Cryptological Analyses of the Manti Inscriptions

BY WILLIAM JAMES ADAMS, JR., AND RAY T. MATHENY

Over the years stone tablets and metal plates bearing inscriptions have been found in Utah. Additionally, Indian petroglyphs have been found throughout the state. These petroglyphs are generally accepted as authentic products of Indian cultures and have no relation to inscriptions reported on rocks near Fillmore, Millard County, and near Cedar City, Iron County. Unfortunately, these latter so-called inscriptions have never been carefully studied, although the authors hope to eventually make a thorough investigation of them. The inscriptions that are the concern of this paper have appeared over the past decade in the area of Manti, Sanpete County. Each of these sets of inscriptions was subjected to scrutiny to determine authenticity. It is the purpose of this paper to describe the archaeological evidence and to provide cryptological analyses and other evaluations of these Manti inscriptions.

When inscriptions are found the question always arises of whether they are real or fraudulent. When such materials are evaluated as frauds, our psychologically and legally oriented society wonders why a person would perpetrate an archaeological fraud and what the legal implications are for the forger. A good example of psychological motivation comes from 1860 when several inscribed stones were found near Newark, Licking County, Ohio. One inscription, called the Newark Key Stone, contained biblical Hebrew inscriptions in the modern Hebrew alphabet. The stone was found by a man who lived a rather lonely life. When he died a Hebrew Bible was found among his possessions, with the passages inscribed on the Key Stone being marked in this Bible. At that time
Masonry was popular in Ohio, and the Key Stone discovery seemed to be of great significance to Masons. There was no attempt made to sell the inscription, but by perpetrating the fraud this lonely man gained attention and popularity. Perhaps this same motive might serve for perpetrating an archaeological fraud in Utah. A find of seemingly ancient inscriptions in Utah could have great significance to members of the Mormon church, and the discoverer might receive much attention.

With respect to the legal implications of archaeological fraud, there seem to be no guidelines in law unless the forged artifact is sold for money or shipped or mailed interstate as an authentic find. In either case the forger could be charged with a felony that could result in imprisonment. An example of a fraudulent sale occurred in France during the 1850s when Vrain Lucas sold letters he declared were written by Moliere, Rabelais, Racine, and others. When the fraud was discovered, Lucas was imprisoned. Often, however, the perpetrator is not prosecuted, probably because the victims feel that "the joke is on them." An example of this is the Cardiff Giant. In 1869 George Hull deposited a stone giant near Cardiff, New York, where men digging a well would find it. The crew, unaware of the fraud, was stunned by the discovery. Hull set up a tent and sold tickets to people to view the petrified evidence of the biblical passage: "There were giants in the earth. . . ." (Genesis 6:4). Hull then moved around the eastern United States with the giant, tent, and ticket booth, collecting quite a sum of money. When ticket sales dropped off, he jokingly told how he had hired a stonecutter in Chicago to carve the statue for him. Although money was collected under false pretenses, Hull was never charged or tried; as a matter of fact, he went on to perpetrate a second archaeological fraud in Colorado. It would appear that since the Manti inscriptions have not been sold for money nor shipped out of Utah, there is little precedent for legal action should they prove hoaxes.

The first Manti inscriptions came to light in November 1963. This find consisted of eleven fragments varying in length from two to twelve inches. Five of the fragments fit together making eight complete tablets, each inscribed on one face. They were made from the limestone common

2 For the events see *Scoundrels and Scalawags* (Pleasantville, N.Y.: Reader's Digest Association, 1968), pp. 288-99 and 507-15. For the legalities the authors are indebted to Joseph Anderson, an attorney with the United States District Court at Elkins, W.V.
3 George Tripp, "Manti Mystery," *Utah Archaeology* 9, no. 4, pp. 1, 2.
to the Manti area. The tablets were brought to Mrs. Wallace Wintch of Manti by Carl Paulson and John Earl Brewer, both of Sanpete County. Mrs. Wintch then gave them to Dr. Jesse D. Jennings, professor of anthropology at the University of Utah. These tablets, now located at the Utah Museum of Natural History, will be referred to as the “U of U tablets.”

The second set of inscriptions turned up in January 1970. This find consisted of four tablets varying in length from six to nine inches. Like the first set they were inscribed on one side of limestone material common to the Manti area. Two of these tablets were coated with pine pitch. The tablets were given to Dr. Clyde L. Pritchett, Brigham Young University, Department of Zoology, by John Earl Brewer of Manti. Dr. Pritchett then gave them to Dr. Ray T. Matheny of the BYU Department of Anthropology and Archaeology. This second set of inscriptions will be referred to as the “BYU tablets.”

The third set of inscriptions was brought to Dr. Paul R. Cheesman of the BYU College of Religion by Mr. Brewer in November 1972. This set consisted of a lead box approximately four and one-half inches square by one inch deep, with the lead not being more than one-eighth inch thick. Fitted into this box were seven lead plates each inscribed on one face. This third set of inscriptions will be referred to as the “lead plates.”

ARCHAEOLOGICAL ANALYSIS

The first step in the archaeological analysis of each of these sets of inscriptions was to make a field examination of the sites where they were reported to have been found. The purported site of the U of U tablets was investigated by Dr. Jennings. The site is approximately two miles due west of Manti under a rock overhang. The investigator looked for broken pottery, stone implements, and related artifacts in the immediate vicinity of the rock overhang, but nothing was found.

The site where the BYU tablets were reportedly found is a few miles northwest of Manti along the west bank of the San Pitch River. This site was examined by Dr. Pritchett, Dr. Dale L. Berge, James Walker, and Dr. Matheny, all of BYU. Mr. Brewer claimed that he found them at waist depth in the ground. Examination of the exact place from which the tablets were taken showed a shallow depression in the surface of the ground. Careful excavation eighteen inches into the soil revealed a completely undisturbed gravel deposit underlying a few inches of top-

*This observation was made by Dr. William K. Hamblin of the Department of Geology, Brigham Young University.*
soil. Since there had not been any excavating done at this spot, there was no need to probe further. Clearly, no one had dug up tablets or anything else here in the undisturbed Pleistocene gravels. No artifacts were found in the immediate vicinity.

The site of the lead plates was examined by Dr. Cheesman and William J. Adams, both of BYU. It lies about a mile due west of Manti on a hillside. Mr. Brewer claimed that he found these plates a few feet in the ground. Here an archaeological context was found. The hill itself appears to be more man-made than geologically formed. Furthermore, a broken Fremont arrowhead and chippings were found about twenty feet from the site of the lead plate find.

The next step in the archaeological analysis was to subject each of these inscriptions to laboratory examination. A low-power binocular microscopic examination showed that a sharp tool had been used to gouge the inscriptions in all the stone tablets. The lead plates were gouged with single strokes. No metal particles were found in the gouges of the BYU tablets, indicating that an extremely hard metal tool such as a stainless steel dental pick was used. The U of U tablets, on the other hand, contained metal particles in the inscribed grooves, suggesting that a soft steel tool such as a nail or pocket knife had been used to inscribe the stone.
The grooves on all of the tablets and plates were sharp and clear, suggesting that they had been recently gouged. Ancient inscriptions such as the cuneiform of Mesopotamia (made on fired clay tablets) were sharp when first inscribed, but the past two to four thousand years have smoothed down the original sharp edges of the inscribed gouges.

Two of the BYU tablets were partially coated with pine pitch. The pitch was thick and did not seep into any of the inscription marks. White bleached cotton fibers were found impressed into the pine pitch. The cotton fibers appeared to be quite fresh. The pitch was hard, brittle, and honey colored; it had not darkened nor cracked from age, nor did it show evidence of exposure to moisture and soil for a long period of time. The pitch was easily dissolved by soaking in zylol for a few hours. The fast action of the zylol further suggested recent treatment of the tablets rather than a long-term interment in the soil.

Other laboratory tests could have been performed, such as carbon-dating the pitch and an alloy analysis of the lead plates. But with no archaeological context for the two sets of stone tablets and an unattested context for the lead plates, and with metal particles in the U of U tablets and other facts pointing to the newness of the inscribed gouges, the archaeological evidence alone is sufficient to consider these three sets of inscriptions as having been fraudulently manufactured.

The inscriptions found on the tablets have their own story to tell.
Cryptanalysis

After Dr. Jennings's field survey revealed no archaeological context for the U of U tablets, he made molds to send to the Smithsonian Institution in Washington, D.C., and to other agencies in the hope that they could crypt the inscriptions. Unfortunately, in each case he received no reply. Not until the authors became interested in the tablets in fall 1972 did this decade of seeking a cryptological evaluation bear fruit.

Following the archaeological suggestion of fraud, the next step was to search for authentic inscriptions from which the forger could have made copies.\(^5\) When compared with the world's writing systems, the Manti inscriptions showed similarities to a sign or two but never an exact likeness. The Manti inscriptions were also compared with such American inscriptions as the Davenport stone and the Kinderhook plates, but again no direct correlation was found.\(^6\) It was therefore concluded that the Manti tablets and plates contain inscriptions unique in and of themselves.

With this development, the next step was that of decipherment. Here the research team followed the techniques used for past decipherments—such as those used by Champollion in deciphering Egyptian, by Grotefend and Rawlinson in deciphering Akkadian, and by Ventris in the decipherment of Cretan Linear B.\(^7\)

The first task was to determine the direction of writing. With English the margin where one begins to read is straight, whereas the other margin is often uneven. This is the case with each of the Manti tablets and plates. Thus, the investigating team concluded that the inscriptions were written from left to right as in English. The photographs also reveal that the bottom lines fall short of the right margin. This suggests that these represent the end of the text, again what one sees in English.

With the direction of writing determined, the next step was to prepare frequency sign lists. For this purpose the BYU tablets and the lead plates fall into one problem group and the U of U tablets make up a second problem group. The BYU tablets and the lead plates each have a list of nearly two hundred signs, whereas the U of U tablets contain only thirty signs. This suggests that the BYU tablets and lead plates are

---


6 Glade L. Burgon, "An Analysis of Purported Ancient Linear Inscriptions" (Ph.D. diss., Brigham Young University, 1972), has published these inscriptions and prepared sign lists of each.

7 These procedures and past decipherments are well outlined in Johannes Friedrich, Extinct Languages (New York: Philosophical Library, 1951).
The Manti Inscriptions syllabic (the signs represent syllables rather than letters) and that the script of the U of U tablets is alphabetic.

The next step was to note the groupings in which the individual signs cluster. For example, in a page of English the signs t, h, e and a, n, d often recur as the clusters “the” and “and.” Such clusterings have been one of the major keys to past decipherments. (For example, in other well-known decipherings Champollion noted recurring clusters that he assumed were names; Rawlinson noted long recurring clusters that he assumed meant “name, king of kings, lord of lords, king of the whole earth”; and Ventris noted clusters of signs at the end of words in lists that he assumed were Greek case endings.) In the BYU tablets and in the lead plates, only two or three groups recurred one or two times each. As noted, authentic scripts have frequently recurring clusters of signs. This is even true of authentic scripts so far undeciphered, such as Cretan Linear A. But in the BYU tablets and the lead plates, the research team found so very few clusterings that from a language point of view they were forced to conclude that instead of a meaningful script, the work was the haphazard and meaningless scratchings of a forger.

As mentioned above, the U of U tablets contain some thirty signs that can be considered as letters of an alphabet. Since the alphabet on the U of U tablets is unique and since the other inscriptions proved fraudulent, the researchers assumed that the inscriber was writing a language such as English and substituting new signs for Roman letters.

The first step in crypting such a text is to count the frequency of each sign. In English the five most common letters (e, t, a, o, n) occur nearly 50 percent of the time. The nine most frequent letters (e, t, a, o, n, i, s, r, h) occupy about 70 percent of a text. In the U of U tablets the four most frequent signs occurred nearly 50 percent of the time. These statistics suggest, then, an English cryptogram wherein the Roman letters have been replaced by new signs.

The second step, again, was to note the frequency of clustering. In English the most frequent digrams (clusters of two letters) are th, he, an, and in; the most frequent trigrams (clusters of three letters) are the, and, tha, and ent. This is where the analysis began to diverge from the English pattern. The above digrams occur from 3 to 8 percent of the time in an English text, but in the U of U tablets they occurred only 1 percent of the time.

Helen Fouche Gaines, Elementary Cryptanalysis (Boston: American Photographic Publishing Co., 1939). Especially helpful are the frequency tables in the appendix, pp. 218-27.
The third step in alphabetic cryptanalysis is to assume that the nine most frequent signs could be one of the letters, e, t, a, o, n, i, s, r, h. Again the analysis showed a divergence from English. Some of the signs could be read as at, the, is, but when these same signs recurred in different combinations, the new combinations were totally meaningless.

Shortly after these conclusions were reached, Mrs. Wallace Wintch of Manti invited the research team to lunch at her home. Her late husband had raised cattle, and in respect for his occupation the napkins used with the lunch pictured all of the registered cattle brands for the state of Utah. When the cryptologist, William J. Adams, opened the napkin he was dumbfounded; there before his eyes were some of the signs he had so carefully copied from the Manti inscriptions. Further investigation revealed that some 15 to 20 percent of the signs found in the inscriptions are brands used by central Utah cattle raisers. For example, in the third line of the U of U tablet (see photograph) the fourth, sixth, tenth, sixteenth, and twenty-fourth signs are Utah cattle brands.

The decipherment of an unknown script is always a new and real challenge. The first step is to determine whether the scripts are similar to any other known script. The research in this area revealed that the Manti inscriptions were unique except for the fact later discovered that nearly one-fifth of the signs were inspired by registered Utah cattle brands. The next step was to determine the direction of writing which in this case was the same as English. The third step was to make a complete list of the signs found and to note which signs cluster together. Clustering is a phenomenon seen in all authentic inscriptions and has been one of the major keys to past decipherments. But in the BYU tablets and the lead plates only two or three clusters occurred, leading to the conclusion that these inscriptions were haphazard and meaningless. On the U of U tablets, clusters of signs do occur, with the five and nine most frequent signs occurring 50 and 70 percent of the time respectively. These percentages suggest that the U of U tablets contain an English text with the Roman alphabetic signs being replaced by other signs. However, the clusters of two and three signs were of lower frequency than would be expected. Finally, when all possibilities were applied to the nine most frequent signs in the text, no intelligible meaning could be extracted. Again, in cryptanalysis as in archaeological analysis, one comes to the conclusion that the U of U tablets, like the BYU tablets and the lead plates, are the meaningless work of a forger.
The history of the Catholic church in modern-day Utah can be traced to June 4, 1866, when the first liturgical services were conducted at Independence Hall by the Reverend Edward Kelly, a priest attached to the Vicariate Apostolic of Marysville. Two years later, on March 3,
1868, Pope Pius IX erected the Vicariate Apostolic of Colorado and Utah and, on the following August 16, Father James P. Macheboeuf became ordinary of the newly-created ecclesial jurisdiction.

Shortly after his episcopal ordination, Bishop Macheboeuf visited Salt Lake City, where he was cordially received by Mormon officials. The prelate asked Father James V. Foley to assume charge of the city’s small Catholic population, but the latter’s tenure lasted only a few months.

When the vicariate was divided, in 1871, the area comprising Utah reverted to the Metropolitan Province of San Francisco. Archbishop Joseph Sadoc Alemany named Father Patrick Walsh to the Salt Lake pastorate, and it was he who built the original Church of Saint Mary Magdalene.

