Utah Historical Quarterly was established in 1928 to publish articles, documents, and reviews contributing to knowledge of Utah's history. The Quarterly is published four times a year by the Utah State Historical Society, 300 Rio Grande, Salt Lake City, Utah 84101. Phone (801) 533-6024 for membership and publications information. Members of the Society receive the Quarterly, Beehive History, and the bimonthly Newsletter upon payment of the annual dues: individual, $15.00; institution, $20.00; student and senior citizen (age sixty-five or over), $10.00; contributing, $20.00; sustaining, $25.00; patron, $50.00; business, $100.00.

Materials for publication should be submitted in duplicate accompanied by return postage and should be typed double-space, with footnotes at the end. Authors are encouraged to submit material in a computer-readable form, on 5¼ inch MS-DOS or PC-DOS diskettes, standard ASCII text file. Additional information on requirements is available from the managing editor. Articles represent the views of the author and are not necessarily those of the Utah State Historical Society.

Second class postage is paid at Salt Lake City, Utah.

Postmaster: Send form 3579 (change of address) to Utah Historical Quarterly, 300 Rio Grande, Salt Lake City, Utah 84101.
# Contents

WINTER 1990 / VOLUME 58 / NUMBER 1

**IN THIS ISSUE** .......................................................... 3

**UTAH LAKE: ITS ROLE IN THE PREHISTORY OF UTAH VALLEY** ..... Joel C. Janetaki 5

**MORMON IMMIGRATION IN THE 1860s: THE STORY OF THE CHURCH TRAINS** .................. John K. Hulmston 32

**MINISTERING MINSTRELS: BLACKFACE ENTERTAINMENT IN PIONEER UTAH** ................. Michael Hicks 49

**THE UTAH LETTERS OF ALEXANDER C. BADGER, JR.** ...... Edited by Dennis R. DeFa 64

**LORENZO SNOW'S APPELLATE COURT VICTORY** ....................... Ken Driggs 81

**BOOK REVIEWS** .......................................................... 94

**BOOK NOTICES** .......................................................... 102

---

*The Cover: Webster School Orchestra, October 23, 1907, Shipler Collection, USHS. This Salt Lake City elementary school was located at 429 South 8th East.*

© Copyright 1990
Utah State Historical Society

Loren D. Potter and Charles L. Drake. Lake Powell: Virgin Flow to Dynamo......... Stan Jones 95

Raye C. Ringholz. Uranium Frenzy: Boom and Bust on the Colorado Plateau.... Richard E. Westwood 97


Alan Derickson. Workers’ Health, Workers’ Democracy: The Western Miners’ Struggle, 1891-1925 .... Philip F. Notarianni 100
Letter of Alexander C. Badger, Jr., courtesy of the Missouri Historical Society.

In this issue

Although it is one of the largest freshwater lakes west of the Mississippi, Utah Lake remains overshadowed by the Great Salt Lake. The first article in this issue provides an overdue analysis of Utah Lake’s ecological and cultural history that demonstrates the important economic role the lake has played in the lives of prehistoric and historic peoples. Similarly, the dramatic story of the handcart pioneers has overshadowed the story told in the second article of the church wagon trains—an efficient, highly successful system that brought more than 18,000 LDS converts to Utah in the 1860s. Reams have been filled with the history of theater in pioneer Utah, but blackface minstrels, one of the most popular performances, have not received the attention they deserve; the third article fills a gap in local theatrical history and raises some serious sociological questions about this form of entertainment.

Alexander Badger, an obscure civilian employee of the army, came to Camp Douglas several months after its founding. His letters home, presented in the fourth piece, contain vivid descriptions of stagecoach travel, Salt Lake City, and life at the post by a forgotten eyewitness. The final article concerns Lorenzo Snow, the principal figure in an appellate court decision, In Re Snow, that gave polygamous Mormons one of their few court victories. It is still cited today when prosecutors abuse the law by charging multiple counts for what is essentially a single crime. Oddly, this important case has been largely overlooked by historians until now. As all the articles in this issue illustrate, the overshadowed and overlooked in history have much to tell us about who we are and where we have been.
Utah Valley Prehistoric Sites Mentioned in the Text

Figure 1. All illustrations are courtesy of the author.
Introduction

... the valley and the borders of the lake of the Timpanogos [Utah Lake] ... is the most pleasant, beautiful and fertile in all of New Spain ... The lake and the rivers which empty into the lake abound in many kinds of choice fish; there are to be seen there very large white geese, many varieties of duck, and other kinds of beautiful birds never seen elsewhere; beavers, otters, seals, and other animals which seem to be ermines by the softness and the whiteness of their fur.¹

I was at Utah Lake last week and of all the fisheries I ever saw, that exceeds all. I saw thousands caught by hand, both by Indians and whites. I could buy a hundred, which each weigh a pound, for a piece of tobacco as large as my finger. They simply put their hand into the stream, and throw them out as fast as they can pick them up ... Five thousand barrels of fish might be secured there annually ...²

The above descriptions provide some notion of the tremendous native fishery that once flourished in Utah Lake. This highly productive lake-river system on the eastern perimeter of the Great Basin was a center of human activity and settlement for at least 6,000 years prior to European occupation in 1849. During these millennia, economic emphasis shifted from hunting and gathering of wild foods to farming and back to hunting and gathering, but persisting through these changes fish and other lake-related foods provided a stable foundation for life.

By 1900, only 50 years after the first Mormon settlers moved into the valley, the native fishery was doomed because of over exploitation...

and ill-advised management. Utah Lake has been drastically altered in its chemistry, turbidity, temperature, shoreline, and fish life. It continues to support huge fish populations, but these consist primarily of species introduced in the historic period. The native fishes, which played an important economic role in the lives of prehistoric and historic peoples, are now essentially extinct. This article offers an overview of the lake's ecological and cultural history viewed through the findings of archaeological and ethnohistorical research.

**VALLEY - LAKE ECOLOGY**

Utah Valley sits in the heart of the central Wasatch region of the eastern Great Basin (Figure 1). The valley stretches 50 miles in length from upper Goshen Valley on the southwest to Dry Creek Canyon on the northeast, and nearly 25 miles from Soldiers Pass on the west and lower Hobble Creek Canyon on the east. On the southwest and west edge of the valley lie the East Tintic Mountains; also to the west but closely bordering Utah Lake are the Lake Mountains. To the north and northwest respectively are the low Traverse Mountains and the considerably higher (up to 10,500 feet) Oquirrh Mountains, while to the east the massive Wasatch Front rises dramatically with several peaks in the 12,000-foot range.

The valley bottom, exclusive of the lake, consists of fertile alluvial slopes along the east and west sides of the lake. The wider (up to five miles), gentler east slope is cut by several streams issuing from the Wasatch and broadens into extensive, well-watered flatlands to the northeast, southeast, and southwest (Goshen Valley). Extensive marshes are present in Provo Bay on the east and Goshen Bay on the south, and smaller marsh communities rim the lake's east shore. To the northwest, ephemeral streams drain the Oquirrh Mountains and associated rolling lowlands. The west edge of the valley along the east-facing slopes of the Lake Mountains is less than a mile in width and contains no streams or springs and rather sparse vegetation.

The dominant geographical feature of the valley is Utah Lake. Covering 150 square miles, it is one of the largest freshwater lakes in the United States west of the Mississippi. Like Sevier and Great Salt Lake, Utah Lake is a remnant of a formerly extensive Pleistocene lake system called Lake Bonneville. Unlike the highly saline Sevier and Great Salt lakes, Utah Lake is freshwater due to the presence of a perennial outlet,

---

the Jordan River, which drains into Great Salt Lake 40 miles to the north. The lake is fed by several streams draining the Wasatch Front as well as several large, underwater springs. The primary feeder streams are the American Fork River, Provo River, Hobble Creek, Spanish Fork River, and Currant Creek. The lake is shallow by any standards, averaging only eight feet deep with maximum depths between 15 to 20 feet with the exceptions of some spring holes at the north end. The lake bottom is predominantly mud and organic silt with limited stretches of gravel along the western and southeastern shorelines.

Prior to the introduction of the German carp in the 1880s, pondweed and other forms of vegetation grew thickly in the sheltered coves and bays, providing habitat for the native fish populations and waterfowl as well as a buffer against the turbidity which now is the most visible characteristic of the lake waters. Since 1872 the lake has been controlled to supply water for irrigation in Salt Lake Valley. As a result, lake levels have fluctuated considerably, disturbing or destroying both the critical and fragile shallow-water plant and animal habitat as well as the poorly understood lakeside archaeological sites.

Native Fishes

The economically significant fish in Utah Lake during the prehistoric and early historic times were the Bonneville cutthroat trout, various suckers, Utah chub, and the mountain whitefish. Of the twelve fish species native to the Utah Lake system, eleven are now extremely rare or extinct. The natural history of these fishes is important to the understanding of man's use of these resources. Unfortunately, due to the early and devastating impacts of European exploitation, that information is available only in piecemeal form in the historical records made by nineteenth-century travelers, explorers, and scientists.

The life history of the Bonneville cutthroat is perhaps best told by Yarrow who describes these trout as "undoubtedly the most numerous and the most easily captured" of all the native fishes of Utah. Those trout living in Utah Lake were apparently less spotted, more silvery colored, and attained a much greater size than those found in the surrounding

---

7 H.C. Yarrow, "On the Speckled Trout of Utah," Report of the U.S. Fish Commission 1872 and 1873, Part II (1874): 363-68
rivers and streams. An early report by Sharp recalls catches up to twenty-five pounds, although fifteen pounds was the largest occurring in the 1890s. The greatest size reported by Yarrow is three feet long and fifteen pounds, with the average size about fourteen inches and one and one-half pounds. The trout spawning season varied from year to year depending on the weather conditions but was always in the spring, beginning as early as the middle of March and lasting until the middle of May. Most spawning occurred in the streams, but all Utah Lake fish populations probably contained both lake and stream spawning forms.