On August 14, 1873, the archbishop entrusted the eighty-five thousand square mile Salt Lake parish to Father Lawrence Scanlan (1843–1915), who was to become the anchor-chain of Catholicism in Utah. To his dismay, the Irish-born pastor found that almost a century after Fray Francisco Atanasio Domínguez and Fray Silvestre Vélez de Escalante had led the first white men through the mountains and valleys of Utah, there were only a scant eight hundred Catholics in the territory out of a population of eighty-seven thousand. And less than a hundred of them resided in the Salt Lake area.

Scanlan was undaunted by the challenges facing him as pastor of the largest geographical region in the United States. Rather, he used that “distinction” as the opening wedge in his appeals to the Société de la Propagation de la Foi for financial assistance. Scanlan’s letters to the Société are historically pivotal inasmuch as they reveal both his own personality and the complex status of the nascent Catholic community in the predominantly Mormon territory.

Indeed, as pastor, vicar apostolic of Utah, and finally bishop of Salt Lake, Scanlan served the people of God in Utah for over forty years, until his death on May 10, 1915. For further details on this remarkable prelate, see Robert J. Dwyer, “Pioneer Bishop: Lawrence Scanlan, 1843–1915,” Utah Historical Quarterly 20 (1952): 135-58.


Founded at Paris by Pauline Jaricot, the Society for the Propagation of the Faith was the most successful of several organizations established during the nineteenth century to sustain the material needs of Catholic activities in missionary regions. For a detailed account of the society’s works, see Joseph Fréri, The Society for the Propagation of the Faith and the Catholic Mission, (New York, 1913).

Two letters from Salt Lake City are especially interesting: the first, dated November 16, 1875, and the second, October 31, 1879. The latter appeal was sent in Scanlan's name by his longtime curate, Father Dennis Kiely (1848–1920). The documents are reproduced here from transcripts made by this writer and now on deposit in the Chancery Archives for the Archdiocese of Los Angeles.

**Report of November 16, 1875**

In my last report I most strongly represented to you, among other things, the great necessity of establishing in this Territory Catholic Schools, as a means—the only means—of saving to the Church the rising generation and of thus sparing to our successors in the ministry, the labor of converting to the Church those who, if in their early Christian education had not been neglected, should be her faithful members. In order to meet this necessity I implored your assistance and cooperation; and now I feel happy in being able to state that my appeal to you has not been made in vain. Through your generous contribution of more than one thousand dollars, and the assistance of God we have been able to bring here a handsome Colony of Sisters who have already firmly established themselves in Salt Lake City, the Capital of the Territory. The Sisters of Congregation of Holy Cross from St. Mary's, South Bend, State of Indiana [sic] arrived here on the sixth of last June. The outlook was then wild and gloomy, but, they were not discouraged. They—two daughters of the Holy Cross—and full of the Spirit of their high calling—came prepared to encounter and if possible to surmount every obstacle: and hence, without losing [sic] a moment in brooding over the hardships and crosses and suffering that stared them in the face, they at once set themselves to the unpleasant work of collecting funds wherewith to make a commencement. Through their great zeal and wonderful energy they succeeded in accomplishing their object. Accordingly a beginning was made: a very commodious lot of ground in a most desirable part of the city was secured, and about the first of August the corner stone of what is now known as the “Academy of St. Mary’s of Utah” was publicly laid in presence of a large assemblage of people. The Building is of brick, four stories high, forty feet wide and sixty long, and is the largest and most elegant educational establishment in the Territory. The School was formally opened by the Sisters on the Sixth of September, and since has progressed very rapidly [sic], the number of pupils now being over one hundred, most of whom, of course, are Mormons or non-Catholics. The Sisters have also leased a building for the purpose of an hospital for the poor miners many of whom get sick from time to time and have hitherto died from want of proper care. It is the Sisters intention also to start very soon a school for small boys. This very flattering success of the Sisters here in so short a time constitutes the chief feature of the progress of Catholicity in Utah during the past year; and furnishes us the best proof that

there is here a wide and fruitful field for Catholic operation. Of course, it is to be remembered that in establishing themselves so quickly and firmly here, the Sisters had to contract some heavy debts, which, however, they hope to be able to pay in the near future through their own heroic labors, the assistance of God and the generosity of the faithful—believing that those who have commenced the good work will see to its completion and that those "who have put their hands to the plough will not stop to look back."

During the last year also, I have purchased a handsome church lot in Ogden, the second city in the Territory. It cost $900.00 a third of which has yet to be paid. The Congregations in the several missions attended by us have increased a little since my last report. We have had about a dozen converts, fifty infant baptisms and ten mixed marriages. Many lukewarm and indifferent Catholics have been converted and are now practical members of the Church. On the whole the progress of Catholicity here during the year that is about to close has been very marked and encouraging indeed; and its present state is such, as to fill us with hope and inspire us with fresh zeal to continue with redoubled energies our feeble efforts in the future.

The Future

Judging from the past, this Territory presents a bright future to the Catholic Church, if only her wants are timely supplied. What are those wants? In the first place, there is need of at least, another priest here. There are only two here at present who are wholly inadequate [sic] to meet the growing demands of the whole Territory [sic]. But, the difficulty is, that there is no means of support for a third priest—for even two cannot obtain a proper subsistance. We have to travel a great deal—sometimes hundreds of miles—on railways and stages, and this consumes the greater part of our little uncertain income; and hence, it is only by the greatest economy that we are able to support ourselves. No greater work of charity therefore could be done and none that would do greater service to the Church and the Saving of souls than to send another priest here, and contribute to maintain him. Another very pressing want is that of a pastoral residence. We have, at present, to live in a few small uncomfortable and unhealthy rooms attached to the rear of the Church, and are obliged to do all our own housekeeping. I do not mention this want through any personal motive, but on the grounds, that while this unpleasant state of things continues it is and will be very difficult to get priests to remain here. On this ground it is a want that should be supplied as soon as possible and in its behalf I most earnestly appeal to your charity. Of course, our means of collecting from the congregation this year is very limited, as the members have already contributed more than they could well afford to the Sisters.

I wish also to call your attention to the necessity of building a church in Ogden City. This is and always will be a city of importance, and consequently, its Catholic interests and wants should be attended to as soon as possible. The number of Catholics there is increasing and would increase more rapidly if there were a Catholic Church. There is also a number of Catholic children who if not
attended to in time will be practically lost to the Church. In order therefore, to save the old and the young I intend with the help of God, to build a church, and also a school to be conducted by the Sisters. This is God’s work and I most humbly appeal to you for aid. I promise you fruit an hundred fold. I will show you work done for every dollar you may be pleased to give me. I will endeavour to make the best possible use of it, to the advancement of our dear Church and the salvation of immortal souls. Encouraged then by your generosity in the past I renew my appeal for further help. I renew it in the name of the Catholic Church, in the name of hundreds of her children famishing through want of spiritual food; in the name of hundreds of the little ones of J Christ, who if not taught the principles of their Church will grow up infidels, and will at no distant day be her shame and disgrace and living monuments of her apathy and neglectfulness. Placing my best hopes in your generous feelings and love for the advancement of our great Common Cause I feel assured of meeting with a hearty response and have the honor to remain

Your Able & Ob Servant in J C

L. SCANLAN
Pastor of St Mary Magdalen,
Salt Lake City, Utah

REPORT OF OCTOBER 31, 1879

Since my last report the good work once begun through your aid in this Territory is still progressing, & each year, as it rolls into the past, is a witness of new Catholic institutions erected, & in use for the object for which they were designed within that space of time. The past year has witnessed the commencement, and completion of a Catholic Church, & Hospital. Within the past year the Church has extended her branches, deep & firm, not in one of the civilized places, which surround the beautiful city of Salt Lake, but far beyond the boarders [sic] of civilized life, in a thriving mining camp, which is 375 miles from Salt Lake, and 300 miles from any Rail Road.

SILVER REEF

The place, above referred to is called Silver Reef. Two years ago this place was a barren prairie. About that time some rich silver mines were discovered there, and the excitement created by these discoveries brought such an influx of people to the place, that in less than one year, it was a thriving little town of 2,000 inhabitants. In the mean time Very Rev Father Scanlan, Pastor of Salt Lake, visited the place & finding there a rich harvest, for a new mission, immediately commenced to work.

His first work, in the little town, was a church which he built with subscriptions raised in the place in addition to the aid received from the “Propagation of the Faith.”
The church being completed, and seeing the great interest manifested by the people at large in the work which he had already commenced, Rev Father Scanlan, in order to further supply the demands of the people, who had petitioned him to establish a Sisters' School and hospital, found it necessary to accede to their demands, & try to supply their wants. Having from non-Catholics, & Catholics an assured promise of liberal support for future undertakings, he immediately set to work, & commenced a new building, which was designed for an hospital. The building, once commenced, was soon completed, & has been used for that purpose since last August.

The school, which was also one of the necessities of the place, could not be erected, as sufficient means could not easily be obtained. But in order to meet the earnest demand of the people, & further the cause of the Catholic Church, Father Scanlan so arranged his church that during the week the sisters could hold school therein, which they have done since last August with great success. Being the only school in the place, nearly all the children of the place attend thereat.

At present there are in Silver Reef one resident priest, & fur [sic] Sisters of the order of the Holy Cross. Two of the Sisters administer to the wants of the sick and three teach school in the church. Thus ended the past year in the Southern part of the Territory, where Father Scanlan spent the greater part of the year. He commenced, and completed two grand Catholic institutions, and saw the work for which they were designed carried on therein by fur [sic] self sacrifishing [sic] Sisters before he returned to Salt Lake.

Another great benefit to be derived from these institutions is, that it will extend the influence of the Catholic Church to places where it-could-not-other­­wise possibly reach: for whilst Silver Reef is but a mining camp it has a prosperous future of many years before it; and from that place the benign influence of the Catholic Church & its teachings will be felt in all directions.

Surrounding Silver Reef there is none but Mormon settlements. St. George, the great Mormon Center, and the only city in the Territory where there is a Mormon “Temple” (a place where all the secret ordinances of the Mormon Church are administered) is about 17 miles from Silver Reef. During Father Scanlan's stay in Silver Reef he had, by his works etc, attracted the attention of the St George Mormon church authorities, who, whilst opposed to his work, & the cause in behalf of which, he labored so zealously, could not help appreciating his zeal & sacrifice in the prosecution of his undertakings, and at the same time admiring him for his gentleness, & firm but unassuming character joined with his great ability. As a mark of their appreciation, they invited him to hold services in their “Tabernacle” (a place where their public services are held, & entirely distinct from the Temple) & explain to them the origin, nature, and claims of the Catholic Church. This invitation, when urged by his congregation to accept, he could not decline. In last May he celebrated High Mass (Mormon choir furnishing music) in the Tabernacle at St. George, before a congregation of not less than 3000 persons, all of whom with but few exceptions were of the Mormon faith. A correspondent, a good & worthy French Catholic, writing to your humble servant on the matter said “It was the grandest event I ever witnessed in the
Catholicism among the Mormons

History of the Catholic Church. Before Mass Father Scanlan commenced by explaining the nature & meaning of the Sacred vestments, just the thing I wished to have done for the crowd that was present. After Mass he preached for two hours the ablest and most lucid discourse I ever heard. The truth of the Catholic Church he established beyond a doubt, and its history brief, but interesting from its establishment down to the present he gave in a graphic style. He has made an impression on the Mormons of St. George, that shall not be soon erased.” The Mormon press, in alluding to the matter, spoke of it in the most favorable manner. This is an instance of how a mission in Silver Reef may & has been used as a great auxialary [sic] for spreading the light of the true faith amongst a benighted people.

SALT LAKE

The Catholic institutions in the city of Salt Lake are all in a flourishing condition. During the year past four converts were received into the church. His Grace, Archbishop [Joseph Sadoc] Alemany, who made his Episcopal visitation here last September, confirmed 30 persons 8 males, and 28 females. Of this number 7 were adults. Of those confirmed 6 were converts to the faith, 5 of them adults.

St. Mary’s Acadamey [sic] was never more prosperous, than it is this year. Pupils number 200, and of these 50 are boarders. During the past year more than $2500.00 has been expended in the completion of the institution. At present with its magnificent cornice, & beautiful porches & verandas recently put on it looms up above all other buildings in the city, & is, if not the most costly, the grandest & most stylish building in Salt Lake.

The Hospital of the Holy Cross is continuing its good & charitable work, under the management of its devoted occupants. Through it the Catholic Church has received more praise in this city, than it could otherwise possibly obtain. The Mormons never establish Hospitals, & when they see the good Sisters providing for the wants of the sick & needy, & for non-Catholics more than Catholics, the great truth is unconsciously forcing itself upon them, that The Catholic Church in her institutions is Divine, or otherwise those heroic acts of self-Sacrifice could not be so successfully carried on. The building occupied by the Sisters as an hospital is only rented, & for the past two years, they have been visiting all the mining camps, in order to raise sufficient funds, with which to build a new Hospital.

WANTS OF SALT LAKE

What Salt Lake seems most to need at present is an Orphan Asylum. Had such an institution been once established, it would live, thrive, & flourish, equally as well, if not better, than our other Catholic institutions, because it would have the sympathy of the entire community; & in addition to this through it a good deal of good could be accomplished. Several parties, whose husband or wife, as the case may be, has died, have applied to us, & asked that we place their children in some Catholic institution, but having no institution for such children, reluctantly [sic], but necessarily [sic] we must refuse. Two such applications were
made to his Grace Archbishop Alemany during his stay in Utah. I hope and pray, that before another year passes, I may see such an institution, at least, commenced, & thereby have the consolation of knowing, that through it, many little children, who would be otherwise lost to the true faith, will be brought up in the bosom of the Catholic Church & that the voice of our good Lord will be echoed in this desolate place. "Suffer little children to come to me for of such is the Kingdom of Heaven."

OGDEN

The Sacred Heart Academy, which opened a year ago in Ogden, has had a prosperous school during the year past, & as bright a future awaits it, as that which has crowned St. Mary's Academy in Salt Lake during the four years past. The pupils, at present there number 150, & of these 15 are boarders.

On Sunday (Oct 5) his Grace made his Episcopal visitation there. He dedicated the new church, which was erected since his last Episcopal visit, under the patronage of St. Joseph. He confirmed about 20 persons. Whilst there his Grace expressed himself as highly pleased with every thing. Ogden's next great need will be an hospital. For such an institution the inhabitants have already petitioned.

OTHER MISSIONS READY FOR OPERATIONS

There are many other missions around Salt Lake equally as important, as those already established, and which if attended to, would produce as much good fruit, as those which have been yielding a hundred fold.

PARK CITY

Park City, a mining camp 40 miles from Salt Lake has a population of over 2000 persons. They are there not less than 20 Catholic families, twice as many as we have in Salt Lake with its population of 25000. & I have no doubt but the aggregate number of Catholics there is double what we have in Salt Lake. We visit there once a month but in such visitations very little can be accomplished. No lasting impression can be made on children, who, if not trained in, & habituated with Catholic practises, ceremonies & rites, will not when grown up be practical Catholics, or Catholics at all, unless the influence of parents is very great, which in most instances unfortunately is not.

The same remarks are equally applicable to another mining camp, called Frisco, which is 200 miles from Salt Lake. The latter place can be reached by Rail Road, the former can not.

Such is the present state of the Catholic Church & as the Society of the Propagation of the Faith has reason to congratulate itself for much of its progress, I hope in the future in its charity it will not fail to continue the good work so effectually begun. With feelings of the profoundest respect, I remain

Your humble servant in Christ

D. Kiely, assistant Pastor
St. Mary Magdalen's Church
Salt Lake, Utah
The Utah Gospel Mission,
1900-1950

BY STANLEY B. KIMBALL

Above: Missionaries and motorized wagons of the Utah Gospel Mission.
Courtesy of Bowling Green State University.

The missionary activity of various Christian denominations in the Mormon settlements of Utah and neighboring states bears witness to the commitment and zeal of the organizers and workers and reveals a story unique to the Intermountain West. These attempts to "Christianize" the Mormons, while fascinating, are largely forgotten today. However, one such venture, the Utah Gospel Mission, was well documented by photo-

Dr. Kimball is professor of historical studies at Southern Illinois University, Edwardsville.
graphs that came to light in 1971 when Bowling Green State University, Ohio, acquired some papers of Rev. John Danforth Nutting who organized the mission in 1900.¹

Nutting was born March 8, 1854, at Randolph Center, Vermont, not ten miles from the Sharon birthplace of Joseph Smith, Jr., whose church was to be the target of the Congregational minister’s educational effort. Nutting’s parents, determined that their children “be able to attend a truly Christian college . . . unhampered by ‘secret societies,’” moved the family to Illinois where John attended Wheaton College, receiving his master’s degree in 1881.² Convinced of his call to the ministry, Nutting entered Oberlin Theological Seminary. He completed his studies in 1885 and was ordained as a Congregational minister.

After serving pastorates in several states Nutting was called to the Plymouth Congregational Church in Salt Lake City in 1892. There he began to study Mormonism and to assess the difficulty of reaching Mormons with the Protestant message. A new kind of Christian missionary work was called for. His fellow ministers “commissioned Mr. Nutting to ‘go back east’ and find out what could be done.”³ When many possibilities had been investigated, the Utah Gospel Mission was organized at Cleveland, Ohio, in 1900 with Nutting as secretary. He managed the mission’s activities for the next half-century.

Nutting’s work to “save” the Mormons was carried out primarily by “wagon missionaries,” a traveling ministry that went from place to place in large canvas-covered wagons and, later, motorized vans. Living three to a vehicle, they traveled to Mormon areas in Utah, Idaho, Wyoming, and Montana the year around, calling at homes, passing out literature, and holding indoor and outdoor meetings wherever possible. In short, they followed quite closely the Mormon missionary system—fighting fire with fire as it were.

Many missionaries came to Utah in answer to appeals for their services. Nutting carefully planned their travels.

¹ The Nutting papers are housed at the Popular Culture Library at Bowling Green. The collection consists of photographs and three manila folders. One folder contains multiple copies of about forty different tracts of the Utah Gospel Mission and two other folders contain miscellaneous publications of Nutting—such as scattered issues of Light on Mormonism for Genuine Christianity against All Substitutes and Errors (1924–50), and select issues of the Fortnightly Advance.
² Light on Mormonism 26 (1950): 1. This issue (January) contains a brief biographical sketch of Nutting who died October 4, 1949, at age ninety-five.
³ Ibid.
The men are asked to give one year to the work with all expenses paid. A number have given much more. It was not unusual to see Mr. Nutting standing by his desk near a window studying road maps. He must find the way to reach all villages and hamlets and to prevent back travel where possible. If the force is full they separate for small places and bring the whole force together for the larger towns. In general the plan is to travel north in the summer and camp in shade. In the fall they turn south and seek sunny spots for stopping.⁴

Although the Utah Gospel Mission was not a great success, the missionaries certainly tried hard. By 1935, for example, the central Mormon region had been worked over seven times; 381,510 house-to-house calls had been made, over forty-five million pages of literature had been distributed, and over forty thousand Bibles had been sold or given away. The now defunct venture might well be studied in greater detail.

While these zealous missionaries failed to convert large numbers of Mormons, they did leave Utahns a precious visual heritage—more than one hundred glass negatives, mostly dating from the 1910s to the 1930s—depicting Utah towns, streets, churches and other buildings, and the missionaries themselves. The collection is unusual in several ways: it includes rare photographs of interiors, hard-to-find non-Mormon churches, new views of towns and buildings, and, of course, the Utah Gospel Mission personnel and equipage. The photographs reproduced on the following pages will serve to memorialize this mission to the Mormons.

⁴ Ibid.
Missionaries traveled vast distances in wagons, horse-drawn at first and later motorized, to bring tent meetings and children's classes to the far-flung, sparsely populated Mormon settlements. All photographs in this section are courtesy of Bowling Green State University.
Banners proclaim the enthusiasm of church workers in Utah. Zeal, combined with the need to give children a good education, led to classes held in many towns. The motto on the classroom wall shows the religious emphasis. The missionaries were also committed to study, often in solitude at makeshift desks in their wagons.
From the top: Rare photograph of the interior of a log home shows a "Mormon couch" against the wall behind the table. Other valuable documentary photographs show the town of Pleasant Grove, the old Provo Fifth Ward, and the Nebo Stake Tabernacle in Payson.
The missionaries photographed many buildings such as these two churches that are now difficult to identify. These unknowns intrigue and challenge the detective in every historian.

Left and below: The missionaries photographed many buildings such as these two churches that are now difficult to identify. These unknowns intrigue and challenge the detective in every historian.

Even the smallest settlement attracted the wagon missionaries. The brush-covered hills and rubble-rock commercial building are typical of many small Intermountain towns. Right: Independence Hall in Salt Lake City, a true community meetinghouse, was used by Jews, Christians, fraternal lodges, and other groups.
In the 1880s the federal government undertook a concerted campaign to suppress the practice of polygamy by members of the Mormon church. Under the Edmunds Act of 1882 the practice of plural marriage was outlawed, basic political rights were denied to those convicted of polygamy, and much of the government of Utah Territory was placed in a five-man commission appointed by the president of the United States. The Edmunds-Tucker Act of 1887 brought further pressure to bear on the church, threatening its very existence. Church property was made liable to confiscation, and the church itself was disincorporated. The constitutionality of these measures was questionable, but they clearly reflected the will of most Americans and were supported by nearly all leaders of the executive and legislative branches of government. Moreover, they represented nothing new.

The object of intense hostility from the moment of its founding in 1830, the Mormon church had occupied an uneasy position in American society throughout much of the nineteenth century. The Saints were driven successively from New York, Ohio, Missouri, and Illinois; declared by President Buchanan to be in a state of rebellion and confronted by an army of twenty-five hundred men only ten years after they had migrated to Utah in search of isolation and freedom to establish their Zion; and portrayed in the popular press and literature as immoral and subversive. A dominant theme of nineteenth-century Mormon history was the attempt to make the church conform to national norms and practices. The legislation of the 1880s was the latest effort in that direction.

Dr. McCormick is an instructor of history at Texas Tech University.
Few individuals spoke out against the actions of the federal government. Of those who dared to censure the government and defend the Mormons, Dyer D. Lum—little known today but an important figure in the American Anarchist movement of the late nineteenth century—stands out as one of the most interesting and perceptive. At a time when the Mormon church was widely denounced as a reactionary institution that threatened the very foundation of the American social order, Lum defended the church as a progressive force, condemned the federal government for its attempted suppression of the Mormons, and sought to penetrate below the surface issue of polygamy to explore more fundamental causes of the confrontation between Mormonism and the United States government.

Anarchism is an ambiguous concept that is widely misunderstood and grossly distorted. Despite a popular view of the Anarchist as a bomb-throwing agitator in a black coat, anarchism is not a philosophy of disorder and has no necessary connection with violence and terrorism. Although anarchism embraces a variety of viewpoints, historically its core has been, first, an emphasis on the independent value of the individual and his absolute right to a full and free development; second, a condemnation and complete rejection of any authority that restricts the freedom of the individual; and third, advocacy of a society in which all human relations are those of social and economic equals who act together in a voluntary cooperation for mutual benefit. Thus, two concepts are at the center of anarchism: individual autonomy and cooperation.

Autonomy does not rule out relations with others. In fact, Anarchists insist that human growth and true individuality are possible only through association with others. For the Anarchist, men are fundamentally social. They need the presence, stimulation, and reinforcement of others. They function effectively, indeed, they fulfill themselves, only when they have meaningful and creative relations with others. Autonomy simply means that association must be free, not forced. Anarchists look forward to a society of unrestrained, naturally intermingling, self-governing private groups.

Dyer D. Lum was a native-born American Anarchist, and, in an effort to counter the widespread assumption that anarchism represented a sinister foreign influence, he emphasized his American roots: his birth at Geneva, New York, in 1839; his colonial ancestry, including his grandfather's participation in the Revolutionary War; his kinship to the Tappan family, many of whom were prominent in the Abolitionist movement of the antebellum period; and his service as a Union soldier in the Civil War, during which time he made a daring escape from the Confederates. After the war, he returned to his trade of bookbinding, working in various New England towns before settling down with his wife in Northampton, Massachusetts.

Lum was active in the early labor movement. For a short time he was secretary to Samuel Gompers in the early days of the Central Labor Union in New York City. He ran in 1876 on the Greenback ticket for lieutenant governor of Massachusetts with Wendell Phillips, a prominent labor reformer and prewar Abolitionist, as governor. In 1877 Lum served as secretary to the Committee on Depression in Labor and Business of the Forty-sixth Congress, a position that enabled him to travel throughout the United States observing economic conditions at first hand. In 1880 he served with a number of prominent labor union leaders on the National Eight-Hour Association, lobbying unsuccessfully for the adoption of the eight-hour day as the standard work day in government and industry.

By the early 1880s Lum had become an Anarchist, combining an intense individualism with militant trade unionism and an interest in Communist economic possibilities. In 1883 he joined the newly formed Anarchist International Working People's Association (the "Black International"). The platform of the organization envisioned trade unions as the foundations of future society, denounced political action as futile, and condemned the state, the church, and the school system as obstacles to the amelioration of the miserable conditions of the working classes. The aims of the IWPA were the establishment of a free society based on cooperative organization of all production, free exchange of goods be-


tween productive organizations without profit, and regulation of all public affairs by "free contracts between the autonomous communes and associations resting on a federalistic basis." Through the IWPA Lum became close friends with Albert Parsons and August Spies, both of whom were militant trade unionists and leaders in the Anarchist movement in Chicago, at that time the center of Anarchist activity and organization in the United States. Like Lum, Parsons and Spies had lost faith in political action and shared his view that a strong trade union movement was a prerequisite to the abolition of state authority and the establishment of a free society.

Lum described himself as a "social revolutionary," calling for the abolition of authority in all its forms. While he sympathized with the doctrines of "direct action" and "propaganda by the deed" advocated by some Anarchists—most prominently the German exile Johann Most who was the moving force in the IWPA—he never became an advocate of violent revolution. A believer in evolutionary progress ("the useless or brutish elements in man slowly sink down like sediment deposited by a moving current"), Lum was generally a partisan of gradualism, advocating the "efficacy of social 'evolution' and stressing that the use of force was [only] an answer to aggression."

A prolific writer, Lum contributed frequently to the Anarchist press, wrote several lengthy pamphlets on the principles of anarchism and the relevance of anarchism to the working class and the labor movement, and for eighteen months edited *Alarm*, the English-language journal of the IWPA. Active in the effort to free Parsons, Spies, and six other Chicago Anarchists who had been convicted, despite lack of evidence of direct complicity, of the Haymarket bombing of May 1886, he published an account of the entire episode. At the time of his death in 1892 he was working to gain the release of the Anarchist Alexander Berkman, who had been imprisoned for his attempted assassination of Henry Clay Frick, the general manager of Carnegie Steel, and he was writing an Anarchist novel with his close friend Voltairine de Cleyre, who, aside from Emma

---


* Dyer D. Lum, *Alarm*, November 5, 1887.


Goldman, was the most important woman in the American Anarchist movement.⁸

Among Lum’s writings were several articles on the Mormon church and two lengthy pamphlets: *Utah and Its People; Facts and Statistics Bearing on the “Mormon Question,”* published in 1882, and *Social Problems of To-Day, the Mormon Question in Its Economic Aspects,* published four years later. All of them grew out of visits he made to Utah in the 1880s and from his reflections on the federal government’s campaign against the Mormon church during that time.

Some of what Lum wrote in these essays echoed the sentiments of other Anarchist critics of the government. In general, American Anarchists regarded the campaign against the Mormons as indefensible, and throughout the 1880s and into the 1890s they criticized the government in the harshest terms. They saw interference with Mormon marriage practices as a concrete demonstration of a central tenet of their political faith: that government was an unnecessary and coercive system that always sought to deny the individual the exercise of his free will. The state, with its powerful administrative and economic bureaucracies, imposed its authority from above without the direct sanction of the individual or his immediate community. Regardless of its form, the state inevitably developed objects of its own and always sought to harness the energies of the society it ruled and turn them to the pursuit of purposes alien to it. The lesson to be learned from the experience of the Mormons, wrote Henry Appleton, a prominent Anarchist writer and speaker and city editor of the *Galveston News,* was that “Our governmental machine is nothing less than a conspiracy for robbery, blackmail, and irresponsible power.”⁹ Benjamin Tucker, the foremost American spokesman for individualist anarchism and the editor of *Liberty,* a quasi-weekly Anarchist journal, regarded Mormon theology as slightly absurd and was firmly opposed to any marriage system, including polygamy. So was Gertrude Kelly, a militant feminist and Anarchist, and a frequent contributor to *Liberty, Alarm, Nemesis,* and other Anarchist journals. Both Tucker and Kelly regarded marriage as a form of slavery in which women were kept as property, but they strenuously denied the right of the state or any other authority to interfere with the marriage practices of any group. The central question, Kelly said, was whether Mormons had “a right to any system of marriage that suits them, that they maintain at their own

---

⁸ "God and the State Hunting Mormons," *Liberty,* December 26, 1885, p. 4.
cost, and that they do not force upon others." For her the answer was clear: all men had a right to do whatever they wished with their person or property as long as they did not trespass on the equal freedom of others.

Not only was the United States government an instrument of coercion and tyranny, but, Anarchists further contended, federal officials who proceeded against the Mormons, and private citizens who supported them, were guilty of hypocrisy. As Anarchists saw it, Mormons were being denounced as immoral and corrupt by individuals who were themselves immoral. To add force to this point, Anarchists repeatedly made reference to the fact that President Grover Cleveland, under whom action against the Mormon church was proceeding, was the admitted father of an illegitimate child. Tucker made the point with greatest force:

An idea for a cartoon, which "Puck" probably will not utilize: Grover Cleveland in the White House with his new and legal wife; to the right, in a companion picture, George Q. Cannon in a prison cell; to the left of the White House, Maria Halpin, Cleveland's illegal wife, and their illegitimate son, dwelling as social outcasts in an abode of wretchedness and want because wilfully abandoned by the husband and father: to the right of the prison, Cannon's illegal wives and illegitimate children, dwelling in an abode of wretchedness and want because the law has imprisoned the husband and father instead of allowing him to live with and protect them; on the walls of the White House, illuminated texts concerning the purity of the home and exclusiveness of love, taken from the president's message to congress on the Mormon question; on the walls of the prison cell, the constitutional amendment forbidding the passage of laws abridging religious freedom.