The chubs and suckers (sometimes indiscriminately referred to as mullet in the early literature) were also spring spawners. The former began spawning activity in the lake and rivers in April and continued until June. The time of the sucker runs varied by species with the Utah sucker starting in March and the June and webug suckers spawning into June and July. The suckers generally did not go as far up the rivers to spawn as did the trout. Since, like the Bonneville cutthroat, these fish are now rare or extinct in the lake, the average size of chubs and suckers is difficult to determine with any certainty. Folk accounts reminisce about suckers up to twenty-five pounds; however, a more reliable report by Jordan and Gilbert describes five June suckers and one Utah sucker all measuring about eighteen inches in length and weighing two pounds.

---

each, and chubs averaging twelve to fifteen inches long and one to two pounds. Webug suckers were apparently slightly smaller than the other lake suckers and are considered a hybrid between the June sucker and Utah sucker (Figure 2).\textsuperscript{12}

Whitefish, also called mountain herring, were most commonly found in the rivers, especially the Provo. In the lake they were restricted to the mouths of the streams. Whitefish were of approximately the same size as the suckers and chubs, reaching a maximum size of about twenty inches and four pounds but generally were under two pounds. In contrast with other species in the Utah lake-river systems, the whitefish spawned in the late fall, peaking in November. Whitefish were reported as “very abundant” and were common in the catches of early commercial fisherman.\textsuperscript{13}

Abundance estimates of the trout, chubs, and suckers are also limited by the quality of the historic record, but some good data are available. Yarrow, for example, documented catch sizes of early commercial fishermen such as Peter Madsen.\textsuperscript{14} Using nets 500 yards long by eight to ten feet deep (mesh size not noted) Madsen was able to capture 3,500 to 3,700 pounds of trout per haul in the 1860s. If the ratio of chubs and suckers to trout were two to one (a very conservative ratio given the catch composition during the late 1800s)\textsuperscript{15} an additional 7,000 pounds of fish would have been in the nets with each haul. Accounts in the folk tale tradition regarding the abundance of suckers in the lake are rather common and quite impressive, as is the following account of a massive sucker kill in the late 1800s when the lower Provo River was nearly dried up, probably during the spawning season due to irrigation demands: “The lower river down to the lake was full of suckers and it suddenly went dry . . . . We estimated that 1500 tons of suckers had perished in scarcely more than two miles of the channel. In places the fish were piled up several feet deep.”\textsuperscript{16}

The emphasis thus far has been on fish, but many other lake-marsh related plant and animal resources were important to people living in Utah Valley during prehistoric and early historic times. Waterfowl,
including ducks, geese, swans, herons, and others, abounded in the marshy areas and reached a high point during the semiannual migrations. Water-loving mammals, especially muskrat but also beaver, mink, and otter, were common around the lake. Shellfish lived in silty or muddy bottoms in the lake and streams. Although several species were present, only two, *Anadonta* spp. and *Margaritana margaritifera*, are large enough to have been important food items, and the latter was usually not eaten. The remains of *Anadonta* spp., or freshwater clams, are common in silty stretches of the lake shore today.

**Lakeside Vegetation**

As with the fishery, the native vegetation in the valley and around the shores of the lake has been drastically altered in distribution and composition due to development, the introduction of exotic plant species, and introductions of exotic fishes, especially the carp. The intent here is to present a picture of the vegetation surrounding the lake prior to historic disruption, especially those species presumed important to prehistoric inhabitants.

Early reports vary regarding the amount and makeup of plant life around Utah Lake at the time of contact. The Spanish journal mentions “poplar groves” and “alder” trees growing along the Provo River and Hobble Creek and meadows around the lake; Colton notes that the Provo River was wooded with a “heavy growth of cottonwoods and box elder trees . . . .” Others comment that the valley to the east of the lake was broad and grassy, especially in the bottoms, with some sage and bunch grass on the more gravelly benches to the east. John Charles Fremont during a visit to the valley in May of 1844 observed that the “fertile bottoms” along the lake contained stands of “the *kooyah* plant, growing in fields of extraordinary luxuriance” and which afforded the Indians an “abundant supply of food.” *Kooyah* is a Shoshone term for a root plant, perhaps tobacco root.

---

Descriptions of the shore of the lake and the vegetation there are more difficult to obtain. Daniel Potts, visiting the lake in 1827, observed, “We passed through a large swamp of bullrushes, when suddenly the lake presented itself to our view... there is not a tree within three miles.” The Spanish journal says nothing about the shoreline vegetation but does note that the Utes gathered “seeds of wild plants in the bottom.”

Most likely this reference is to the bulrush mentioned by Potts above. This water-loving plant is still abundant along the edge of the lake and is a prolific seed producer, especially alkali bulrush. Also of economic importance to prehistoric peoples was cattail which often grows in dense stands adjacent to the bulrush.

Just offshore and in the sheltered bays along the eastern edge of the lake were beds of pondweed. This water plant played a critical role in the lake’s ecology as beds held the bottom of the lake firm, thereby reducing turbidity and allowing sunlight to filter through for the benefit of the vegetation. At the same time, the pondweed offered cooling shade and clearer water for trout, foraging areas for waterfowl, and shelter for a multitude of smaller life forms. The destruction of many of these beds, which Cottam attributes mostly to the introduction of the carp in the 1880s, had a major negative impact on the lake’s ecology.

In addition to the numerous lakeside and valley bottom plants and animals available to prehistoric peoples, the upland valleys and mountains of the Wasatch Front immediately east contained deer, mountain sheep, probably some elk, and many smaller animals such as rabbits and ground squirrels. Chokecherries and service berries were also abundant in the uplands and were common items in the aboriginal diet. Antelope, jack rabbits, sage grouse, and pinyon nuts, among others, were available in the drier valleys and lower mountain ranges just to the west.

The above descriptions of the resources available adjacent to the lake suggests that it was a dominant factor in Utah Valley’s cultural past. Decisions about settlement location, timing of social gatherings, and trips to collecting grounds were greatly influenced by such events as spawning runs, waterfowl migration patterns, the ripening of seeds, etc. The roles these lacustrine and upland resources played in the lives of the prehistoric occupants is a major topic in the discussion of culture history presented below.

---


PREHISTORY OF UTAH VALLEY

The prehistory of Utah Valley is not evenly known. Early settlers and travelers recognized that the valley had been a region of some importance prior to European contact as they encountered numerous prehistoric remains in the valley, the most notable of which were the mounds in the Provo area. A good early description of these mounds comes from the Wheeler expedition of the 1870s:

West of the town [Provo], on its outskirts and within three or four miles of the lake, are many mounds, of various constructions and in different states of preservation . . . . Those examined were on low grounds, almost on a level with the lake and with Provo River, a mile distant on the north . . . . Northwest of Provo on the level fields, half-way from the town to Utah Lake is a field containing a number of mounds more or less perfectly preserved; some are entirely untouched, except on the outer edges, where the Mormon's grains [ital.] patches encroach upon them; others have been almost completely leveled with the surrounding fields.²⁴

The history of archaeological research in the valley seems to have been largely determined by these initial observations as nearly all researchers have been fascinated with the many mounds that were located along the streams in the valley. Archaeology has determined that these mounds represent a formative or farming adaptation called the Fremont, a fairly restricted temporal period in the prehistory of the eastern Great Basin (see discussion below). Yet, because of the visibility of the mound sites and the often numerous and sometimes intriguing artifact arrays associated with them, archaeologists working in the valley have continued this initial preoccupation with the mounds. More recent research has begun to shift that emphasis to the hunter-gatherer adaptations that characterized human life for several thousand years prior to the Fremont and for several hundred afterwards.²⁵

Regardless, it is assumed that the prehistory of Utah Valley follows that outlined by Jennings for Utah generally.²⁶ Broadly speaking, the culture history of the state breaks into the following: the Archaic period (ca. 10,000 BP to 1,500 BP), the Fremont (1,500 BP to 650 BP), and the

²⁶Jesse D. Jennings, Prehistory of Utah and the Eastern Great Basin, University of Utah Anthropological Papers No. 98 (Salt Lake City, 1978).
Late Prehistoric (650 BP contact). In Utah Valley the importance of the lake and its resources is evident from the earliest period.

**Archaic Period**

Archaeological research at a number of caves sites around the perimeter of the Great Salt Lake and on the Colorado Plateau has shown that Archaic peoples of the eastern Great Basin made a living hunting and gathering a broad spectrum of wild foods. Particularly important were small seeds and nuts (grass seeds, pickleweed, bulrush, etc.) and both large and small animals (mountain sheep, deer, antelope, rabbits, ground squirrels, and others). Seeds were collected in tremendous numbers using baskets of various kinds and were processed into flour with milling stones. Hunting gear consisted of atlatls, nets, snares, and traps. Of these items, baskets, milling stones, atlatl dart points and occasionally atlatls, and fragments of the nets and traps constitute the archaeological residue usually recovered in Archaic sites. Unfortunately, nearly all of our information on the Archaic comes from caves. Although often rich in material culture and faunal and floral remains, caves rarely contain houses and offer only a fragment of the totality of the Archaic strategy. Excavations of open Archaic sites, especially in the valley bottoms, but also upland sites such as Sparrow Hawk in the Oquirrh Mountain, are needed to better understand this very long period of Utah's past.

Interestingly, Aikens and Madsen have suggested that during the earliest portion (11,000–9,500 BP) of Utah’s prehistory, human occupation tended to cluster around lakes. If this were so, remnants of this early period should be present around Utah Lake. Unfortunately, almost nothing is known of the Archaic period in Utah Valley.