America was filled with illegitimacy, adultery, prostitution, and corruption, Tucker said. Such a society ought to turn its attention toward remedying its own evils rather than opposing a small and harmless sect.

Dyer D. Lum agreed with Tucker and other Anarchists that in attempting to suppress Mormon polygamy the federal government was acting unjustly and hypocritically. He joined them in denouncing the state. "Almost every charge brought by the colonies against the crown in our Declaration of Independence can be paralleled in Utah against the federal government." In contrast to most Anarchists, however,

---

Lum moved beyond mere denunciation of the state to attempt an explanation of the cause of confrontation. In doing so he formulated a critique of late nineteenth-century American society and culture. He wrote at some length because he believed that the “Mormon problem” was of more than passing interest. In his view suppression of the Mormons was not merely a minor episode in American history that illustrated the coercive nature of the state, it was of fundamental importance. History, Lum argued, was a story of the struggle between two forces, freedom and authority, and progress took place as the realm of liberty was extended and the realm of authority was narrowed. Historically, the struggle had assumed many forms. It currently found expression in the confrontation between the Mormon church and the federal government. Mormonism represented the forces of liberty and progress. It not only denied existing American society, but it also represented the last stage of human history, the Anarchist ideal of “free association.” Successful suppression of the Mormons would mean a delay in the achievement of that utopia.

Lum’s Mormon writings were directed primarily to America’s working class. He sought to make anarchism a vehicle for their aspirations, and he regarded analysis and understanding of the “Mormon problem” as important to the achievement of that goal. Although the situation of the Mormons was relevant to all men, it was of particular significance to workers in their efforts to organize because the Mormon church and the labor movement had much in common. They faced the same basic problem. They sought the same fundamental goal. They met with the same hostile response from the larger society. As Lum saw it, both the Mormon church and organized labor sought to avoid the debilitating effects of industrial capitalism; both sought to replace the existing economic system with one more humane and just; both were moving in the direction of supplanting the existing system with one based on “full and free cooperation” in which labor would receive a “full, just share of the value or capital it has created.” Both encountered hostility. “The Mormon is free to worship God if he will not endanger profits,” Lum said. “We are free to organize if we will be content to remain home and suck our thumbs. The same rod which has lashed them is being turned on us.”

11 Ibid., p. 89.
12 Ibid., p. 7.
In Lum's view the conflict between the Mormon church and the federal government was not a moral one. Polygamy was not the issue. "We need not waste words on polygamy," he said, "though the Utah system is well worth study. That is not the issue! That is but the gaudily-colored bait to catch the inexperienced denizens of economic waters." The issue was an economic and cultural one. Mormon collectivism, not Mormon marriage customs, was under attack. Religious and moral objections to Mormonism were mere smoke screens thrown up by disgruntled elements disturbed by Mormon solutions to economic difficulties through cooperation, which dried up sources of income for speculative interests. The extension of monopoly capitalism through the elimination of cooperative Mormon economic enterprises, not the elimination of polygamy, was the real effort and concern. "The issue is again an economic one—the extension of cheap labor—the cent, per cent, freedom of commercial intercourse—the control over the means of life of the many by the few, confronted in Utah by an antagonistic system of social and commercial activity."

Powerful economic interests were behind the effort to suppress Mormon polygamy, and in their efforts they were supported by the state, which, Lum asserted, was merely an instrument of the economic elite of the country and a reflection of its interests. "Statecraft exists, to-day, for the furtherance of economic interests," he said. "Forms of government are recognized as of secondary importance to 'vested interests' and commercial rights."

As Lum saw it, the beginnings of the alliance between business and government, and the roots of the conflict between the Mormon church and the federal government, were to be found in the Civil War. In one of the earliest statements of a now familiar interpretation of the war, Lum argued that it was not fought over moral questions, but over economic ones. It was simply a conflict between two incompatible economic systems: a maturing industrial capitalism based on cheap labor and a semifeudal agrarian system based on slave labor. Manufacturing, commercial, and farming interests of the North sought to abolish slave labor and were supported in their effort by the federal government. With Northern victory, industrial capitalism triumphed. An economic system based on "wage slavery" and marked by exploitation of labor,

13 Ibid., p. 89.
14 Ibid., p. 7.
15 Ibid., p. 6.
emphasis on private rather than public welfare, and growing concentration of wealth and power in the hands of fewer and fewer individuals was extended throughout virtually the entire nation.

"To-day, South and North alike admit the fundamental principle of our industrial system, the cornerstone of our economic structure: Free labor is cheaper than slave labor. . . . The South are converted; the poverty of a factory population is no longer an Eastern peculiarity. The gray meets blue in hearty unison to draw dividends and cut coupons. They have found free labor the cheapest. Wages still follow the old economic law, the cost of subsistence, and irresponsibility for sickness and old age follows freedom from employer to employee." 16

It was for the further extension of that system, Lum asserted, that the federal government, a generation after its initial triumph, moved against the Mormons. Just as the South stood in the way of economic advance, so also did the Mormons present an obstacle to the expansion of American capitalism. Just as in the 1860s the North had moved to suppress a rival system, so also twenty years later "the cry has gone forth that the Mormon must go!" 17

Lum viewed the outcome of the confrontation with apprehension. The Mormon church would likely be defeated, just as the South had been, and that defeat would mean victory for reactionary forces in the United States. The tendency in the United States, was toward more and more restriction. Jefferson's concept of limited government had been abandoned, and individual rights were encroached upon more and more frequently. Successful suppression of the Mormons would be one more step in the advance of the forces of domination in America.

Lum's elaboration of this contention involved an analysis and comparison of Mormon and American society. The two presented a clear contrast; and while he voiced harsh criticism of American society, he had only praise for Mormonism. Lum did not examine Mormon theology. He was not concerned with the truth or falsity of Mormon religious beliefs but with Mormonism as a "social system." He found much to admire in that regard: a low crime rate; an emphasis on education and a corresponding literacy rate higher than that of most states; democracy, evidenced by the practice of the entire membership of the church voting twice yearly in open meeting to "sustain" or not the hierarchy of the church in their positions. "Every woman has a vote; male and female, humble believer and dignitary, meet on a common footing—having

16 Ibid, p. 88.
17 Ibid.
equal rights," he said. It made no difference that church officials were seldom removed from office. In a community with shared values and beliefs, that was not to be expected much. The point was that removal was possible. "Here is a provision by which the Church itself can curb
any of its officers, even to its head, whenever there is a forfeiture of public approval by a departure from the lines laid down by usage and the collective church.”

As for polygamy, although Lum stopped short of approving it unequivocally, he found it to be a fundamentally beneficial arrangement. In the first place, no compulsion was involved. Mormon women, for the most part, freely supported the system and were more free and had more control over their own lives than under monogamy. Moreover, women were respected, children were raised with love and tenderness, and family life flourished. A Mormon home was one “consecrated by family love and sanctified by religious observances, where the mother’s devotion guides the feet of loving children.” Because the family was a central institution in Mormon society, there was less prostitution among the Mormons, less adultery, less divorce, and less infidelity than in American society as a whole. It was not Mormon society that posed a threat to American morality, Lum suggested, but the reverse.

From Lum’s point of view the essential fact about Mormonism was that its orientation was not purely otherworldly. Although Mormons gave first allegiance to religious ideas, they were also greatly occupied with the things of this world. According to Mormon belief the establishment of God’s kingdom on earth required attention to both the spiritual and the temporal needs of man. Thus, Mormons consciously sought to establish a materially prosperous society unmarked by class division. They had largely succeeded in this, Lum said, and they had done so by making cooperation the basis of all aspects of life.

From the moment of their arrival in the Salt Lake Valley in 1847 individual Mormons had willingly subordinated themselves to group interests and group purposes. Indeed, the conquering of an arid desert and the establishment of a thriving community required that and could not have been achieved without it. “Sacrifice,” “self-abnegation,” and the “yielding of personal will and individual preferences in deference to counsel and in opposition to any prospective personal advantages” were required at the outset, and they continued not out of necessity but by choice. Quoting at length such Mormon leaders as Brigham Young, George Q. Cannon, and John Taylor, Lum asserted that Mormons sought to avoid inequality, monopoly, privilege, greed, and selfishness.


Ibid., p. 41.
This they had done through a cooperative division of labor with emphasis on warm personal relationships and an egalitarian sharing of material goods. Mormons had succeeded in harmoniously combining the "individual with the social," Lum said. A recognition and affirmation of the worth of the individual was combined with a realization of the social nature of men and a sense of moral obligation. Acknowledgment of rights was combined with acknowledgment of duties. Selfishness, which Lum despised and denounced at length, was largely absent. Individuals in Mormon society were autonomous. They acted at their own direction and in doing so were not concerned exclusively with their own narrow interests, but with the good of the whole. Greed and the desire to accumulate were replaced by cooperation and a concern for the well-being of society in general. This was most clear in Mormon economic life, Lum said, but it was equally true of all activities. Free cooperation and voluntary association, not individual self-interest, were the basis of the entirety of Mormon society. Mormon society, in short, was essentially free, and it demonstrated, for Lum, the validity of a fundamental tenet of anarchism: that a natural solidarity existed among men that was disrupted by the existence of external authority but manifested itself in its absence.

As Lum saw it, American society stood in stark contrast to Mormon society. Two features of American society stood out: the existence of spurious, antisocial values and an overwhelming spirit of domination. In American society as a whole, materialistic values predominated. Commercialism reigned supreme. Private ends overrode social ones. Rights were emphasized to the virtual exclusion of duties. America was filled with the "dung-beetle." By this, Lum meant

the pure egoist, the grasping selfish schemer who wants to get all he can, take all that is given him, and hold all that he has, who knows nought of duty and insists on his rights, who will acknowledge no obligation not backed by legal authority, cannot understand an account appealing to a sense of duty, of honor, and deems it a flagrant violation of his personal independence.20

In addition, domination pervaded American society. The "spirit of Caesar" stalked the earth and found footing in America. Everywhere Lum looked he found it: in the relation of citizen to state, in the relation of husband to wife, in the relation of individual to church. He found it especially in the relation of employer to employee. The dominant fact

---

20 Ibid., p. 12.
Lum was fascinated by Mormon cooperatives such as ZCMI, shown here on West First South in Salt Lake City, ca. 1885. Utah State Historical Society collections.

of American economic life in the late nineteenth century was the trend toward monopoly. Wealth and power were increasingly concentrated in the hands of a few. Such a situation, Lum pointed out, created class division, provided for the ascendency of the strong over the weak, and promoted the interests of the wealthy and the powerful at the expense of the weak and the poor. The working class was exploited and condemned to difficult, dehumanizing work for subsistence wages. Under those circumstances, Lum argued, it was absurd to even speak of freedom.

Lum's analysis is not only interesting, but it is also an important contribution to Mormon historiography because it puts Mormon history
in context and in doing so raises a number of significant questions about the nature of American society and the position of minority groups within that society. If the history of Mormonism is to mean anything, if it is to be more than an isolated episode of interest only to the specialist, it must be related to larger patterns in American society. Lum’s treatment of Mormonism does that, and his efforts parallel and precede by several generations the work of such historians as Leonard J. Arrington, Klaus J. Hansen, Stanley S. Ivins, and Merrill Hough. Lum’s treatment has weaknesses: his view of Mormon society is simplistic. He does not see its complexity. The degree of consensus is overstated, and the authoritarian elements are understated, even ignored. Nevertheless, it is true that American society of the late nineteenth century and Mormon society of the same time differed in fundamental ways; that Mormon society did not exhibit the kinds of inequities to the same degree that American society did; and that the federal government tried to abolish Utah’s theocratic and cooperative institutions that were interfering with the spread of capitalism. Recognizing these facts, Lum sought to move the level of discussion beyond the view that Mormon-government relations were a case of persecution of a defenseless minority by an overzealous government. He recognized the existence of suffering and injustice among Mormons at the hands of the federal government. He also understood that fundamental issues were involved in the conflict between the church and the government and that the confrontation should not be seen as an unnecessary and therefore avoidable one. The history of Utah was not simply a study in irrationality and intolerance, Lum said. Friction was caused by the existence of antagonistic economic, social, and cultural orders, and was, therefore, inevitable. The lesson of Mormon history, in Lum’s view, was that as long as the Mormons were different, they would not, indeed, could not, be tolerated by an expanding capitalistic system. Only when they gave up their chief distinguishing features would conflict cease.

Leonard J. Arrington, *Great Basin Kingdom: An Economic History of the Latter-day Saints* (Cambridge, Mass.: Harvard University Press, 1958), describes the breadth of the Mormon church’s economic policies while developing the thesis that the “Mormon Question” was based in part on the fundamental antagonism between the American capitalistic system and the church’s carefully organized system of cooperation. Klaus J. Hansen, *Quest for Empire: The Political Kingdom of God and the Council of Fifty in Mormon History* (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1967), suggests that hostility from the government was more the results of the church’s exercise of authority in politics and its desire to extend the kingdom of God on earth than of the practice of polygamy. Stanley S. Ivins, “Free Schools Come to Utah,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 22 (1954); and Merrill Hough, “Two School Systems in Conflict: 1867–1890,” *Utah Historical Quarterly* 28 (1960), focus on areas of Mormon-Gentile conflict other than polygamy.
Mormon Religion in Nauvoo: Some Reflections

BY MARVIN S. HILL

One has no difficulty finding evidence of religious piety at Nauvoo. The miraculous healings by the Prophet Joseph Smith when fever swept the bottomlands during the first year of settlement, the baptisms for the dead in the river, the majestic temple gradually taking form high on the bluffs above the town, all are reminders that Nauvoo was a religious

Dr. Hill is associate professor of history at Brigham Young University. A somewhat briefer version of this paper was read at the Mormon History Association meeting at Nauvoo, Illinois, April 20, 1974.
community and the Mormons a religious people. One might cite Joseph Smith's instructions to the ladies on March 17, 1842, at the time the Relief Society was established, as evidence of Christian charity and morality. The ladies were to "provoke the brethren to good works in looking to the wants of the poor—searching for objects of charity . . . to assist by correcting morals and strengthening the virtues of the community." An ardent missionary spirit which filled the minds and hearts of the elders is reflected in Wilford Woodruff's journal on the eve of his mission to England in August 1839:

it is no small trial of faith to leave my family & my all & start on a mission of four thousand miles . . . & that without purse or scrip with the power of disease resting upon me . . . but yet I do this freely for Christ sake trusting in him for the recompense of reward.

And there was a Christian millennial hope. John Taylor expressed this in a letter written to his wife in September 1840. He said that when he returned from his mission they would talk of things old and new and "forget all our troubles & look forward to the day that shall be revealed at the coming of our Lord Jesus Christ with all his saints."

But when I was asked to consider religion in Nauvoo and began looking over my research notes which fill many large boxes, I found that very few of them deal directly with religious subjects. To be sure, I have a folder on theology and one on Joseph Smith as a religious leader, but the majority of them deal with the topics like "the kingdom," "politics," "business affairs," and "polygamy." There is a folder labeled "Mormon apocalyptic," but much of this material is actually social and political in nature. When I turned to the journals of the elders I found on the whole very little soul-searching: they were far too busy building the kingdom to have time for religious meditation or introspection. A question now becomes appropriate: in comparison with so much that seems to be secular and worldly, was there much that was religious at Nauvoo?

This is a question that has been asked with regard to Mormonism as a whole and often has been answered negatively. Many are familiar

1 A succinct history of the Mormons at Nauvoo is David E. Miller's and Della S. Miller's Nauvoo: The City of Joseph (Salt Lake City and Santa Barbara: Peregrine Smith, Inc., 1974).
2 See Smith's comments in the "Book of Records Containing the Proceedings of the Female Relief Society of Nauvoo," manuscript, Archives Division, Historical Department, Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City.
3 Wilford Woodruff's Journal is in the LDS Archives. See entry for August 7, 1839.
4 The letter, dated September 6, from Liverpool, is found among the John Taylor Letters, LDS Archives.
with Bernard DeVoto’s disgust with Mormon materialism, its “talents for sugar, rails, and industrials.” But, of course, that general point of view goes far back into Mormon history. As early as 1833 Nancy Towles said Mormonism was a “profanation and sacriilege of all religious things.” Even Jules Remy, a more perceptive interpreter of Mormonism, said following his journey to Salt Lake City in 1860: “Mormonism is nothing more than the product of calculation ... of speculation. ... The thirst for gold ... was the ... inspiration of Smith’s religious scheme.

Harsh words indeed. Yet it is a judgment that has persisted in somewhat more moderate terms until our own day. One thinks of Fawn Brodie’s earthy characterization of Joseph Smith, or of numerous articles in popular journals that stress the mundane programs of the Utah church, its banks and business enterprises or its welfare program. Very little has been written about the religious quality of Mormonism and thus almost nothing about religion in Nauvoo. In a recent study of Nauvoo, which I think is exceptionally well done, chapter topics include government, the military, land speculation, business, industry, finance, conflict within the kingdom, and the kingdom as empire. Almost nothing here treats religion as such. The orientation is largely economic and political, although the author treats the subject initially in a religious context. A chapter on the Nauvoo House and the Nauvoo Temple is called “A Dwelling for Man and a Dwelling for God” but deals with the activity of building these edifices, not their ultimate religious significance. Clearly, perceptive interpreters have considered Mormonism at Nauvoo to be very worldly.

Notwithstanding this, there have been those from time to time who thought they saw something else in Mormonism besides American materialism. Jules Remy said that what struck him most was Mormonism’s universality—“it summons the whole world within its embrace.” Richard T. Ely saw this universality as religious, for he said that “according

---

6 Vicissitudes Illustrated, in the Experience of Nancy Towles, in Europe and America (Portsmouth, N.H., 1833), p. 15.
9 I have reference to Robert B. Flanders’s, Nauvoo: Kingdom on the Mississippi (Urbana: University of Illinois, 1965).
10 Remy, A Journey, p. 7.
to the Mormons all life is held to be sacred.” But I like best the way Orson Hyde stated it in his speech before the high priests in Nauvoo in 1845. He said Mormons call everything an ordinance of religion that can tend to man’s perfection and happiness; whether it be to plow and sow the fields, to buy and sell goods, wares and merchandise, houses or lands, to go to the polls and vote, to the prayer meeting, or to the sacrament of the Lord’s supper... whatever we do we wish to do all to the glory of God.

That, I think, is the essence of Mormonism and helps to explain why it has been so difficult for observers to say much about its religious nature. Mormonism includes so much of the things of this world that critics have not been able to identify its religious qualities. But it might be that the inability to identify what is religious in Mormonism grows out of the fact that historians who observe it are victims of their own cultural evolution, that they are post-Reformation in their outlook and tend, whether Catholic or Protestant, to see the sacred and secular as different things. It seems to me that when Joseph Smith in the account of his vision received in 1820 denounced all churches as having a form of godliness but teaching the commandments of men, he was in part criticizing the secularism implicit in a multitude of religious sects. It seems also that in denouncing the prevailing religious establishment he repudiated Protestantism with its strong emphasis on individualistic religion, the idea that salvation comes through a personal confrontation between God and the individual in which no hireling priest as mediator between man and God is necessary. Most of this was spelled out by 1830 or 1831. The Mormon emphasis on personal testimony would seem to be an exception to this generalization, a continuation of the central Protestant thrust. Yet I would argue that primarily the Mormon sought his salvation by different means, by the performance of duties that were essentially social, by ceremonies and rituals that were largely public, by conformity to measurable standards that ranged from baptism by im-

11 Speech of Elder Orson Hyde Delivered before the High Priest’s Quorum in Nauvoo, 1845 (Liverpool, 1845), p. 4.
mersion and support for polygamy to abstinence from tea, coffee, alcohol, and tobacco.

Seen in this context, everything that occurred at Nauvoo of a social or political nature was to the Saints essentially religious. These things were religious in a sense that the Yale historian Erwin B. Goodenough would have understood. In his article "A Historian of Religion Tries to Define Religion," he maintained that the initial universal quest for religion is the quest for security. Religion is secondly a search for beliefs that explain and control nature. Goodenough maintained that legalism and orthodoxy provide freedom from doubt. The common denominator, he said, is devotion, commitment, service to the source of the "unknown terror" in the universe.

Most of the specialists in Mormon history have been aware for nearly twenty years that establishing a political kingdom of God was a central concern of the early Mormons, but few have bothered to ask why this was so. I believe that the social and intellectual taproot of the kingdom was the fear that prevailed among the Saints that the American democracy based, as James Madison saw, upon pluralism, could not work. The Mormon millennialist faith affirmed that only a government designed and governed under the intimate direction of Almighty God could endure and provide peace and justice on the earth. We have overlooked the fact that millennialist hope grew out of a desire for a termination of social change and social conflict and the establishment of eternal peace. Peace, security, the end of social conflict—these are in Goodenough's terms religious desires. Hence, the pursuit of the kingdom may not have been so much a quest for empire as a quest for refuge. One recalls Joseph Smith's prophecy at Nauvoo in July 1839 that "the time is soon coming, when no man will have any peace but in Zion and her

16 Fawn M. Brodie in No Man Knows My History made some suggestions along this line, but perhaps the first scholar to make a central point of it was James R. Clark, "The Kingdom of God, the Council of Fifty, and the State of Deseret," Utah Historical Quarterly 26 (1958) : 313-51.
17 Joseph Smith said in 1842 that no man-made government, not even a democracy, could long endure on earth, and that the government of God was needed. See Times and Seasons 3 (1842) : 855-56. Times and Seasons was published in Nauvoo as a periodical.
Empire seems to have been incidental to the underlying religious objective. A young man who began his religious search by reacting rigorously against the pluralism of contending sects might conclude it by establishing a kingdom that would, hopefully, bring peace on earth.

A similar point can be made with regard to the Nauvoo Legion, Joseph Smith’s military arm of the kingdom. The Mormon people showed no overt tendency toward militarism until they were brutally expelled from Jackson County, Missouri. The legion was a lawful extension of the county militia organized to protect the Mormons from their violent enemies. But it was also to be an instrument in the hands of the Lord to preserve the nation’s liberty and peace on the eve of the millennium. A poem by Eliza R. Snow written at Nauvoo makes this clear.

Fair, Columbia! rejoice! look away to the West,
To thy own Illinois, where the saints have found rest;
See a phoenix come forth from the graves of the just,
Whom Missouri’s oppressors laid low in the dust;
See a phoenix—a “Legion”—a warm hearted band,
Who, unmov’d, so thy basis of freedom will stand.
When the day of vexation rolls fearfully on—
When thy children turn traitors—when safety is gone—
When peace in thy borders, no longer is found—
When the fierce battles rage, and the war-trumpets sound;
Here, here are thy warriors—a true hearted band,
To thy country’s best int’rest forever will stand;
For then to thy stand the “Legion” will be
A strong bulwark of Freedom—of pure liberty.
Should they need re-inforcements, those rights to secure,
Which our fathers purchas’d and Freedom ensure.
There is still a reserve a strong Cohort above;
“Lo! the Chariots of Israel and horsemen thereof.”

Another area where the life at Nauvoo has seemed very worldly, but where social control seems to have been the primary objective was land speculation. It is true, as Robert Flanders has stressed, that the Mormon prophet spent much time as realtor, buying land in large quantities and selling it at a profit when he could. But it does not seem likely that he profited personally to an exceptional degree. His standard of living was not above that of many others at Nauvoo; as a matter of fact, during the

20 Smith, History of the Church, 3:391, but the whole discourse on pp. 390–91 develops this idea. For an opposing view see Klaus J. Hansen, Quest for Empire: The Political Kingdom of God and the Council of Fifty in Mormon History (East Lansing: Michigan State University Press, 1967).
21 Times and Seasons 2 (1841) : 467.
22 Flanders has an entire chapter on this, pp. 115–43.
first four years when he lived in a log house it may have been below that of many of the prominent men. What profits he made were channeled back into the system to pay back debts and to promote the general economy. Land-trading was a means to an end: to keep the kingdom going, to gather the Saints in large numbers and gain the benefits of a close-knit and harmonious, self-sustaining social order.

But the Mormon wanted more than peace on earth. He wanted salvation in the next world also. But he tended, especially in Nauvoo, to see salvation in terms of prescribed procedures that would lead him to a higher level of achievement and power. Power to become a God was power to control the universe and make all things subject to his will. Security was his aim in this and the next life. Thus Sidney Rigdon spoke to the point when he said at Nauvoo that “it has been a universal mistake to suppose that salvation is distinct from government.” He affirmed that when “God sets up a system of salvation, he sets up a system of government... I mean government that shall rule over spiritual and temporal things.” Government and rule are the key words here, and they imply social control. If establishing a political kingdom on earth seems to us today to be a radical means to achieve peace, we must not lose sight of the fact that the ends—the religious ends—were clearly conservative.

Mario DePillis has argued that Mormonism had its origins in the quest for religious authority. I would add that it was a quest for insight and certainty, however momentary. Relatively few Mormons seemed to care whether what had been prophesied was perfectly consistent with

---

22 Thus, Smith lived in a small log cabin until 1843 when the Mansion House, which served as a hotel as well as the Smith residence, was finished. Smith’s estate upon his death included substantial real estate, but this was because no distinction was made in the kingdom between his personal things and those of the church. Emma was able to secure much property that Brigham Young asserted belonged to the church.

23 Smith’s economic enterprising at Nauvoo has yet to be fully studied, as there is in the LDS Archives much material not yet analyzed. However, a preliminary examination of this material suggests to me that Smith served partly as banker in Nauvoo, that is as a central figure in the process of exchange, advancement of credit, etc., although there was no bank as such. Further, he made a significant effort to pay his old debts from Kirtland and seems often to have made land available at low prices to the poor. Somebody had to pay for all of this, and prices may have been high to those who could afford to pay. I do not believe his economic activities can be divorced from the total social ideal.

24 Note, for example, Smith’s promise to the missionaries in July 1839 that as “the legates of heaven” if they will “fulfil the purposes of God in all things” the power of the priesthood would rest upon them and “kings bow to the sceptre of Immanuel... Zion shall blossom as a rose, and the nations flock to her standard.” See History of the Church, 3: 394-95.

25 Rigdon’s address, given in 1844, appeared in The Prophet, June 8, 1844, p. 2. This newspaper was published by William Smith, the prophet’s brother, in New York.

what happened afterward. It did not matter how often the prophet altered or expanded the theology; the Saints valued the process of revelation more than the product. Although Joseph Smith revised his revela-

27 There were always dissenters who were exceptions to these generalizations, yet for the majority of Mormons they hold true. Thus, Smith prophesied that unless the people of New York City, Albany, and Boston accepted the gospel their cities would be destroyed, but not even John Whitmer made an issue of its failure. See History of John Whitmer (Salt Lake City: Modern Microfilm, 19—), p. 9. Smith affirmed in a revelation in 1833 that there would be no other place for the gathering except Jackson County, but later Far West, Nauvoo, and Zar-

hemia in Iowa were so designated. See Doctrine and Covenants, 101:20, 114:17, and 125:2.
Smith indicated after the failure of Zion's Camp that Zion would be redeemed in two years, once the armies of Israel had built up their strength, but when migrating Saints met resistance and all the Mormons were expelled from Clay County he gave up the project. See Doctrine and Convenants 105:26–30, and Smith, History of the Church, 2:145, 455. I have spelled out this episode in detail with documentation in my "Role of Christian Primitivism in the Origin and Development of the Mormon Kingdom, 1830–1844." (Ph.D. diss., University of Chicago, 1968), pp. 149, 161–62.

28 The doctrines of plurality of gods and polygamy were highly controversial within the church and violated deeply rooted traditions or social norms. On the other hand, the prophet's conception of the nature of man became more positive after the Book of Mormon was published, while the conception of Zion underwent considerable change, from a particular place in Missouri to the idea that all of America was Zion. Baptism for the dead was an innovative doctrine which came late in the prophet's career but did not stir great resistance. Meanwhile, despite the fact that it was the product of revelation, the administrative structure of the church underwent considerable elaboration during the prophet's lifetime with only minor resistance. I touch on several doctrinal innovations in "Role of Christian Primitivism," while Dennis Michael Quinn deals with organizational changes in "Organizational Development and Social Origins of the Mormon Hierarchy, 1832–1932: A Prosopographical Study," (M.A. thesis, University of Utah, 1973).
tions from time to time,\textsuperscript{29} including the Book of Mormon,\textsuperscript{30} few elders ever objected. Only David Whitmer raised it as a major issue, but he had been in the movement from its inception and had been from the first opposed to having Joseph named prophet and seer.\textsuperscript{31}

Many of Joseph Smith's earliest revelations were almost routine,\textsuperscript{32} consisting of personal advice to individual elders who wished to know their calling in the church. What they wanted was a prophet who would spell out the Lord's will day by day, so that each of them could feel that his personal life was in complete accord with the "unknown terror." Again, it was the process more than the product that was of crucial importance. The multiplication of aspiring prophets following Smith's death in 1844 suggests how important the function of prophet was to his followers.\textsuperscript{33}

There was some wish for comprehensiveness as Jules Remy perceived. He said that the Mormon people wanted what their prophet wanted—a religion that would unite all religions and all nations. Remy quoted Joseph Smith in a significant passage:

\begin{quote}
if by the principles of truth I succeed in unifying all denominations in the bonds of love, shall I not have attained a good object? Christians should cease wrangling and contention with each other, and cultivate the principles of union and friendship.\textsuperscript{34}
\end{quote}

Union and friendship, I might add, would promote social peace rather than conflict and make individual differences easier to reconcile. Joseph's antipluralism, so apparent in his first vision,\textsuperscript{35} provided one source for his new interpretations of biblical doctrine. His quest for theological inclusiveness at Nauvoo may best be seen in the ordinance of baptism for the dead which combines a Baptist conception of the need for adult

\textsuperscript{29}A comparison of the Book of Commandments with later editions makes this clear. Compare p. 19 with sec. 8 of the current edition; p. 58 with 25:9; p. 93 with 42:39; and p. 95 with 43:79 where the latter version indicates the Saints were to adhere to the laws of the land. See also p. 160 and compare with 64:30.