Only two sites have been excavated that contain Archaic deposits, American Fork Cave and Spotten Cave, and neither is completely reported. The former is found in American Fork Canyon in a rugged canyon and forest environment. It was initially excavated in the 1930s by two geologists from Brigham Young University. Further tests in the cave during the summer of 1989 by archaeologists from BYU obtained

---


dates from the lower levels of the site documenting man's presence by 3,700 years ago. The earlier excavations removed materials as a single unit with early and late materials mixed together; consequently, none of these recovered remains, including large quantities of bone representing many species, especially mountain sheep and some fish, numerous arrow points (mostly Eastgate-like points which are a Fremont style), and other stone and bone tools, can be associated with a particular time period. Included in the artifact collection was a wooden harpoon. Interestingly, mountain sheep bone was the most abundant and included numerous horn cores. Many of the cores had cut marks at the base, probably from butchering the animal to recover valuable horn sheaths for tool making and the skin for clothing. The evidence from the cave points to its primary use as a base camp from which mountain sheep were hunted in the steep and broken country of American Fork Canyon.

Like American Fork Cave, Spotten Cave is small but is in quite a different setting. The site is in the south end of Utah Valley at the north end of Long Ridge at the lower edge of the pinyon-juniper zone (Figure 3). From the cave mouth one has an unobstructed view of Goshen Valley stretching northward toward the Goshen Bay marshes and, beyond that, the lake. Brigham Young University excavated the site in the
The lowest cultural level of the cave has been dated by Carbon 14 to about 6,000 BP, placing it well within the Archaic period. Those same levels contain, in order of decreasing abundance, the bones of deer, rabbit, waterfowl, fish, muskrat, prairie dog, and antelope in association with several small hearths. Archaic artifactual remains are limited to chipped stone tools, milling stones, etched stone, and worked bone. Although marsh foods, fish, muskrat, etc., are not predominant, it is interesting that they occur in significant numbers at a site a mile and a half from the nearest modern marsh area. Spotted Cave was likely used by Archaic peoples as a temporary stopover as they moved from the Goshen Valley bottoms to the uplands of Long Ridge or the Wasatch Front.

Two other Archaic sites of interest have been recorded in the valley but have not been excavated. One, 12UT142, is located at the Jordan River outlet. Apparently the site contained several projectile points potentially assignable to the Late Archaic, including a number of large Elko-style projectile points, several bifaces, atlatl weights, and several grooved stones. The Hutchings Museum in Lehi also has grooved stones recovered during river channel trenching work in the 42UT142 area (Figure 4).

The other site, 42UT295, is in Goshen Valley. Artifacts attributed to this area were gathered up by the land owner and later photographed...
by surveyors from BYU. Included in the collection were a series of large, impressive bifaces, one of which is reminiscent of a Paleo Indian style, and several grooved stones (similar to those from 42UT142) and perforated stones referred to as sinkers by the surveyors.34

As stated at the onset, little is known of this early period in a region that should have been preferred by hunters and gatherers. The reviewed data from both excavated and more loosely documented contexts provide minimal, but tantalizing, evidence of Archaic use of Utah Lake.

**Fremont**

Between the time of Christ and about A.D. 500 a cultural transition occurred in the eastern Great Basin. At the heart of that transition was the gradual adoption of cultigens, corn, beans and squash, as supplements to wild foods in the diet. Material characteristics of this new strategy are an eclectic architectural style including pit houses and adobe and masonry walled storage structures, ceramics somewhat reminiscent of Anasazi styles, and distinctive clay figurine and rock art styles. By A.D. 700-900 people were practicing this mixed strategy (farming combined with continued dependence on hunting and gathering) throughout much of Utah north of the Colorado and Virgin rivers. This lifeway, which is essentially contemporaneous with the better known Anasazi to the south, has been labeled the Fremont by archaeologists.35

This transition occurred in Utah Valley as well. The reports of early travelers and several archaeological surveys tell us that the valley was populous during this time. Fremont sites were numerous along the old channels of the Provo River, Currant Creek in Goshen Valley, and in West Canyon. Mounds were apparently also present along lower American Fork River and Dry Fork Creek and likely along other smaller streams prior to leveling by farming activities.36 These low mounds were formed by the collapse of adobe-walled surface structures and earth lodges, although many of the sites were located on natural eminences. The actual numbers of mounds will never be known due to their early destruction by development; however, an opportunistic survey by amateurs done in the 1930s documented and located well over 100 in

the west Provo area. Few of these sites have been relocated, although they clearly include the Hinckley and Seamons mounds described below.

Some excavations were done in the 1800s near Payson at the south end of the valley, but the majority of archaeological work on Fremont sites has occurred on the Provo River delta. This region consists of several square miles of flat, fertile land crossed by old meandering channels of the Provo River. Water from springs and runoff still flows through the few existing remnants of these channels supporting micro-marshes along the way. The high ground adjacent to the channels were places often chosen for prehistoric settlement.

The first professional work of this century was done on the farm belonging to the Hinckley family in the 1930s by Julian Steward, then at the University of Utah, and by Albert Reagan of BYU. Excavations continued on the Hinckley property in the 1940s, 50s, and 60s. Also in the 1960s BYU excavated at Seamons Mound located just west of the Hinckley sites. Other reported work in the valley on Fremont sites include survey and excavation in West Canyon in 1966 and survey and excavation in Goshen Valley at Woodard Mound and Spotten Cave in the 1960s and 70s. Because of its considerable distance from the lake the West Canyon work will not be discussed here. During the 1980s additional work was done at Woodard Mound and in west Provo at the Smoking Pipe site.

These sites are plotted on maps compiled by a father and son team, Robert and James Bee, respectively. See James W. Bee and Robert G. Bee, “Archaeological Collection, Utah County, Utah,” notes and map on file, Museum of Peoples and Cultures, Brigham Young University (Provo, 1934-66).


No final site report was prepared on these excavations, although several student papers on the work were prepared, e.g., Rex Madsen, “The Seamons Mound, a Fremont Site in Utah Valley,” MS. on file, Museum of Peoples and Cultures, Brigham Young University (Provo, 1969).


Architectural remains at Fremont sites in the Provo area have been difficult to locate due to the wetness of the soil. However, both Steward and Green uncovered a single shallow, adobe-walled, rectangular house during their excavations. Steward working at the Benson Mound east of the Hinckley sites also found two separate adobe-walled surface rooms similar to those from Fremont sites elsewhere.

Other excavations on the delta were frustrated by limited scope. Many were short term efforts done as part of class projects; consequently, excavation was more individualized than coordinated and features were left unexplored or incompletely defined. This is especially true at Seamons Mound where two large clay-rimmed hearths were uncovered, but the houses that likely were associated were not exposed. Adobe-walled structures likely similar to those excavated by Steward thirty years earlier were also exposed in horizontal plan but apparently not explored and documented. Of importance, however, two cache or refuse pits about two feet deep and three feet across and containing accumulations of fish bone were documented. The remains of a fish “baked in clay” were also found at the site.44

One of the more thorough excavations in the Provo area was done in the 1930s by a father and son team, Robert and James Bee.45 They excavated a mound site immediately north and east of the Seamons Mound and uncovered a clay-rimmed hearth and a large (40” diameter) “cist” with a clay rim similar to the hearth but without evidence of burning. The clay-rimmed features were associated with roof fall and what appears to be a shallow rectangular pithouse.

The material remains recovered from the excavations at the Provo River delta sites are, for the most part, typically Fremont in style. Gray ware ceramics are common as are chipped stone tools including Fremont-style projectile points and grinding implements such as “shelved” metates. Probably the best known finds recovered from the Hinckley sites are a number of clay figurines similar to, but less elaborate than, those recovered from Fremont sites in the central part of the state.46 The Hinckley sites and Seamons Mound have been dated by Carbon 14. Dates range from the 800s A.D. into the 1500s.47 A bone harpoon found at Seamons Mound is important, as it provides evidence

45Bee and Bee, “Archaeological Collection, Utah County, Utah,” various excavation notes.
HINCKLEY SITES and SEAMONS MOUND
NISP = 2331

![Pie chart showing percentages of animal bone recovered from Hinckley sites (42UT110 and 111) and Seamons Mound.]

Figure 5. Percentages of animal bone recovered from the Hinckley sites (42UT110 and 111) and Seamons Mound.

of a specialized technology developed by the Fremont to exploit the lake’s fishery.

Floral and faunal remains which, of course, are important in understanding subsistence are sparse from these sites, as there was little concern with economics during these earlier excavations. Sediments were usually screened and faunal remains were collected, but analysis was limited to listing species present. No attempt was made to look for plant remains. Fortunately, the faunal collections from several of these sites were later reanalyzed and percentages calculated. Figure 5 summarizes those findings and points to fish, birds, deer, and muskrats as important protein sources.

Also on the Provo delta is Smoking Pipe, a Fremont occupation located within Fort Utah State Park. Fremont deposits were noted here in backhoe trenches in 1968 while archaeologists from BYU searched for remains of the original Fort Utah. Some testing was done in piecemeal fashion between 1980 and 1983. However, in 1983 and 1984

———Forsyth, Archaeological Investigations at the Smoking Pipe Site, pp. 1-4.
the site was explored more thoroughly and two trash pits were uncovered. No structures were found, but artifacts are characteristic of the Fremont. The dates from the site span several hundred years between A.D. 1100 and 1500 and suggest some occupation subsequent to the Fremont. Particularly important at Smoking Pipe are the faunal data.\textsuperscript{50} Anticipating the need for finer controls, all sediments were water screened through eighth-inch mesh sieves. As a result, thousands of fish bones were recovered in addition to the remains of a number of bison and other animals (Figure 6). Macrobotanical data collected includes corn, beans, juniper, horsetail rush, and sage.

The other area of emphasis for Fremont research at BYU has been Goshen Valley, especially Woodard Mound. This site, which was one of twenty-one Fremont structural sites documented by Gilsen during the 1960s,\textsuperscript{51} is situated along a low levee adjacent to an abandoned channel of Currant Creek. The Goshen Bay marshes lie about three miles east and south of the site. Early excavations at Woodard Mound suffered problems similar to those described above for the mounds on the old Provo River channels; i.e., they were short term, and although structural

\textsuperscript{50}Scott E. Billat, "A Study of Fremont Subsistence at the Smoking Pipe Site" (M.A. thesis, Brigham Young University, 1985).

evidences and other features were found none appears to have been completely defined or documented during four seasons of work.\textsuperscript{52} One of the more intriguing features encountered was a cache pit sealed with log cribbing and filled with "much decayed materials but nothing recognizable."\textsuperscript{53} Also, as with the early Provo site excavations, little attention was given to subsistence. Gilsen, for example, makes a single passing reference to the "preponderance of fish bones," presumably observed while excavating at Woodard Mound, although this is not clear.

Richens continued research at the site in 1980-81. He located and clearly defined and documented a rectangular pit house with adobe walls, a basin-shaped hearth, a southeast trending ventilator shaft, a number of trash-filled pits inside and outside the house, and a burial under the southwest corner of the structure (Figure 7). The site is dated by Carbon 14 to ca. A.D. 1250 placing it quite late in the Fremont occupation of the valley. Sediments were screened with quarter-inch

\textsuperscript{52} See Richens, "Woodard Mound: Excavations at a Fremont Site," pp. 17-23, for an overview of past research at the site.
WOODARD MOUND
NISP = 670

Figure 8. Percentages of animal bone recovered during 1980-81 excavations at Woodard Mound.

sieves during this work and both animal and plant remains recovered. Faunal remains are dominated by fish, muskrat, and rabbit (Figure 8). The most common plant remains include the small hard seeds of weedy plants such as amaranth and goosefoot, grasses, and bulrush, among others. Analysis of pollen from the site found similar species, but corn was also present.

A number of clay figurine fragments resembling those from the Hinckley mounds were recovered from the Woodard site. More important here, a total of three complete and four probable harpoon fragments were found at the site during the excavations (Figure 9). The complete artifacts show unmistakable roughening at the proximal end for hafting, suggesting they were part of a composite fish spear.

The analysis of the animal bones from several of the Fremont sites excavated in Utah Valley is of interest here not only to document the use of lake and marsh foods but also to demonstrate the contrast in data recovered using differing excavation techniques. Information on plant use is also important to consider, but such data are not equally available and consequently are not presented. Figures 5, 6, and 8 display percentages of the numbers of identifiable specimens (NISP) recovered from Fremont sites in the valley. Figure 5 is a composite that relies on the
research of Cook and presents faunal data from the Provo River delta sites: 42UT110 and 111 on the Hinckley farm site, and Seamon’s Mound (42UT271). Figure 8 displays similar information from the 1980-81 excavations at Woodard Mound. Figure 6 shows the faunal data from Smoking Pipe where sediments were water screened.

The contrast in these charts is impressive. However, it is important to view these with some caution as Woodard Mound is in an ecological context quite different from the Hinckley sites. And Smoking Pipe, although located not far from the Hinckley sites and Seamon’s Mound and dating to roughly the same period, may differ functionally or perhaps seasonally from these sites with known structural remains. Nonetheless, the figures offer some interesting notions of the difference that recovery techniques can make in our understanding of prehistoric diets.

The figures also demonstrate the importance of the lake’s resources to these farming people. Fish appears to have been a dietary staple, especially if the Smoking Pipe data are considered. The presence of harpoons in at least two sites reinforces that conclusion. Muskrat was also clearly important as were waterfowl. At the same time, upland species, rabbits, deer, and bison, were a focus of the hunting activities of the Fremont and played in an important, if somewhat different, role. The impact of a single bison kill in terms of pounds of meat, for example, is certainly much greater that the gathering of hundreds of fish. The difference in these two sources of meat is probably best considered in terms of reliability, with fish and to a lesser extent other small marsh and upland animals providing a food common in the daily diet, while bison and other larger upland mammals represent an occasional capture and a momentary abundance.

Late Prehistoric

The most recent era in eastern Great Basin prehistory is the Late Prehistoric, beginning by about A.D. 1350 and apparently continuing with few changes until the Spanish arrived on the Wasatch Front in 1776. Late Prehistoric peoples of central and northern Utah were hunters and gatherers and are generally considered to be the immediate ancestors of the historic Ute and Shoshone peoples who occupied the Wasatch Front valleys in 1847. Late Prehistoric peoples of southern Utah, such as the Southern Paiute of the St. George Basin, were practicing farming along with hunting and gathering at the time of European contact.

Late Prehistoric adaptations have been largely ignored along the Wasatch until the recent research of Simms on Black Slough near Brigham City and Janetski in Utah Valley. Before 1985 only one Late Prehistoric site (42UT13 at the mouth of the Provo River) had been excavated and reported in Utah Valley. Casual survey of the lake shore by Steward and Reagan in the 1930s discovered that the remains of prehistoric "Shoshonean" peoples were common in that locale. The latter described his findings:

At a dozen locations on the Utah Lake front, a mile lakeward from the usual shore line, the area being left high and dry due to the drought of 1934, the writer found crude pottery which is neither Basket Maker nor Puebloan. ... Associated with these are Shoshonean type arrow points and Shoshonean type metates.

Reagan also reported that a number of the mounds he examined in the Provo River delta area were multicomponent and contained Late Prehistoric artifacts, both pottery and arrow points, overlying earlier Fremont occupations. Both Steward and Reagan were more interested in the Puebloan (Fremont) occupations, however, and did not pursue the Shoshonean remains. Recent surveys of the lake shore and testing of three sites have provided some initial information about Late Prehistoric use of the valley.

An archaeological survey of the lake's edge has shown that Late Prehistoric occupations are common on low beaches along the lake

---

55 The Ute of Utah Valley and their use of the lake are described specifically in several papers by Janetski: e.g., "The Ute of Utah Valley: An Ethnohistoric Study of Lacustrine Adaptation" (Ph.D. diss, University of Utah, 1983) and "The Great Basin Lacustrine Subsistence Pattern."
Prehistory of Utah Valley

Figure 10. Excavations at Heron Springs on the north shore of Utah Lake. Pits are located near crew members.

shore. Characteristic assemblages on these sites include fire-cracked rock, ground stone, pottery, and fragments of large bone, although closer scrutiny often reveals fragment of fish bone and small stone flakes. Larger, probably multiple-use sites appear to be located near the mouths of the streams dumping into the lake.

Two of these lake shore sites, Heron Springs and Sandy Beach, were tested in 1987 and 1988 respectively. Both are located along a sandy stretch of beach on the north shore of Utah Lake. At the time of evacuation Heron Springs was on a beach island bounded by the lake on the south, marsh on the north, and largely covered by dense stands of reed. The site was split by an extinct channel of Spring Creek and marked by a massive old cottonwood encrusted with great blue heron nests (Figure 10). The Sandy Beach site lies along a very sandy section of beach about a half-mile east of the mouth of Dry Fork Creek and two and a half miles west of Heron Springs (Figure 11).

The sites are dated by Carbon 14 to about A.D. 1400. Material remains recovered now appear to be typical of the Late Prehistoric period. Promontory pottery, a crudely made, coarsely tempered ware made into large-mouthed jars, is common, as are slab metates, two-handled manos, Desert Side-notched and Cottonwood Triangular style arrowheads, and bone tools and beads. Also present is a chipped stone
tool unique to Late Prehistoric sites (Figure 12). The function of the tool, which resembles a large-shouldered drill, is not known for certain but may have to do with butchering animals or fish. No evidence of structures has yet been found. Common features, especially at Heron Springs, are pits of varying sizes and small shallow hearths.

Faunal remains at Heron Springs and Sandy Beach, which were excavated using the water screening method and eighth-inch sieves, are still being analyzed. However, initial identifications include a broad array of animals: large quantities of fish (chub, sucker, and trout all in substantial numbers) bone, bison, deer, antelope, mountain sheep, rabbit, beaver, muskrat, carnivores, and birds. Plant remains are still being assessed as well.

Both Heron Springs and Sandy Beach appear to be residential sites used repeatedly for a substantial period of time, perhaps several months, during the year. The pits at Heron Springs likely represent food caches for winter use, suggesting this site was occupied during the winter and perhaps into the spring when spawning fish would have been available in the nearby creek.

Seasonality has not been assessed at Sandy Beach; however, the stratigraphy here offers insights into the history of the lake. The Late Prehistoric cultural deposits lie on beach sand, suggesting that the lake
Prehistory of Utah Valley

Figure 12. Late Prehistoric chipped stone tools from Utah Valley: (a-d) Desert Side-notched arrowheads from Heron Springs and Sandy Beach; (e-f) Cottonwood Triangular arrowheads from Sandy Beach; (g-j) Desert Side-notched and Cottonwood Triangular arrowheads from the Fox Site; (k-l) shouldered drills from Heron Springs and Sandy Beach; (m-n) beaked tools from the Fox Site.
was not too far distant at the time of site use. The fact that no sand appears in the sediments above, in other words, after, the Late Prehistoric use of the beach, is strong evidence that the lake has not inundated this beach since that time. The high water of 1983 flooded the beach and deposited the first layer of sand since A.D. 1400, give or take 100 years.

The third site excavated is the Fox Site located on the bank of the Jordan River about five miles from the lake outlet.\(^5\) It was studied in advance of Jordan River dredging operations in 1985. Dated to about A.D. 1650 by Carbon 14, the Fox Site contrasts markedly with the lake shore residential occupations described above. The deposits contained a narrow range of chipped stone artifacts: Desert Side-notched and Cottonwood Triangular arrow points, beaked tools, and large quantities of debitage, evidencing tool sharpening and modification; and lots of fish bone. Based on minimum number estimates, over 1,000 suckers were represented in the excavated portion of the site. Sucker size ranged from one to two feet in length and one to four pounds.\(^6\) No ceramics or bone tools were found and only a few fragments of ground stone. Hearth or pit features were also absent, although this may be due to historic agricultural activity.