\textsuperscript{30}The citation in footnote 29 serves as an illustration.

\textsuperscript{31}David Whitmer, \textit{Address to All Believers in Christ} (Richmond, Mo., 1887), pp. 32-33, 56-62.

\textsuperscript{32}Doctrine and Covenents, secs. 12, 14, 15, 16, 23, 26, 31, 34, 53, 55, 79, 80, 92 are examples.

\textsuperscript{33}Almost all of the successors to Smith claimed to be prophets, including James J. Strang, James C. Brewster, William Smith, Charles B. Thompson, and Sidney Rigdon, as well as others. Perhaps David Whitmer is an exception for he was reluctant to seize the mantle, and so also was Brigham Young in the earliest years, maintaining that he was to fulfill the prophet's purposes, not replace him.

\textsuperscript{34}Remy, \textit{Journey}, p. cxvii.

\textsuperscript{35}See my "Role of Christian Primitivism," pp. 53-56. I have commented on this point also in my "Secular or Sectarian History, a Critique of No Man Knows My History," \textit{Church History} 43 (March 1974): 84-85.
baptism by immersion with a Universalist idea that the gospel ought to save all men. It is significant that in introducing this doctrine Smith said that the Saints past and present would be fused into a “whole and complete, and perfect union.”

Joseph Smith’s stress on a universe governed by law, upon its ultimate order and rationality, may be seen as another way of guaranteeing security. The promise was that if one obeyed the laws he would gain his desired ends. The emphasis on priesthood held forth the same pledge, that right thinking and right acting elders could draw upon divine power and make the universe subject to their needs. Temple ordinances at Nauvoo, under the priesthood, guaranteed salvation, eternal achievement, and eternal union to those who conformed to the outward ordinances and were loyal to the leadership. They promoted group loyalty and subservience and a collective approach to problems met by the group.

Even polygamy, which was introduced as a church institution for the first time in Nauvoo, was largely social in its purpose. The doctrine of plural marriage provided a means by which sex could be regulated under a new order and put to social purposes. The faithful elders were given the privilege of having another wife. Only those whose loyalty was established were initiated, although even some of them rebelled at the idea. But the church members who would obey the principle could be depended upon to follow without question the leadership of the Twelve Apostles, for outside the Mormon community there were no social sanctions for their innovations. I am saying that in one sense polygamy provided a kind of in-group test and security—those who practiced it were, willy-nilly, totally committed and willing to obey in all things.

Thus many of the things that we traditionally think of as secular in nature in Nauvoo, and somewhat irreligious, were not that but designed to promote social control (not necessarily coercion) and social stability. Even Smith’s political activities could be interpreted as essen-

---

24 “Journal History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints,” May 15, 1840, LDS Archives.
25 Doctrine and Covenants, 130:20, indicates that all blessings are predicated upon obedience to law.
28 Among the rebels were William Law, one of Smith’s counselors, and Ebenezer Robinson, an editor of the Times and Seasons.
tially defensive in nature—a means to ensure security and peace for himself and his people. He acknowledged this when he said, “if I ever get into the presidential chair I will protect the people in their rights and liberties.” 42 He said at one time in Nauvoo that he intended to pursue political influence, 43 but it is evident that he did not get embroiled politically until courted by contending political parties 44 and that protection of his people was his ultimate concern. That Mormon involvement in politics may have had an opposite effect, as Thomas Ford has argued, 45 would seem to be one of the many examples of tragedy in early Mormon history. The tragedy was compounded by Ford himself, for he maintained in his History of Illinois that “I have nothing to do with religious but only with political considerations connected with this people.” 46 Neither Ford nor the people of Hancock County generally, appreciated that to the Mormons such a distinction was incomprehensible. Herein was the making of civil disorder and war.

When the Mormons, who were threatened with imminent violence and were disillusioned with state and national governments that seemed too decentralized and ineffectual to protect them from their enemies, loaded their wagons and began crossing the Mississippi River in February 1846, the editor of the Illinois State Register said of them, “the universal desire seems to be to get away to a land of peace.” 47 Not all of them sought peace by taking refuge in the Far West where “none should come to hurt or make afraid.” 48 Those Saints who would later join the Reorganization movement remained in Illinois where they hoped to secure peace by repudiating polygamy and conforming to the prevailing laws of the land. 49 In either case, protection from the “unknown terror” and thus a religious objective was their ultimate concern.

42 Smith, History of the Church, 6:188.
43 In February 1843 Smith said “Tis right, politically, for a man who has influence to use it, as well as for a man who has no influence to use his. From henceforth I will maintain all the influence I can get.” See Smith, History of the Church, 5:286. Earlier in the year Smith had said, and perhaps with some justification, that “the ‘Mormons’ were driven to union in their elections by persecution, and not by my influence.” See ibid, 5:232.
44 The Mormons were the objects of considerable political propaganda as soon as they entered the state since the political parties were evenly balanced. See Flanders, Nauvoo, pp. 212-16, and Hill, “Role of Christian Primitivism,” pp. 239-40.
45 A History of Illinois . . . (Chicago and New York, 1854). He argued this throughout his account of the Mormon difficulties but see especially pp. 262, 269, 362, 413.
46 Ibid., p. 262.
47 March 13, 1846.
48 This line is found in William Clayton’s hymn “Come, Come Ye Saints.”

Look to the Mountains is easily the best book yet written about the southeastern part of Utah. The reader is struck by colorful figures in a colorful country and is certain to enjoy the author's inimitable style. Dr. Peterson is a scholar's historian. He collects all the material he can, studies it carefully, then interprets the information as objectively as his own background will allow.

The rush of events can overtake even the best scholar, however, and this seems to be the case in places within this book. The citation in footnote 16, p. 12, leads to a dead end; the caption below the photo on p. 21, identifying the scene as Spanish Bottoms, is almost certainly in error; and in naming two members of the Macomb party (1859) as "the first known Anglo-Americans to see the confluence of the Green and Colorado rivers" (p. 21), the author apparently forgot about Benjamin Ferris in 1831 and French-American Denis Julien in 1836.

Nevertheless, the book makes important contributions to our understanding of events both large and small in southeast Utah. The effects of the Taylor Grazing Act on rangeland in San Juan and Grand counties is particularly well developed, as is the deep sense of pride illustrated by area residents in fighting to retain the name La Sal when that forest was consolidated with the Manti Forest. In addition, the author's descriptions of Forest Service management of timber and watershed areas are informative and instructional. Also of interest is the section on water development for culinary use in the Blanding area, a story suggesting further study of community self-help and survival. Another interesting incident is that regarding the land development around Valley City. By the same token, more research could have been done on the effects of the Carey Act and other land development legislation.

Finally, Dr. Peterson manages to convey the vigor and insight with which citizens pursued survival in Moab, Monticello, and Blanding when he notes:

It was recognized from the first that water was the key to the development of the entire country. The paramount role played by the La Sal and Blue mountains as the chief source of manageable water was apparent in the nature of the area's economy as it was in the location of its towns and ranches.

As students of Utah history, we are indebted to Charles Peterson for expanding our knowledge of Utah and the thrifty characters who struggled in southeast Utah to survive and prosper.

JAY M. HAYMOND  
Utah State Historical Society
The six essays in this series from the collection of Charles Redd Lectures on the American West, published at Brigham Young University during 1973-74, are representative of the high quality of scholarship demonstrated by the writers selected to appear on the program. Each article includes informative footnotes, the narratives are distinguished in having clarity and grace, and the subject matter is of some interest not only to Utah readers but also to a broader audience of those concerned with the history of the Trans-Mississippi West. This reviewer's only reservation has to do with the format, especially the small type which concentrates the text in to a single-spaced mass of printed letters difficult to read and ungraceful to the eye. The excellent essays deserve better quality from the printer, and it is to be hoped that Brigham Young University Press will be able to produce an improved format for later editions of the Charles Redd Monograph series.

The first fifteen-page essay by one of the deans of western history, LeRoy R. Hafen, is a capsulized summary of “The Opening and Development of the First Route from the Rockies to the Pacific,” the Old Spanish Trail from Santa Fe to Los Angeles. Professor Hafen’s many years of study of the era and area give him an overview of the development of this southern road which places the various expeditions and events in proper historical perspective and importance. From the trips of the Escalante party to the completion of Interstate 15, Dr. Hafen describes the marking of the trail by Jedediah Smith, countless Mormon wagon trains, gold seekers, and mail contractors, with reference also to the horse thieves, Indian slaves, and others who haunted the road. Dr. Hafen’s birthplace, at Bunkerville, Nevada, placed him in early life at the midway point of the trail and sparked his initial interest in this important thoroughfare which he here describes with interest and some nostalgia.

Richard H. Jackson, assistant professor of geography at Brigham Young University, next offers, in a twenty-two page article, a new look at “Righteousness and Environmental Change: The Mormons and the Environment,” to suggest that the Mormon pioneers of 1847 found a fertile valley of luxuriant grasses, a rich soil, and even some trees along the streams emerging from the Wasatch Range into Salt Lake Valley. From extensive research in contemporary diaries and journals, he effectively demolishes the myth of a desert valley with a single tree emerging from the sagebrush-covered plain. His essay is as refreshing as the delightful greensward which the first Mormon immigrants sighted as they entered their promised valley.

Dr. S. Lyman Tyler’s twenty-page exposition of “The Recent Urbanization of the American Indian” dramatizes the problems which the nonreservation Indians have encountered since World War II as their numbers increased to almost 50 percent of the total Native American population in the United States. With the Indian showing a rate of increase in numbers more than four times the 12 percent rate of the white race, Dr. Tyler is convinced that the urban Indians today are moving rapidly toward becoming their own decision-makers in matters which affect their welfare. As the writer of the authoritative and recently published, A History of Indian Policy, Professor Tyler is one of the recognized experts in the field of Indian relations.

In an eighteen-page essay on “The Significance of the Domínguez-Vélez de
Escalante Expedition,” Dr. Ted J. Warner, chairman of the Department of History at Brigham Young University, and a student of the northward expansion of New Spain, describes the attempt of the famous Spanish explorers to open a route from Santa Fe to Monterey in 1776–77. Dr. Warner places in perspective that Dominguez was the leader of the expedition but that the name of Escalante, or more properly Vélez de Escalante, has become accepted as the more important figure in what was a joint enterprise, of which Vélez was the junior partner. The author also emphasizes that the Spanish government did not follow up the exploration with any settlement outposts in what is now Utah because the area was not significant enough for a further investment of limited Spanish resources.

The fifth essay, “Woman’s Place Is in the Constitution: The Struggle for Equal Rights in Utah in 1895,” a twenty-four page article by Jean Bickmore White, associate professor of political science at Weber State College, discusses the problem of equal political rights in the 1895 constitutional convention. Despite the rhetorical flourishes of Brigham H. Roberts in opposition, the convention finally voted in favor of equal voting rights for women, making Utah the third state, after Wyoming and Colorado, to adopt the measure. Both of the major parties had accepted equal rights in their platforms and, with the help of another orator, Orson F. Whittney, the Woman Suffrage Association of Utah marked a triumph to restore the right which the Edmunds-Tucker Act had taken away from Utah women in 1887. Professor White presents a stirring account of the struggle in the convention and the women’s efforts behind the scene to assure victory.

The final twenty-seven page tribute to Charles Redd, by his long-time friend, Professor Karl E. Young of Brigham Young University, is a fitting conclusion to the series of essays. It is titled “Charles Redd: Profile of a Renaissance Man as Rancher.” With a warmth and insight characteristic of his subject, Professor Young relates Charles Redd’s lifelong struggle to acquire and maintain the ranching and livestock operation which came to be one of the largest and most efficient in the Intermountain West. At the same time, Professor Young weaves into the story a description of Charles Redd as a Renaissance man with an uncommon interest in the humanities and a love for his fellow men which has resulted in the Center for Western Studies which he endowed and which bears his name.

The general editor, Thomas G. Alexander, has provided very succinct and perceptive evaluations of the six essays which set the stage for the reader and which, incidentally, proved quite helpful in the preparation of this review.

BRIGHAM D. MADSSEN
University of Utah


From the tastefully designed cover and the beginning end-sheet, which depicts early Salt Lake City, to the closing end-sheet, which depicts modern Salt Lake City, this book is a work of art. The format, with each chapter preceded by a chronological table, makes it a handy ready reference; an index would have made it even handier. The subjects dealt with in the nine chapters flow logically and provide a rather complete spectrum of the colorful,
“different world of Utah.” The layout is, for the most part, skillfully done. The illustrations, including maps, charts, and drawings, as well as pictures, are exciting, informative, clear, and excellently reproduced. They are not only well chosen and well balanced between old and new, color and noncolor, painting and photograph; but, best of all, they are also well placed with reference to the text, a joy to any reader. The type is large, clean, and easy to read; and the quotations from documents used are true illuminations, giving immediacy, a sense of being there and of actual involvement with the story.

The book’s stated purpose is to give “newspaper-type look at a unique culture . . . in the newspaper tradition, to get the story fast, get it straight, and tell it in an interesting way.” It succeeds admirably, especially with regard to the first and last traditions. The prose moves smoothly with the speed of a jet plane over great mountains and broad valleys of time, beautifully delineating the wide, breathless sweep of history; yet there are numerous little cameos of imagery and passages of sheer poetry.

Although the book disclaims scholarly intent, much research has gone into making it historically accurate; nevertheless, there are a few jarring errors. More careful proofreading could have helped, possibly could even have eliminated such mistakes as “Bush Creek” for “Brush Creek” in the Uinta Basin and finding iron ore in the Sevier River Valley, a geological impossibility, instead of at Iron Mountain near Cedar City, where it actually was located.

However, one wonders why the settlement of southern Utah was not included in the “Settlement” chronology, taking place, as it did, in response to a dire need and even before the settlement of Cache Valley; why the Iron Mission was not included along with the Cotton Mission in the “Industry” chronology, since it came earlier and was at least as crucial to the struggling territory; and why there was no mention of the rescue of the Fremont exploring party by the people of Parowan when similar incidents were included.

Having done some study on the Iron Mission, I bristle when anyone refers to it as a failure; although, I am aware that many authorities do. The pioneer missionary company did succeed in making iron; and even the Deseret Iron Company, which bought out the pioneers, destroying, for many, the missionary character of the endeavor, provided cheaper iron than could be freighted in until the railroad shortened the distance between the sources of supply. True, there was bickering and, possibly, self-seeking, as Brigham Young said; but, given the times and the great odds against which the men worked, it is too simplistic to say that this was the only factor in the demise of the industry. At the very least, the two early companies laid a foundation and had enough success to pique the interest of speculators and keep that interest alive until conditions were ripe for success.

Since the book does not purport to be a text or a scholarly work, we have no way of knowing what references were used; but another item of passing interest is the statement that Robidoux burned his own fort on the Whiterocks River (not the “Whiteforks”). Professor Reed Morrill of Brigham Young University, who located Fort Robidoux in the 1930s, claimed that the Indians told him that they had burned the fort to get rid of the cruel, cheating French trader whom they hated. The fact that Professor Morrill found charred guns and human bones at the site lends credence to their claim. It seems unlikely that Robidoux, had he burned the fort himself, would have left part of his arsenal or human remains therein.