The faunal remains from the Fox Site have been analyzed and are presented in Figure 13. Sediment analysis for plant remains found only a few seeds from weedy plants. The faunal analysis strongly suggests that the site was a temporary fishing camp occupied for a couple of weeks in the spring during the spawning run of Utah suckers. Coring of the river bottom adjacent to the site found gravels suitable for spawning activity. Locals recall rows of sticks visible here in the early days when the river was low.\(^6\) Weirs used by the Utes were described by Stansbury: "At certain times of the year they (the Utes) obtain . . . a considerable quantity of fish, which they take in weirs or traps constructed of willow bushes."\(^6\) Unfortunately, verification of the presence of weirs is no longer possible after the dredging of the river. Regardless, the most plausible interpretation of the site data is that fish were captured in the river using weirs or traps and processed (bones removed) on the bank,

\(^5\) Joel C. Janetski, "The Fox Site: A Late Prehistoric Fishing Camp in Utah Valley" (in preparation).

\(^6\) The sizes were calculated by Dennis Shiozawa of the Zoology Department at BYU. The analysis was done by utilizing multiple regression to compare particular skeletal elements of modern Utah suckers of known sizes and weights with skeletal elements of Utah suckers recovered from the Fox Site.


\(^6\) Stansbury, An Expedition to the Valley of the Great Salt Lake of Utah, p. 148.
Figure 13. Percentages of animal bone recovered from the Fox Site.

perhaps preparatory to drying. Once the spawning season had passed, the site was abandoned.

As with the Fremont, the Late Prehistoric hunters and gatherers were heavily exploiting the lake's bounties. Fish continued to be a staple along with the now-familiar array of animals and plants. Interestingly, no harpoons are known from Late Prehistoric sites; however, this may simply be a function of preservation as Ute ethnographies describe various wooden fishing implements.\(^6\) The wooden harpoon from American Fork Cave is archaeological evidence of the use of wood for such tools.

The Late Prehistoric focus on the lake is especially evident in the settlement patterns. Long-term camps, as evidenced by developed middens, wide artifact arrays, and cache pits, are located close to the lake. Although the data are not yet analyzed, it is likely that those camps were used during the winter and into the spring. Specialized sites in the bottoms (the Fox Site) and uplands (e.g., Sparrow Hawk and American Fork Cache) were occupied for short periods for more specific purposes.

\(^6\)For example see Ann M. Smith, *Ethnography of the Northern Ute*, University of New Mexico Papers in Anthropology No. 17 (Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1974), p. 62.
This discussion has drawn attention to cultural continuities as well as dramatic change in adaptive patterns in the prehistoric use of Utah Valley. The shift from the Archaic hunting and gathering way of life to the mixed farming and hunting and gathering pattern of the Fremont was likely gradual, but we know so little about the former that the two are difficult to contrast.

The change from the Fremont to the Late Prehistoric is better known. Preferred locations for residential settlements changed from stream side for the Fremont to lake shore for the late hunters and gatherers. During the Late Prehistoric period farming was abandoned as were pit houses and adobe-walled surface storage units. The sophisticated ceramics of the Fremont were replaced by crudely made Promontory pottery; arrow point styles, the shapes of stone tools, and grinding implements all changed noticeably. Explanations for these changes, which appear to have occurred over a relatively short period (ca. 100 years between A.D. 1250 and 1350), are beyond the scope of this paper, but a replacement of people seems most reasonable with the data at hand.

The use of the resources of the lake is a common denominator throughout the 6,000 or more years of prehistory in Utah Valley. Careful archaeological excavation and analysis has shown that fish, along with other water-loving animals and plants such as bulrush, were especially important in the diet of valley occupants. It should be noted that bulrush also served non-dietary functions for the Ute and perhaps for the prehistoric people as well. Daniel Potts, who visited the valley in 1827, states that the Utes lived in “buildings constructed of bulrushes, resembling muskrat houses.” This description fits the style of house or wickiup common to the northern Paiute of western Nevada who also lived in the vicinity of marshes. Bulrush stems were cut and tied together in bundles and laid or tied shingle fashion to a dome-shaped willow-pole superstructure. In addition, bulrush was used by the Utes to construct rafts for fishing and probably for waterfowl hunting.

Utah Lake also provided important protein for the early settlers in the valley. Unfortunately, the lake has been overexploited during the
Prehistory of Utah Valley

historic period. During our short tenure here the native fish popu-
lations have declined or been exterminated. Attempts to rejuvenate the
fishery with introduced species were often disastrous. Pollution is
rampant. A walk along the populated east shore is not pleasant. Trash of
all kind, old chairs, car bodies, tires, bottles, decaying carcasses of farm
animals, industrial residue, and other unsightly, often smelly, messes
line the shore wherever there is easy access. A lake that endured for
millennia has been ecologically devasted within 150 years.

Once away from the access points the trash largely disappears.
Beaches are often clean and, in places, sandy. Occasional dense clumps
of reed and cattails offer a backdrop to the ubiquitous stands of bulrush
that mark the higher ground and old beach lines. Flights of stately
pelicans soar over the open water of the lake while clouds of smaller
waterfowl, snipe, avocets, teal, and other shore birds swarm in the
shallows. Substantial populations of introduced fish species, many of
them game fish (white bass, catfish, walleye, and others), as well as carp,
live in the lake. The lake is still incredibly vibrant and alive despite the
abuses it has sustained over the last century and a half.

But Utah Lake needs protection and wise management if it is to
continue to be viable. Assuredly, the indigenous fishery will never be
restored, but the pollution can be controlled and perhaps the modern
fishery stabilized. The cultural resources, such as those discussed here,
need to be identified and protected from the swarms of hobbyists who
scour the lake edge sites after every storm. The lake that has offered
sustenance to the people of Utah Valley and beyond for thousands of
years can continue to be productive but only if we become wiser
stewards. Preservation of this priceless resource is possible, but that goal
depends on understanding the lake’s ecological history, a story at least
partially available through archaeological study.
Mormon Immigration in the 1860s: The Story of the Church Trains

By John K. Hulmston

Immigrant wagons and stock in Echo Canyon, ca. 1866, en route to Salt Lake City, USHS collections.

In 1860, thirteen years after the first Mormon immigrant company rolled into the Salt Lake Valley, Brigham Young and his counselors debated both the reliability and efficiency of using handcarts to transport new converts from eastern points to Utah. Although handcarts were modestly successful, a greater effort was needed to increase the

Mr. Hulmston is an archivist with the Utah Division of Archives and Records Service.
number of immigrants making the pilgrimage to the new gathering place of the Saints. As a result, in the fall of 1860 the church announced a new method of travel for converts would commence the following spring. In lieu of handcarts, church trains comprised of ox-driven wagons would be sent from Salt Lake City to the Missouri River to pick up waiting converts and then return to the valley in the same season. Although many were skeptical in the beginning, Young finally convinced his counselors to support the new church train system.

During the transitional period between using handcarts and church trains, two significant events solidified church support for the church trains. In 1859 and again in 1860 two prominent Mormons—Feramorz Little and Joseph W. Young—made successful freighting journeys to and from the Missouri River in one season. Once thought to be impossible, Little and Young’s accomplishments provided the linchpin in Brigham Young’s final argument for implementing the new immigration system. Their prudent selection and care of draft animals enabled Little and Young to prove beyond doubt that single-season trips to the Missouri River and back were feasible and provided the breakthrough necessary for the ultimate success of the church trains. Using the same methods, thousands of new converts were able to immigrate to Utah at an affordable cost to the church.

Three other factors also favored the new idea. The Perpetual Emigrating Fund Company accounts were improving by the early 1860s; there was a surfeit of oxen in the territory; and it had become obvious to church authorities that a better method of immigration was needed.¹

Once the decision to shift to church trains was made, the task of organization began. During a series of meetings in the winter of 1860-61 Brigham Young and bishops representing every ward laid the foundation for the new system; each ward in the territory was to furnish a specific number of men and wagons, flour, and other provisions. Because the economic resources of each ward varied considerably, the leadership agreed with Presiding Bishop Edward Hunter's suggestion that each ward supply the system with provisions based on its particular economic capabilities. 

This pattern was followed the six seasons church trains were sent east to gather converts.

At the beginning of each immigration season captains supervised the formation of church train companies preparing to depart from Salt Lake City. They oversaw the arrangement and loading of each team assigned to their outfits. Following a thorough inspection of every wagon the captain would signal his teamsters to roll out toward the Missouri River.

At the same time, there was a need to coordinate the work of outfitting stations in Salt Lake City with those located on the Missouri River. Prior to each season the church sent agents to the Missouri to manage the eastern end of the system. These agents housed and fed the converts until they could be assigned to incoming church train outfits. The agents also purchased wagons, oxen, and provisions for independent Mormon immigrants.

The efficient management of the eastern terminals by outstanding agents such as Joseph W. Young, Feramorz Little, Nathaniel Jones, Jacob Gates, and Thomas Taylor was an important factor in making the church trains successful in their six years of operation. During that time they assigned more than 20,000 converts to church train companies.

Brigham Young outlined the plan in specific terms on February 18, 1861. Church members quickly responded to his call for donations of cattle, flour, bacon, wagons, whips, clothing, and other provisions. Some gave entire wardrobes, while the less fortunate donated as little as a single pair of boots. An interesting variety of goods poured into Salt Lake City from outlying stakes and wards. Rather than donating a wagon, oxen, or flour, Arthur Jones gave gallon kegs of "Moon's very
best valley tan whiskey" in order to "ward off the biting cold after fording the many streams along the way." Cache Valley resident O. J. Beach donated one oxen, and his neighbor J. Goodwin furnished a Chicago wagon complete with cover. J. P. Wright stated that he did not have any oxen to donate but that he "would do all he could." The important thing to note is not the quantity of goods provided but the intense involvement of almost every church member. This extensive participation not only provided supplies but also generated a genuine feeling of social cohesion among Mormons throughout the Great Basin.5

Reaction to the new system among the bishops was mixed. President Young expressed his full endorsement and urged the bishops to support it. In contrast, Leonard W. Hardy, a counselor in the church’s presiding bishopric, argued that to send teams east in the great numbers suggested by the president would require a tremendous exertion and place a heavy burden on many of the poor settlements in the territory. His comments were followed by a spirited exchange of views with most bishops supporting the plan.

The bishops met frequently in the months prior to each immigration season to assess collectively each ward’s quota of supplies, but the selection of men to actually run the system on the trail was delegated to individual ward bishops.6 Captains came from the highest ranks of Mormon society.

Each of the thirty-three captains who led church train companies held a position in the high priesthood. As L. W. Hardy noted, it was essential that captains be experienced and capable leaders because of the great responsibilities they would assume. An excellent example of the high caliber of men chosen is John Riggs Murdock. This Millard County resident was one of the most able company commanders to cross the mountains and plains. A veteran teamster with years of experience, Murdock captained five church train companies both to and from the Missouri River and established one of the best reputations as a competent leader. As he himself boasted, "I think I am safe in saying that I brought more emigrants to Utah than did any other man. I was also successful with my teams and lost but very few."7

---

6Hunter, Minutes, January 17, 31, and February 14, 1861, 325-29.
In addition to the captain, who was in complete command, the staff of a typical church train company consisted of an assistant captain, at least one teamster per wagon, a captain of the night guard, a commissary chief, a chaplain, a clerk, and several night guards. A company of fifty wagons was staffed by approximately fifty-five men.

A key member of the church train staff, a teamster was usually young, single, and more often than not had lived in the valley less than five years. But he was an expert cattleman who had the important responsibility of caring for his yoke of oxen to ensure their good health for the arduous journey. His other responsibilities included general maintenance duties such as greasing axles and inspecting wheels for signs of stress each night before retiring. In the early morning hours teamsters could be seen picking their own yoke of cattle from among the many in the corral. The corral was the special preserve of the teamster and he performed most of his maintenance chores within its circle.

Before they could be yoked and hitched the cattle had to be driven into the corral, and this duty fell to the four to six night herders assigned to each company. In addition, they were responsible for guarding the cattle at night and staying alert for any possible outside threat. After working all night the herders would try to sleep in the loaded wagons. Not surprisingly, one night herder complained that during his journey across the plains he “slept but very little night or day for six weeks.”

Each company also had a commissary officer responsible for its supply of food. Usually six people formed a mess, and the commissary chief parceled out food to these groups. John Lingren, the commissary chief in John F. Sanders’s 1863 company, disbursed flour, bacon, and soda twice a week to each group. Proper management of the food supply was critical to the success of each church train company.

Once the organization of personnel took place, the problem of compensation had to be addressed. The bishops discussed at length not only how the captains, teamsters, and others would be paid but also how much should be given to those who furnished teams and other provisions to the system. Following vigorous debate, Bishop John Woolley offered a solution that garnered wide support. Under this uniform compensation plan the bishops agreed to pay captains one

---

8William Lindsay, Autobiography, p. 276, LDS Church Library-Archives; Tanner, Biographical Sketch of John R. Murdoch, p. 140.
9Manuscript History of Brigham Young, February 28, 1861, LDS Church Library-Archives; Lindsay, Autobiography, p. 276.
dollar per day plus rations; teamsters, herders, and others would receive ten dollars for each trip east and back. It is important to note here that very little money actually changed hands. Instead, payment was rendered through credits to individual labor tithing accounts.\(^\text{11}\)

Outfitting the trains came next. Although both horses and mules were utilized on occasion, most of the Mormon companies were outfitted with oxen because they were less expensive and by 1861 were becoming numerous in Utah. In addition, they needed less care than horses or mules and could graze on a wider variety of grasses and shrubs. They were also less dependent upon grain supplements. Consequently, the bishops agreed to make oxen the primary draft animals of the church trains.\(^\text{12}\)

In keeping with Brigham Young’s epistle of February 28, 1861, each wagon was to contain one tar can or keg, at least one gallon of wagon grease, and two whip lashes with buckskin—one to splice, the other to be used as a cracker. Each teamster was responsible for provisioning his wagon. For example, each was to secure 250 pounds of flour, 40 pounds of both bacon and dried beef, 10 pounds of sugar, 4 pounds each of coffee and yeast cake, 1 pound of tea, 4 quarts of beans, 1 bar of soap, and as much butter as possible. In addition, each wagon carried some pickles, 1 two-gallon water container, 1 gallon of vinegar, and, most important, a generous supply of salt. For personal comfort each teamster took a buffalo robe, 2 wool blankets, 2 pairs of boots or shoes, 5 pairs of socks, 3 sets of pants, 6 shirts, 3 overshirts, a heavy coat, a sewing kit for mending clothes and wagon covers, and finally, 1 good weapon, preferably a double-barreled shotgun, with an abundant amount of powder balls and shot.\(^\text{13}\)

Following a final inspection church train companies rendezvoused at the mouth of Parley’s Canyon in preparation for the overland journey to the Missouri River. As long as the departure points for immigrating Mormons were located on the Missouri River (1861-66), church train captains left Salt Lake City in April when the feed for livestock was plentiful.

The centralized organization of the church trains formulated by the first presidency, the presiding bishopric, and ward bishops from throughout the territory facilitated implementation and surely enabled

\(^{11}\text{Hunter, Minutes, January 31, 1861, 326-30; February 14, 1861, 345.}\)

\(^{12}\text{Manuscript History of Brigham Young, February 28, 1861, 345.}\)

\(^{13}\text{Journal History, February 28, 1861, 3-4.}\)
the church to manage the wagon train system more economically and expeditiously. When the first phase, organizing the Salt Lake Valley end, was complete the church tackled the second phase, organization at the eastern end of the trail. Characteristically, the church leadership commenced this task immediately and with a sense of destiny, of fulfilling their duty to build up the “kingdom of God on earth.”

The outfitting towns on the banks of the Missouri River and at selected sites along the Mormon Trail were crucial to the church train system. Since 1847 the Mormons had used several small communities as outfitting points. During the 1860s they set up facilities at five successive locations—Florence, Wyoming, and North Platte in Nebraska Territory and Laramie and Benton in Wyoming Territory. Florence served as the departure point for the first three years of church train immigration. In 1860 this small town boasted only twelve permanent structures, but new buildings were erected constantly so that by 1861 a hotel, sawmill, and supply store were all in operation. Then, in April 1864 Brigham Young announced that the church was abandoning Florence in favor of a new location forty miles to the south. So, Wyoming, Nebraska Territory, became the focal point for Mormons on their way to Utah during 1864-66. In part, the move came from a desire by the church to find a more isolated outpost away from the corrupting influences of a growing gentile population. Equally important, Wyoming’s location on the western side of the Missouri River eliminated the difficulty of fording the giant waterway with the ox trains. Moreover, the overland journey to Utah, plus the distance river steamers had to travel from St. Joseph, Missouri, was reduced by approximately ten miles.14

For three years following the Civil War, Mormon departure centers followed the path of the Union Pacific Railroad as it was built westward. By 1866 workers had extended it into the heart of Nebraska Territory to North Platte. In the final year of the church trains (1868) Mormons utilized two departure points. The railroad builders, moving swiftly across the broad, level plains of southern Wyoming Territory, reached the young city of Laramie by the spring of 1868. The Mormons organized wagon trains here for three months.15 Pulling up stakes in Laramie, the Mormons next moved their terminal even closer to the Salt Lake Valley, and for the remaining nine months of 1868 the railroad

---

14 Andrew Jenson, “Latter-day Saints Emigration from Wyoming, Nebraska,” *Nebraska History Magazine* 17 (April-June 1936): 113.
15 John Hanson Beadle, *The Undeveloped West; or, Five Years in the Territories…* (Philadelphia, 1873), p. 87.
town of Benton City, Wyoming Territory, served as the departure point for Utah-bound immigrants. Located 125 miles west of Laramie, Benton City proved to be the last outfitting post employed by the church. In 1869 the Union Pacific Railroad linked up with the Central Pacific; from that day forward immigrants traveled west by rail.

With the completion of the organizational apparatus of the church train system, the leadership moved quickly to form companies for the journey to and from the Missouri River. As with most untested programs, however, unforeseen problems occurred as the nascent system became fully operational. For the first few seasons the church train system was modified to adapt to changing circumstances.

The most obvious event during the era of church train service was the American Civil War. Although Utah Territory had few official responsibilities during the conflict, the war did have a direct effect on immigration from the Missouri River. Since the Union Army had concentrated most of its resources toward the suppression of the rebelling southern states, Indian depredations increased along the immigrant routes to the West. In response, Abraham Lincoln in the spring of 1862 called on Brigham Young to raise a company of mounted men to guard the overland mail route.16

In addition to the difficulties created by the Civil War, the church faced manpower shortages. This problem was solved by sending missionaries with church train companies on the first leg of their journey to permanent mission stations in the eastern states and Europe. These missionaries served as teamsters, night herders, or commissary chiefs for many of the trains heading east to the Missouri River. Returning missionaries fulfilled similar duties for westbound wagon trains. There is no evidence that women served in any of the aforementioned categories; however, when called upon they did drive teams and wagons to the Salt Lake Valley in addition to their other duties. In contrast, immigrant males (regardless of experience) performed all trail duties except captain.

Cooperation and instruction from seasoned veterans of the trail helped to facilitate the transition to trail life for new Americans.17 To further reduce the possibility of conflict and to promote both discipline and conformity while on the trail, a system of trail procedures developed over the years was incorporated by church train com-

---

16 See for example Edward W. Tullidge, The History of Salt Lake City and Its Founders (Salt Lake City, 1886), pp. 250-54.
manders. Immigrants in 1861 adhered to at least twenty different rules adopted into the daily routine of the companies.