Undoubtedly, it is as difficult to pro-
duce a flawless book as it is to find a flawless gem; and, in spite of the few flaws, Deseret has a sort of gem-like quality that will enhance Utah's contribution to the celebration of our country's Bicentennial.

INEZ S. COOPER
Southern Utah State College


Juanita Brooks, a veteran author of the West, has written a book on Emma Lee, the wife of Mormon leader John D. Lee. She has skillfully woven the various strands of evidence to tell this dauntless pioneer woman's story. Born in Sussex, England, in 1836 as Emma Batchelor, she came to America in 1858 after her conversion to Mormonism.

In Utah she met the already polygamous John D. Lee and married him. Lee then moved his family to a new southern Utah settlement, Washington. There Emma Lee's life, like that of many frontier wives, was a never-ending round of hard work and drudgery. Regularly she bore Lee's children and raised them, while he was busy with various commercial projects.

It is not clear when Emma first heard the whispered charges that her husband had instigated a Mormon-Indian attack upon an emigrant train in 1857 at Mountain Meadow. Apparently Emma was convinced that her husband was the victim of slander.

Nevertheless, the gathering storm of charges shadowed John's and Emma's future. In October 1870 the Latter-day Saints officially excommunicated him because of the swelling chorus of blame for his connection with the Mountain Meadow Massacre. Apparently Emma was convinced that her husband was the victim of slander.

Juanita Brooks's work is a valuable addition to the scanty number of books about respectable frontier women. It faithfully chronicles the hard lot faced by western wives. Despite excellent photographs and a very attractive book jacket, this volume, obviously designed for the general reader, will not find the reading public that it might have, as it is difficult to understand Lee's problems without a discussion of the Mountain Meadow affair. Unfortunately the author chooses not to recount any particulars of the Mountain Meadow Massacre and Lee's part in it. These accounts were told, it is true, in other works of the author, but these stories
are not even briefly retold here. Lee's execution is only obliquely covered. The serious scholar will find the book devoid of footnotes and an index. And so while in many respects the book deserves a wider audience it will probably not attract it.

RALPH J. ROSKE
University of Nevada
Las Vegas


Writing a biography of Lee's Ferry is justifiable since the Lee's Ferry site has experienced an unusually exciting sequence of events between the first record made of it in 1776 and the present. This spot is one of those rare sites for crossing the Colorado River in its deep canyons. Only there could wheeled vehicles be crossed for scores of miles in either direction. The ferry was, in fact, a half-way point not only for travelers between Utah and Arizona but also for river explorers, miners, river runners, dam builders, water masters, and politicians. Rusho and Crampton lead their readers through a series of brief chapters each of which provides interesting facts and vignettes about the ferry and the people who knew it—Padres Domínguez and Escalante who camped there in 1776; Jacob Hamblin, Mormon Indian scout; John D. Lee whose name it bears; Warren Johnson, ferryman; Jim Emett and Zane Grey; E. C. LaRue; and today's tour guide, Art Greene.

Lee's Ferry attracted strong characters, including Lee's wife Emma, for the weak did not make it that far from civilization. Dreamers were drawn there also—John Wesley Powell, Robert Brewster Stanton, and Charles H. Spencer. The authors give each an interesting and careful but brief accounting. In a book of this length they cannot tell the whole story of Lee's Ferry, but readers do understand the vital role it played in this small part of western history.

A fine selection of pictures adds much to the book. Unfortunately, the printing is less than adequate. The ink on the pages appears too dark for the quality of paper used. The map of the historic sites (pp. 92–93) is practically unusable. Even so, the book is a needed addition to the literature of the Colorado River, and while not a definitive work, it will provide a series of delights to anyone who reads it, scholar and layman alike.

MELVIN T. SMITH
Utah State Historical Society


The rising contemporary interest in the fate of European ethnics in the United States has to a considerable extent emphasized the urban experience. The myriad numbers of Poles, Irish, and Italians resident in New York, Chicago, and Boston have received justifiable attention in the scholarly reexamination of the validity of the "melting pot" thesis. But Europeans scattered all over the American landscape during the great migrations of the late nineteenth and early twentieth centuries. For many southern and eastern Europeans economic opportunity lay in such areas as southern Louisiana and rural New Jersey or, as in the case
of the South Slavs under discussion, in the mining towns of the Far West.

Stipanovich's monograph on the South Slavs in Utah evidently originated as a graduate thesis and bears some of the hallmarks of such efforts, including a cumbersome writing style and a lack of full understanding of the historical context in which the South Slav immigration into Utah took place. But the work still deserved publication as a partial illumination of the historical experience of a group of immigrants not at all attracted by the Mormon faith seeking to survive in an environment completely dominated by that denomination.

As the author indicates, by the time of South Slav entry into Utah, the Mormons had begun the process of shedding themselves of those elements of their religious practice which had made the group so intensely disliked by other Americans. Outward conformity to majority attitudes and norms had set in, and the Mormon leaders' posture toward southern and eastern European immigrants was not drastically different from that of nativist Americans back east. South Slavs with their difficult to understand languages, their Orthodox or Catholic faiths, and their variant lifestyles encountered great problems at times in their quest for security in Utah.

The South Slavs' troubles in Utah were exacerbated by their own lack of unity. Croats, Serbs, and Slovenes were antagonistic toward each other to a degree usually greater than toward native-born Americans as they clashed over cultural and religious differences brought with them from the homeland. Disputes between the Orthodox Serbs and the Catholic Slovenes, for instance, often resulted in bloodshed caused by varying interpretations of the meaning of the religion of peace.

South Slav emigration from Europe was, as Stipanovich stresses, primarily economic in motivation. The harbinger of the Industrial Revolution caused economic upheaval in the homeland as ideas of individual property ownership began to prevail over the traditional communal and familial holding of property. The *zadruga* or extended family commune known among the Croats and some of the Serbs was especially battered by the winds of change. The author's summary of the European conditions responsible for South Slav emigration is generally sound, although the allegation of Austrian discrimination towards Slavs in the area of education does not stand up under scrutiny. The fifth- or sixth-grade education attained by these people compares quite favorably with that achieved in German areas of the empire.

Once in Utah, the South Slavs gravitated toward isolated mining villages dominated by corporations where they could find employment as unskilled labor in the copper and coal mines. Here they tried to create a viable society for themselves based on a mixture of traditional customs and New World accretions to their cultural stock. Stipanovich draws heavily upon oral interviews with survivors of this immigrant group to describe conditions of life and work found in these settlements. In his analysis of the mining communities of Highland Boy, Midvale, and Helper, the author emphasizes the varying reaction to South Slav settlement by the native white population, a reaction that was determined largely by the percentage of South Slavs resident in the area. Generally speaking, the South Slavs fared best where they made up a majority in an area remote from centers of population density. In such communities, for instance, they were even able to continue their cherished taverns and consumption of alcoholic beverages despite national and state prohibition and the definite disapproval of the Mormon majority.

Norman Lederer
Camden County College, New Jersey
Salt Lake Sketchbook: Historic Buildings from an Artist's View. By J. Hogue Case. (Salt Lake City: Clyde E. Harvey, 1425 Sigsbee Ave, 1975, 82 pp. $4.95.)

Aside from being merely a collection of the artist's sketches, this paperbound publication also presents a text containing background information for each of the forty buildings depicted. Therefore, this work must be examined for both the quality of the drawings and the factual value of the text.

The author, J. [Josephine] Hogue Case, describes herself as an easterner who became interested in Salt Lake City buildings. Her subjects, a great many of which are listed on the National Register of Historic Sites, were sketched over a period of seven or eight years. They are grouped under six headings: "The Mormon Heritage," "The Army in the Valley," "Other Faiths," "Education Matures," "Civic and Business Buildings," and "Private Residences." The location of each site is found either on the full page "City Center—South Temple" map or on several small maps (e.g., Fort Douglas) of outlying areas.

The overall quality of the pen and ink drawings is quite good. All of the buildings are accurately rendered as to their architectural details. However, often the omission of the immediate surroundings of the buildings imparts a quality of weightlessness to them. The quality of reproduction of the sketches is very good with an occasional exception. Some of the sketches, especially those of brick structures, tended to "block up" or lose their fine detail when they were reduced for publication.

Often sprinkled with interesting anecdotes, the accompanying text in most of the categories is informative without being esoteric. Unfortunately, the information in the section on private residences is surprisingly short and fails to report some of the interesting family stories and history. There is also a lack of consistency in reporting the architect's name and the date of the building's erection. In many instances such information is available and its inclusion would enable the reader to become familiar with the city's architects and the variety of their commissions.

Sources consulted in the writing of the text are included in an impressive bibliography. The author utilized not only books but also theses, articles, and pamphlets. One item noticeably absent from the bibliography is Paul Goeldner's Utah Catalog: Historic American Building Survey.

The maps provided are helpful, but there is no overall map containing all of the historic sites documented. The "City Center — South Temple" map comes the closest to fulfilling this function, but it contains no key and includes several buildings which are neither discussed nor illustrated in the book.

The Salt Lake Sketchbook is a welcome collection of sketches with an informative text on the artist's selection of historic sites. It will undoubtedly excite the interest of the layman and history buff, furthering their knowledge of the architectural heritage of Salt Lake City, and will aptly serve another purpose as a much needed and attractive introductory guide to the city's architecture.

Peter L. Goss
University of Utah


Henry Heth (1832-99), a graduate of West Point ('47), devoted nearly twenty years to military life, serving the Union and later the Confederacy. As a
major general for the South at Gettysburg, Appomattox left him a broken man. During his career he soldiered with most of the great names of the frontier army, but Heth holds a special interest for western historians because he was an officer at Camp Floyd, part of the reinforcements for the Utah Expedition.

Henry Heth's memoirs are singular. In a field where diaries and personal recollections of so-called Gentiles in Utah history are less than abundant, Heth's obscure writings emerge unexpectedly from the past as a bonus.

Alas, as an observer, a commentator with a sense of history, he is no match for his contemporaries. He is no Gove, no Phelps or Tracy in this frustrating game of "You are there . . . ." In truth, and the realization is numbing—though editor James L. Morrison, Jr., associate professor of history at York College, Pa., labors gamely to soften the impact—Henry Heth has left a dismaying self-portrait of a loser.

While he struggled from the foot of his class at the Academy to become a general officer (though it be in the army of the Confederacy), his record in the field was disastrous! Morrison says Heth: "though not an outstanding achiever, was a courageous and good-humored man who looked upon his comrades under both flags as old friends with human strengths and foibles."

In New York after service with occupation forces in Mexico, Heth and a fellow lieutenant, Winfield Scott Hancock, accepted an invitation to dine with "Old Fuss and Feathers" Winfield Scott, commander-in-chief of the U.S. Army. Here Heth delivered his friend Hancock to Scott's crotchety natterings and obstreperous petulance on the proper way to eat potatoes. ("My God, my young friend, do you mash your potatoes? You can't tell the taste of a potato when mashed!") Heth, watching how "the General manipulated his potato, tried to imitate him; he was pleased to notice me and said, 'Oh, I see you know how to eat a potato.' . . . Hancock caught my eye and looked as though he would try to annihilate me."

Heth was the first in his class to make captain. His new command with Company E, Tenth Infantry Regiment, attached him to the Irish buzzsaw, Gen. William Selby Harney, on a punitive expedition against the Brule Sioux for the Grattan massacre. Thus Heth found himself at Ash Hollow, Nebraska Territory, in September 1855, where Harney earned the sobriquet "squaw killer" and his new captain learned a bitter lesson in cavalry tactics when he failed to properly close off an escape route and a number of Sioux eluded Harney's discipline. One hundred and thirty-six Indians were killed, however.

Heth's memoirs regarding Camp Floyd in late 1858 are largely silent in detail, but in writing of the Mormons, Mountain Meadow, and Brigham Young, the captain betrays little curiosity for facts. Scant as is his knowledge regarding the Mormons and their background, much of what he expounds is erroneous. And here Professor Morrison compounds the damage by supplying only superficial supplementary notes. When Heth mentions off-handedly of playing host to "Captain Henry [sic] Burton" for two weeks at Camp Floyd and providing him with "Indian trinkets and a scalp," Morrison can do no better than observe "Probably this was Sir Richard Francis Burton . . . ." and cite for his source, the Encyclopaedia Britannica. How much more effective it would have been to consult Burton's own account of the visit and verify Heth's hospitality from the famed Nile explorer's classic volume The City of the Saints and across the Rocky Mountains to California (London, 1861), p. 403. In this failing Morrison is chronic, and it is the book's major weakness.

Sadly, Heth also does not improve his opportunity to give us a thorough under-
standing of the Provo Courthouse episode of March 1859, when Heth's soldiers defied Utah's new governor, Alfred Cumming, by surrounding the court by orders of Federal Judge John Cradlebaugh and nearly sparking a bloody confrontation with furious Mormons.

Heth applied for leave in 1860 to see his wife and newborn child, and in 1861, like so many others (among them his expedition commander, Albert Sidney Johnston) resigned his commission to join the Confederacy.

Editor Morrison's opinion that Heth was "not an inspired tactician" is an understatement. For as destiny collected its children at Gettysburg, Heth (now a major general) marched his division into that hornet's nest in search of shoes despite reports the night before of enemy activity in the neighborhood. The decision was costly: Heth suffered twenty-seven hundred casualties in twenty-five minutes of fighting in McPherson's wood, including himself and his brigadier, J. J. Pettigrew. Heth did not recover from that crushing defeat. He left the military after Appomattox, searching, if Morrison's appraisal is accurate, for vindication.

His civilian years were pocked with spotty success, and in 1899 he fell victim to Bright's disease. Henry Heth's memoirs are not to be discounted. Though vague and infuriatingly silent in many areas, they are a reminder, nevertheless, that even the smallest stepping-stone plays its part in bridging the rivers of history.

HAROLD SCHINDLER
Salt Lake City


In several ways Norris Hundley's Water and the West is relevant to the present. Hundley's discussion of Colorado Basin efforts to divide the waters of the Colorado, a river of limited flow, is of interest to a contemporary American society acutely aware of its limited natural resources. The states of the Colorado Basin, moreover, are still very much concerned with allocating the river's limited resources along with related questions of conservation and ecology.

In a well-written narrative, Hundley discusses the compact of 1922 within the context of larger efforts to develop and utilize the resources of the Colorado River. Initially, "dreamers and planners" within the federal government anxious for river reclamation allied themselves with Imperial Valley leaders pushing for an all-American canal to bring Colorado River water into California. They were then joined by like-minded leaders from other Colorado Basin states who wanted interstate cooperation on various river matters. There were obstacles to regional cooperation. These included differing state water laws, conflicts between upper and lower basin states and between California and Arizona. Despite these conflicts, the Colorado Basin states moved toward an agreement on river policy with the formation of the seven-state Colorado River Commission followed by the Colorado River Compact of 1922. This compact, when finally approved in 1929, represented the first successful interstate effort to apportion water.