Once on the trail each company established a daily routine that it maintained for the entire journey. Church trains averaged from fifteen to twenty-five miles per day and took evenly spaced breaks for the care and feeding of both humans and livestock. This mileage was a significant improvement over both the pioneer expedition of 1847 and the handcart method of the 1850s. The average daily progress of the former was just over nine miles per day, and the latter ranged from ten to fourteen miles per day. Church trains bound for the Missouri River from the Salt Lake Valley initially required an average of four to six weeks to complete the journey. In contrast, fully loaded immigrant trains averaged ten to twelve weeks on the return trip.

Since there was a constant need to repair broken axles and disabled wagons and to care for the animals, leaders set aside specific times for these duties during the day. In the morning companies frequently halted after advancing only two to three miles in order to water and rest the cattle. At noon church trains paused for at least two hours so that livestock could be unyoked and permitted to graze. This was followed in the afternoon by two additional breaks—a one-hour delay in the midafternoon and a two-hour hiatus in the late afternoon. By the time the immigrant trains had completed their final break scouts previously sent out to locate a suitable night camp had returned, and the company traveled the remaining distance to the designated rest area. Close to dusk the travelers kept busy arranging night guard assignments, attending to cooking chores, gathering wood, and preparing for the next day’s journey. Shortly after the evening meal a horn sounded, indicating it was time to retire for the night.

The first church train company to set out from Salt Lake City was commanded by David H. Cannon. Leaving the Great Basin on April 23, 1861, Cannon reached Florence, Nebraska Territory, in less than five weeks. The initial company of 225 immigrants departed from Florence on May 29 with 57 wagons. Cannon estimated they would arrive in the valley in mid-August. Following him in succession were the companies led by Ira Eldredge, Joseph Horne, John R. Murdock, and, finally, Joseph W. Young.


Mormon immigrants on the plains, 1866, were photographed by Charles R. Savage. USHS collections.

Despite the fear generated by the Civil War, the possibility of Indian hostilities, and the general apprehension of church leaders anxious to see their new immigration system succeed, the first year’s totals surpassed even their most enthusiastic expectations. The five church train companies with 200 wagons and 2,200 oxen brought 2,556 Saints into the Salt Lake Valley in 1861. In addition, the trains had carried 150,000 pounds of flour east and returned with essential goods.

Brigham Young expressed his elation at the success of the first year’s venture in a letter to the British Mission in late September 1861. He noted that the cattle sent east from Utah fared much better, had fewer deaths, and in general looked better that the animals previously purchased from eastern suppliers. In addition, he related that the five captains and their companies were pleased with each other and got along harmoniously. More significant, Young stated that 1861 had been the best season to date for gathering converts to Utah. The gamble had paid off. Church trains became the chief method of transporting migrating Mormons to the Salt Lake Valley until the completion of the transcontinental railroad at Promontory, Utah Territory, in 1869.

Bolstered by the notable success of the first year, church authorities felt extremely optimistic about the 1862 season. They estimated that nearly 5,000 Saints—almost double the 1861 figure—could be gathered in 1862. With so many European Saints coming to Utah church officials
worried about the possible negative impact such a large migration would have on the overseas missions. But this was clearly a minor concern as evidenced by the church’s steady encouragement of European Mormons to immigrate to Utah.²⁰

The men called to serve as company captains for 1862 included Homer Duncan; John R. Murdock, who was making his second trip; Joseph Horne, making his second and last trek to the Missouri River as a commander; Ansel P. Harmon; Henry W. Miller; William H. Dame; and Horton D. Haight, who was to be second only to Murdock in the number of church trains he would take east.

The excessive optimism that launched the 1862 immigration season rose ever higher with the success of the first church train company that entered the valley on September 24. Homer Duncan had piloted a company of 500 converts across the plains and mountains in the remarkable time of sixty-five days. On the negative side, excessive and persistent rain plagued immigrant trains during the 1862 season. Due to an unusually wet winter and spring nearly every river and stream along the trail had risen above flood stage, making fording difficult at best and causing lengthy delays. The rivers and streams in the Rocky Mountains, particularly the Wasatch range, were no exception. Duncan’s train had been forced to delay its departure from the Salt Lake Valley for two days while the steep canyon road dried sufficiently to permit travel. Teamster Frank Bradshaw complained that his oxen had “performed their part well, (even though) one-third of the way was as much by water as by land.” Indeed, the wet weather affected every church train company that left Salt Lake City during 1862 by delaying departure times and extending the length of time trains were out on the trail by as much as fourteen days.²¹

The unusually wet weather had positive attributes, however, the most important being a proliferation of wild plants and berries along the trail—a welcome supplement to the immigrant diet of bread products, bacon, dried peaches and apples, and brown sugar. Immigrants discovered that wild currants and buffalo berries were abundant in 1862. They made pies and puddings from wild berries and took advantage of the copious prickly pear cacti by stripping the needles and skin and eating it like fruit. It should be noted here that teamsters often supplemented the traveler’s diet with fresh buffalo and antelope

²⁰Millennial Star 23 (1861): 566.
²¹Journal History, September 24, 1862, 5-6; Millennial Star 24 (1862): 173.
meat which, together with extra domestic cattle transported by most companies, generally provided the immigrants with a reasonably well-balanced diet. This was a significant achievement in itself, for one of the most difficult obstacles church leaders had faced in formulating the new system was the enormous logistical problem of supplying thousands of immigrants with food at the right time and place.²²

The optimism expressed by church leaders at the start of the 1862 season was not entirely misplaced. Indeed, the year’s immigration totals were significantly higher than the previous year. The church trains assisted close to 3,000 Saints from Europe and the United States in 1862 and employed 2,880 oxen and 262 wagons. The seven companies carried 143,315 pounds of flour. Except for the tonnage in flour, the church trains were larger in every other category compared with the 1861 season. Church leaders looked to the 1863 season with even greater expectations.

As the new immigration season approached, John R. Murdock, John F. Sanders, William B. Preston, Peter Nebeker, Daniel D. McArthur, Horton D. Haight, John W. Woolley, Thomas E. Ricks, Rosel Hyde, and Samuel D. White were chosen to lead companies. They made their way to the Missouri River amid persistent rumors of hostile Indian activity. Feramorz Little, immigration agent in Florence, warned teamster John Young that the Sioux were on a war footing and that captains and teamsters should take extra precautions in protecting their livestock and provisions. Little guaranteed that four additional horsemen from Utah would be attached to the company for use as night guards and scouts; however, as the church train pressed closer to the Sioux hunting grounds, the guards Little had promised failed to appear. Still, Murdock traveled cautiously forward, passing the large bend in the Platte River twenty-five miles west of Ash Hollow. While at the Big Bend campsite, a squad of Union soldiers approached with the warning that “the devil was let loose”—meaning that Sitting Bull was again warring against the white man. In spite of this alarming information, Murdock continued on, finally arriving in Salt Lake City on August 29 where he reported with great relief that he had not experienced any form of harassment from the Sioux.

The second church train company, piloted by John F. Sanders, had no trouble with Indians but experienced problems with cattle. Starting from Florence with 398 oxen, 5 horses, and 55 wagons, the captain

reported that his animals had not weathered the journey very well and were generally in poor condition by the time they reached the Salt Lake Valley on September 5, 1863. The poor condition of the oxen was attributed to the inexperience of the immigrants, most of whom were Scandinavian, who drove them too harshly.\textsuperscript{23}

As the last three companies rolled into the valley Brigham Young and his counselors had genuine reason for jubilation. The people in Utah had sacrificed a great deal during the first three years that church trains traveled to and from the Missouri River. In a community with a primarily agricultural economic base, the constant need for manpower to run the immigration system created hardships for those whose husbands, fathers, and brothers were away for long periods of time. But the numbers justified Young's elation. The totals for 1863 showed an increase in every category over 1862. Of the 3,646 converts who had been assisted to the Great Basin, 2,117 were from the British Isles, 1,428 were natives of Scandinavian countries, and 83 claimed Germany, France, Switzerland, Poland, or Italy as their native countries.\textsuperscript{24}

The final phase of church train immigration spanned the five-year period beginning in 1864 and ending in late 1868. Although the church was unable to outfit companies in 1865 and 1867 because of the Black Hawk War in Utah, nevertheless, during the last three years church trains operated (1864, 1866, 1868), the number of immigrants gathered to Utah nearly equaled the success experienced during the first three years of the system.\textsuperscript{25}

In 1864, the last full year of the Civil War, six church trains left Salt Lake City for Wyoming, Nebraska Territory. Captains were John R. Murdock, William Preston, Joseph S. Rawlins, William S. Warren, Issac Canfield, and William Hyde. These capable leaders helped to gather Mormons from the United Kingdom, continental Europe, Russia, and the United States. Combined, the six companies used 1,717 oxen, 58 horses, 170 wagons, and 28 mules. An estimated 150,000 pounds of flour were hauled to storage points along the trail, such as Ash Hollow, and to the outfitting terminal at Wyoming.

While some companies experienced little or no hostility from warring Indians, Sioux activity continued to increase in both violence and number of incidents during the last two years of the Civil War.

\textsuperscript{24} Millennial Star, 25 (1863): 640; James A. Little, Biographical Sketch of Feramorz Little (Salt Lake City, 1890) p. 66; Jenson, Church Chronology, p. 70.
\textsuperscript{25} Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom, p. 208; Jenson, Church Chronology, pp. 65-70.
Antagonism toward the white man from Cheyenne and Sioux Indians escalated throughout the decade of the 1860s as the overland trails became flooded with immigrants rushing into the western frontier.

In spite of Indian depredations in the Powder River region, disease, and foul weather, church authorities considered 1864 successful. Not as many Saints immigrated in 1864 as in the previous year, but the cumulative total of converts gathered and goods donated still amounted to impressive numbers.