Initially, it looked as if Utah would play a major role in Colorado River development. A 1919 regional meeting in Utah of Colorado Basin states adopted the so-called "Salt Lake principle,"
a concept advocating general reclamation on the river's headwaters (many of which were located in Utah). This principle became a rallying cry for upper basin spokesmen suspicious of the lower basin and interested in developing the river in their region. However, Gov. Simon Bamberger rejected plans for extensive upstream reclamation projects in Utah. As for the compact itself, R.W. Caldwell, Utah's delegate on the Colorado River Commission, played a crucial role in forging the 1922 agreement and promoting its ratification in the Utah legislature. Gov. George H. Dern also concerned himself with the compact. He managed to redeem himself for allowing the original seven-state compact to be repealed by securing re-ratification of the revised six-state compact in 1929 despite the strong opposition of Sen. Reed Smoot and Rep. Elmer Leatherwood. Without Utah's ratification, the compact would have never gone into effect.

Water and the West is an excellent example of what might be described as the "new" western history—the attempt to move beyond the regional parochialism that has long plagued writings on the West. Hundley places his story of the compact within the broad context of relevant national and international trends. The larger themes of national reform, East-West interaction, the fears of an expanding federal government, racial prejudice, and international relations are all interwoven into the narrative in a skillful and convincing manner. The few flaws found in this work were very minor, involving such things as the author's vague discussion of the January 1919 meeting at Salt Lake City and his somewhat simplistic description of partisan differences within Utah over the compact. In general, Norris Hundley's Water and the West is an impressively documented work well worth reading.

NEWELL G. BRINGHURST
Boise State University

Agriculture in the Development of the Far West. Edited by JAMES H. SHIDELER.
(Washington, D. C.: The Agricultural History Society, 1975. IX + 316 pp. $7.00.)

The thirty-eight articles and commentaries in this volume, for which James H. Shideler wrote a brief introduction, were presented at a symposium on agriculture in the Far West in June 1974. Shideler, professor of history and acting director of the Agricultural History Center on the Davis campus of the University of California, host for the program, prepared the papers for publication as a special issue of Agricultural History and also for distribution as a book.

The papers at the Davis symposium centered about eight themes: rural society in the Far West, science and technology in western agriculture, keeping the records, law and government policy, immigrant groups in western agriculture, agriculture and the western environ-
them Leonard J. Arrington, Paul W. Gates, Gerald D. Nash, Earl Pomeroy, Theodore Saloutos, and Raymond M. Wik, men who have contributed substantially to the historiography of farming and farm life in America. Contributors were also anthropologists, archivists, economists, geographers, and sociologists, in addition to businessmen, engineers, farmers, and viticulturalists. Therefore, the papers cut across disciplines and occupational interests, providing a broad range of perspectives on the current status of research in the history of agriculture in the Far West.

Readers of Utah Historical Quarterly will be attracted to the first article in Agriculture in the Development of the Far West. Under the title, "'A Different Mode of Life': Irrigation and Society in Nineteenth-Century Utah," Leonard J. Arrington and Dean May attribute the successful creation of a regional system of irrigated agriculture in the Great Basin less to engineering skill than to the social and institutional forces peculiar to Utah in the nineteenth century. The much-admired farm villages and their way of life sprang not from the prevailing water distribution system, but from the Mormon religious experience. Achievements in irrigation engineering and the agronomic arts were the functions of a determined effort by Mormons to create and maintain a distinctive identity through a society set apart from the mainstream of American life. Because of the interrelationship between cultural, social, and economic institutions, the agricultural triumph of the Mormons, although widely admired, was not repeated outside of the Great Basin.

Lee Scamehorn
University of Colorado

The republication of The Pima Indians makes readily available for the first time one of the more important ethnographic and ethnohistoric publications of the first decade of the twentieth century. Frank Russell's Bureau of American Ethnology 26th Annual Report, long out of print, is the standard anthropological work on the Pima. It is more than just an ethnography, however, since it is also a valuable reference tool for historians, ethnobotanists, and archeologists. Perhaps the most important aspect of the re-edition is that it makes available in an inexpensive paper form Russell's history of the Pima during the second half of the nineteenth century. His concise description of most facets of Pima life, with abundant photos, and his discussion of the Pima Calendar Annals which cover nearly seventy years of Apache wars, white contacts, and drastic cultural adjustments make this a necessary book for all serious students of southwestern history and cultural change.

The Pima Indians is therefore actually two books. The first is a compact history of the Pima in which cultural historians and western Americanists will find a wealth of contact data gleaned from the writings of Kino, Manje, Font, the Rudo Ensayo, Bartlett and other Spanish - Anglo visitors, as well as from the Pima's own calendar sticks. In terms of this author's specific interests, Russell's presentation of the Calendar information and of data from the Rudo Ensayo and other early Spanish documents has been invaluable in filling critical gaps between the early contact years of Kino and the later Spanish/American visitations. Russell's data on political developments, settlement pat-
tern shifts and economic adaptations has proven useful to scholars interested in a variety of cultural-historical questions. Recent works by Ezell, Hackenburg, DiPeso, Dobyns, and others which have dealt with history of the Sobaipuri Pima, the effects of Spanish contact on Pima-Apache relations, the Yuma wars, the development of the Pima-Papago economy and related questions have all depended on Russell’s research.

The second aspect of The Pima Indians is Russell’s concern with the artifacts of Pima culture at the close of the nineteenth century. Detailed descriptions of tools, plants, songs, myths, and speeches are presented, along with brief sketches of the Pima political system, social organization, and economy. This lack of depth in the organizational areas of Pima culture is the only weakness of the work, and as Bernard Fontana notes in his excellent introduction to the re-edition, Russell’s publication is by no means a balanced work. Many parts of Pima society are only cursorily examined, while much of the ethnographic description actually dates to the Pima society of fifty years earlier. The work continues to be of value, however, particularly in terms of its cultural-historical contributions, and it remains an example of late nineteenth century salvage anthropology at its best. The plant usages, artifact descriptions, and photos alone are a major contribution, since little research has been accomplished with certain of these areas since Russell’s time. No formal Pima ethnobotany, for example, has been compiled, and Russell’s data on medicinal and food plants is the only information we have on the Pima use of wild plant products. The later Papago work of Underhill, and Castetter and Bell’s agricultural study are heavily indebted to Russell, as is the more recent ethnobotanical reconstruction of Snaketown by Bohrer.

JOSEPH C. WINTER
San Jose State University

Utah! By Willard Luce and Celia Luce. (Salt Lake City and Santa Barbara: Peregrine Smith, Inc., 1975. VI + 211 pp. $9.00.)

Intended primarily as a text for elementary school students, Utah! is a visually attractive, highly readable book. Concepts are carefully developed and written in a clear, engaging way. Occasionally the authors include delightful bits of folklore (always identified as such) that provide additional sparkle.

Of major importance, the book presents a balanced view of the state’s heritage. For too long many history materials for the public schools have read like religious tracts, explaining in minute detail the origins, beliefs, and accomplishments of the Mormon church.
and minimizing or even ignoring the state's multiethnic, multicultural heritage. *Utah!* tells the Mormon settlement story in a way that may well capture the attention and appreciation of non-Mormon students (and their parents) who have objected to sectarian approaches to history.

*Utah!* does not presume to tell everything about geography, history, prehistory, and natural history, but it does provide a good, up-to-date overview with much specific detail, conceptualized for maximum retention. A number of subjects are not mentioned at all: the Fremont Indians, polygamy, the Walker War, John Wesley Powell, the Mountain Meadow Massacre, John Gunnison, and Howard Stansbury. Of these, the three explorers probably should have been included for readers at the fourth-grade level and would have been better choices than Bonneville and Kit Carson for the section (the book's weakest) on government explorers.

Some corrections should be made in future editions: Sanpete County does not owe its name to Saint Peter; members of the Episcopal church call themselves Episcopalians not Episcopalists; the Utah Stars have folded. Despite some shortcomings, *Utah!* represents the best elementary text to date in Utah history and merits serious consideration by schools and parents.

*The Book of Abraham Papyrus Found: An Answer to Dr. Hugh Nibley's Book "The Message of the Joseph Smith Papyri: An Egyptian Endowment" As It Relates to the Source of the Book of Abraham.* By H. Michael Marquardt. (Sandy, Ut.: Author, 1975. 23 pp. $2.00.)

Argues that the Book of Breathings is the source for the Book of Abraham and that Joseph Smith's translation is erroneous. Contains appendices listing Egyptian manuscripts in the Historical Department of the LDS church.


Lists the many Mormon splinter groups, past and present, and shows what doctrines they follow.


Experiences typifying the early Mormon frontiersman are taken from Bushman's diaries and journal. Included are many high quality photographs, complete bibliography and index, and several appendices, including an indenture certificate of Bushman's mother.


An in-depth analysis on the translation and interpretation of the Book of Breathings (Joseph Smith Papyri X and XI) and a handbook of the rites and ordinances of the ancient Egyptians. Nibley briefly discusses the controversy over the origin of the Book of Abraham, arguing that it is not derived from the Book of Breathings.

A collection of fifty-five documents, essays, and reflections.


A collection of thirty-one stories that passed through the Indian generations, explaining life’s mysteries—the earth’s creation, the origin of man, etc. Includes legends and folklore of eleven tribes that hunted and lived from Canada to Mexico and from the Mississippi River to the eastern slopes of the Rocky Mountains.


A beautiful pictorial tribute to the country of the mountain men with accompanying text. The book includes a portfolio of romantic prints of the trappers by Alfred Jacob Miller.


Sources of the legends seem to begin with an alleged discovery of a rich gold vein in the Superstition Mountains of Arizona around 1840. The knowledge of its location was lost through violent deaths of its finders, and the incident was subsequently repeated several times, reaching into the twentieth century. The most mysterious disappearance is that of the “Dutchman.”


Extensive description and illustration of the ancient Christian churches of northern Mexico and southwest United States. Contains an introduction on the spread of Christianity throughout this area.

Those Kings and Queens of Old Hawaii. By PAUL BAILEY. (Los Angeles: Westernlore Press, 1975. 381 pp. $11.95.)

Examines the Hawaiian monarchy from the ascent of Kamehameha to the deposition of Queen Liliuokalani in 1893 and includes the controversial Walter Murray Gibson.


The memoirs of an early twentieth-century homesteader near Thornton, Wyoming.

Families and Communities: A New View of American History. By DAVID

This book proposes to shift the focus of American historical writing from the national to the local level to see how families, towns, cities, and states influenced the development of the nation.


This, the third volume in the Black Mesa series, contains seven papers, three of which are theoretical in nature and four rather specialized reports, that present the results of eight years of investigative survey and excavation on Black Mesa.

RECENT ARTICLES

BUSINESS AND LABOR
"David Armit—Hudson's Bay Trader," The Museum of the Fur Trade Quarterly 11 (Fall 1975) : 2–4.

CONSERVATION AND PRESERVATION
Articles and Notes

EXPLORATION AND WESTWARD MOVEMENT


“By Train from Omaha to Sacramento One Hundred Years Ago,” The American West 12 (November 1975): 14–17. Excerpts from the diary of Giles Barton Lumbard.


HISTORICAL METHOD AND SOURCES


MINORITIES

“Early Southwestern Minorities: Indians, Mexican-Americans, and Women,” *Journal of the West* 14 (October 1975). Issue contains thirteen articles on such subjects as the Treaty of Guadalupe-Hidalgo, the image of Mexican-Americans in movies, woman suffrage in Arizona, etc.


**MORMONS**


Kimball, Stanley B. “Heber C. Kimball and Family, the Nauvoo Years,” *Brigham Young University Studies* 15 (Summer 1975) : 447–79.


**SOCIAL AND CULTURAL**


Primary source materials recently acquired by the library of the Utah State Historical Society include the Sanborn fire insurance maps for Utah towns, the earliest dating from 1890 with corrected versions up to 1952. The maps show the location, building material, and some construction details of homes and other structures. In addition, the library has acquired microfilm copies of more than forty rare gazetteers and business directories by various authors dating from 1867 for Utah, Salt Lake City, and Ogden, and more than one hundred bound volumes of Polk’s state gazetteers and city directories for Logan, Ogden, Provo, and Salt Lake City. Other accessions include microfilm indexes to obituaries in Salt Lake City and Ogden newspapers, a microfilm index to the “Journal History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints,” and microfilm and bound copies of the Salt Lake Herald, 1881–1920.

Western Americana, Marriott Library, University of Utah, has announced the addition of papers of William H. Smart and G. E. Untermann to its collection of Unita Basin manuscript materials. Other accessions include transcripts of oral interviews with Spanish-speaking residents of Utah and neighboring states and with individuals knowledgeable about the history of the Golden Spike National Historic Site; a diary for the years 1878–87 by Sarah Maria Davis Thatcher of Bannock County, Idaho; photographs of Utah Power and Light plants, equipment, and construction; and miscellaneous papers of the Wasatch Mountain Club for the years 1929–75.

Folklorists, writers, scholars, and western history enthusiasts will find a major source of research materials at the Fife Western Folklore Archive, Merrill Library, Utah State University. The collection—amassed by Austin and Alta Fife and opened to the public in 1975—includes seventy bound volumes of research notes, field recordings, tapes of cowboy and western songs, photographs of folk life, instructional materials, indexes and bibliography, and twelve thousand folklore
items turned in by USU students. Dr. Fife is a Fellow of the Utah State Historical Society. Now a professor emeritus at USU, he acts as curator of the collection.

The 1976 Annual Meeting of the Utah State Historical Society will be held September 24–25 at Spanish Fork to commemorate the 200th anniversary of the arrival of the Domínguez-Vélez de Escalante expedition in Utah Valley. A reenactment of the trek and a variety of other activities planned to celebrate the historic event promise to make the Society’s Annual Meeting one of the memorable occasions of the Bicentennial year.
UTAH STATE HISTORICAL SOCIETY  
Department of Development Services  
Division of State History  

BOARD OF STATE HISTORY  
Milton C. Abrams, Smithfield, 1977  
President  
Dello G. Dayton, Ogden, 1979  
Vice President  
Melvin T. Smith, Salt Lake City  
Secretary  
Mrs. Juanita Brooks, St. George, 1977  
Clyde L. Miller, Secretary of State  
Ex officio  
Mrs. Elizabeth Montague, Salt Lake City, 1979  
Mrs. Mabel J. Oliver, Orem, 1980  
Mrs. Helen Z. Papansikolas, Salt Lake City, 1977  
Howard C. Price, Jr., Price, 1979  
Mrs. Elizabeth Skanchy, Midvale, 1977  
Richard O. Ulibarrri, Roy, 1977  

ADMINISTRATION  
Melvin T. Smith, Director  
Stanford J. Layton, Publications Coordinator  
Jay M. Haymond, Librarian  
David B. Madsen, Antiquities Director  

The Utah State Historical Society was organized in 1897 by public-spirited Utahns to collect, preserve, and publish Utah and related history. Today, under state sponsorship, the Society fulfills its obligations by publishing the Utah Historical Quarterly and other historical materials; locating, documenting, and preserving historic and prehistoric buildings and sites; and maintaining a specialized research library. Donations and gifts to the Society's programs or its library are encouraged, for only through such means can it live up to its responsibility of preserving the record of Utah's past.

MEMBERSHIP  
Membership in the Utah State Historical Society is open to all individuals and institutions interested in Utah history. Membership applications and change of address notices should be sent to the membership secretary. Annual dues are: Institutions, $7.00; individuals, $5.00; students, $3.00. Life memberships, $100.00. Tax-deductible donations for special projects of the Society may be made on the following membership basis: sustaining, $250.00; patron, $500.00; benefactor, $1,000.00. Your interest and support are most welcome.