At the beginning of 1865 British Saints were informed that no church trains would operate that year. The church said it needed a year-long hiatus for rebuilding stock herds vastly depleted during the four previous immigration seasons. While this reasoning certainly had validity, the church failed to include in its official statement the negative impact of the Civil War and the initiation of Indian hostilities in the central and southern sections of Utah Territory. As to the former, it had become even more difficult for the church’s New York immigration agent to secure suitable landing points along the East Coast, but authorities thought that the problem would ease with the impending defeat of the Confederate Army. More significant was the outbreak of the Black Hawk War in Utah in April 1865. A comprehensive study of this conflict is inappropriate here, but suffice it to say that during the period of hostilities, the settlers in this region suffered enormously—in terms of expenditures, manpower, and the loss of livestock. Indeed, the loss of cattle and the need for manpower in the territory were the direct causes of the church’s inability to send trains east in 1865 and 1867.26

Indian wars notwithstanding, the church leadership felt in 1866 that they could not delay the resumption of the church train immigration for another year. Consequently, Brigham Young announced that ten companies would be sent to the outfitting town of Wyoming to assist immigrants to Utah. The call for 515 men, 3,042 oxen, 89 horses, 134 mules, and 397 wagons, plus an estimated 250,000 pounds of flour, seems incredible considering the territory was engaged in a costly Indian war.

Called as company leaders in 1866 were Thomas E. Ricks, Samuel D. White, William H. Chipman, John D. Holladay, Peter Nebeke, Daniel Thompson, Joseph S. Rawlins, Andrew H. Scott, Horton D. Haight, and Abner Lowry. These ten brought a total of 3,335 Saints to the valley, second only to the 1863 high of 3,697 converts.

26Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, p. 364.
By 1866 church trains were making the trip east and back on the average of 120 days, leaving the Salt Lake Valley in late April, they arrived in Wyoming by late June or early July. After organizing at the outfitting station, captains returned to the Great Basin as quickly as possible. This trip usually took experienced captains from 60 to 65 days. The time steadily diminished as the end of the Civil War freed the Union Pacific Railroad to extend its track west, bringing the outfitting posts closer to Utah. Evidence of the reduction of time spent on the trail came from the first church train of the 1866 season. On July 6 Thomas Ricks’s company of 251 Saints departed from Wyoming with 46 wagons pulled by 194 oxen. It arrived in the Salt Lake Valley on September 4—60 days later.26

The 1866 immigration season ended on a tragic note when Captain Abner Lowry’s company was ravaged by cholera. Actually, the cholera outbreak had first appeared on the immigrant ship *Cavour* while it was still on the Atlantic Ocean. By the time the group reached the outfitting station at Wyoming in early August it was too late in the season to allow the weakened Saints the recuperative period they required. The catastrophic result was that seventy-one converts (mostly Scandinavian) died before reaching the piedmont of the Rocky Mountains.

In spite of the devastating toll to the Lowry company the 1866 immigration season can be viewed as successful. More Saints crossed the plains and mountains than in any previous season except 1863. The strenuous effort put forth by both the leaders and members of the church resulted in the gathering of 3,335 converts and was essential in making the year’s immigration a fruitful endeavor.27

In 1868 Brigham Young announced that an immense gathering effort would be made; and, in response, ten church train companies were organized under the leadership of captains Chester Loveland, Joseph S. Rawlins, John R. Murdock, Horton B. Haight, Warren S. Seeley, Simpson A. Molen, Daniel D. McArthur, John Gillespie, John G. Holman, and Edward T. Mumford.

Interestingly, Loveland, Rawlins, Murdock, and Mumford piloted mule trains rather than ox trains. Usually six mules were hitched to each wagon instead of the standard four-yoke hook-up of the church bull teams. Among other things, the use of mules by four companies provides evidence of a heavy loss of oxen during Indian skirmishes in

---

27Young, *History*, p. 366; Journal History, October 22, 1866.
Utah in both 1865 and 1867. There is also evidence that Brigham Young wanted to reduce the time church companies spent on the trail in order to minimize the mortality rate from disease and to eliminate as much as possible the Indian depredations in the Powder River region. By shifting to mules church train companies could accomplish both goals. Indeed, mule trains reduced the time spent on the trail by almost ten days.29

With the railroad rapidly advancing west in 1868 the church was afforded extra time to prepare for the immigration before sending teams to both Laramie and Benton. Rather than setting out in late April, captains could delay their departure from the valley until mid-June.

In late September 1868 a significant event took place. Edward T. Mumford, who piloted the final small church train company into the Salt Lake Valley, accomplished the trek with no accidents or injuries in twenty-four days. With little fanfare, the Mumford company rolled into town on September 24. What went unnoticed by the new immigrants, including Mumford, was that they had witnessed the end of a unique era.

Clearly, the second stage of the church train system (1864-68) had equaled the success enjoyed during the first phase (1861-63). In the last three years (1864, 1866, 1868) that church trains were sent to gather converts, 9,264 made the pilgrimage to Utah. The factor that sets the second half’s gathering apart from the earlier immigration was the added economic burden created by the Black Hawk War. In spite of the sanguinary conflict in Utah the church could still provide the teamsters, cattle, mules, and other provisions necessary to bring thousands of new Mormons to the Great Basin. Had the church been able to send teams in 1865 and 1867, it is safe to assume that at least 4,000 additional converts could have joined the exodus to Utah. Still, the figures for the eight-year history of the church train system are impressive. Approximately 18,466 converts crossed the plains and mountains in ox and mule-driven wagons. In addition, 1,956 wagons were used; 2,483 men from Utah were called into service; more than 17,443 oxen, mules, and horses were either donated by members of the church living in Utah or were purchased by immigration agents in the East; and 1,279,284 pounds of flour and 120,500 pounds of dried meat were hauled by church trains during the six years of service.30

It is also important to underscore the significance of the “up and back” journey with reference to the time it took to complete the trek. After all, it was precisely due to the ability of the church trains to complete the double journey that the system was attempted in the first place. Thanks to the pioneering efforts of Feramorz Little and Joseph W. Young, the task that was once thought to be impossible became routine after 1860. In 1847 the initial expedition of 143 Mormons took four months to get from the Missouri River to the Great Basin. In 1861 the church trains accomplished the journey both to and from the Missouri River in the same four-month period, doubling the speed of travel.

By 1868, due to the westward thrust of the railroad, captains were making the round trip in less than two months. In the following year, immigrants could cross the entire continent by rail. Never again would their numbers be as high as they were during the decade of the 1860s. Indeed, the church train experiment of 1861 had blossomed into one of the most successfully organized immigration systems in the history of the United States in the nineteenth century.

30 Compiled from yearly totals (1861-68) found in Deseret News, Journal History, and Millennial Star; Manuscript History of Brigham Young, 1861-68; Jenson, “Emigration from Wyoming, Nebraska,” pp. 113-17; Jenson, Church Chronology, pp. 65-79; B. H. Roberts, A Comprehensive History of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 6 vols. (Salt Lake City, 1930), 5: 109-11; Larson, Prelude to Kingdom, p. 226; Taylor, Expectations Westward, 138-42; and Arrington, Great Basin Kingdom, 205-09.
Ministering Minstrels: Blackface Entertainment in Pioneer Utah

BY MICHAEL HICKS

Whites and blacks in America, de Tocqueville wrote, were destined for mutual dependence and dread. They were two races "attached to each other without intermingling, and... alike unable entirely to separate or to combine." The artistic locus of this mixture of attraction and

Dr. Hicks is assistant professor of music at Brigham Young University.

repulsion was blackface minstrelsy, the theatrical genre in which whites smeared burnt cork on their skin and spoke in a yammering dialect in order to caricature blacks on the stage. On the one hand minstrel shows were populated by “darkies” who were ugly, unclean, lazy, and cunning. On the other hand, these same black characters were often portrayed as tender, devout, familial, and more sensible than whites when it came to politics and religion. Minstrel actors strove to depict blacks as both uncivilized and endearing, fit objects of the paternalism of whites, that strange mixture of pity and domination.

Brigham Young echoed that paternalism in his sermons to pioneer Mormons. He consistently preached that black slavery was improperly practiced but defensible on scriptural grounds. He rejected blacks as civil or spiritual leaders, yet spoke, however vaguely, of the “rights,” “liberties,” and “privileges” that were due them as citizens. He insisted that the Saints neither oppress blacks nor exalt them to a position of equality. It was only natural, then, that the Saints who answered Young’s call to gather to Zion would bring blackface minstrelsy with them and enact for one another their mixed feelings toward what they considered the race of Cain, a race unjustly brutalized yet justly accursed.

Mormons had encountered blackface minstrelsy in some of its earliest incarnations. One resident of Mormon Nauvoo recalled that she and her friends would sometimes awaken at night to the sound of minstrel entertainments from the showboats on the Mississippi. But the Saints do not appear to have begun indulging in their own blackface entertainments until after gathering to Utah, where pioneer newspaper notices clearly allude to the practice. In January 1853 a group calling itself “The African Band” performed minstrel songs at the Salt Lake Social Hall. The following year the Deseret News described a ward party at which a “genuine Ethiopian,” the common term for a blackface entertainer, did a solo dance the paper evaluated in pseudo-black dialect as “werry pecoolia.” (The News added that “the whole entertainment was not unbecoming true intelligence.”) During the Utah Reformation of 1856-57, theatricals and public entertainment were eschewed, and the spread of minstrelsy in Deseret was interrupted. But

---

2 Of the many treatments of Mormons and blacks, the most comprehensive is probably Newell G. Bringhurst, Saints, Slaves, and Blacks: The Changing Place of Black People Within Mormonism (Westport, Conn.: Greenwood Press, 1981). For the cultural context of Mormon minstrelsy see Michael Hicks, Mormonism and Music: A History (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1989).


4 Deseret News, January 22, 1853.

in the late spring of 1857, as the spirit of Reformation subsided, the press mentioned that "Ethiopian minstrel performances added much to the amusement of the audience" at a Social Hall gathering. And in 1858, as Johnston's troops approached Salt Lake City, minstrelsy was a pastime among the armies of Deseret.

Although Brigham Young is not known to have commented directly on any of these performances, his reservations about blackface entertainment may be inferred from a number of remarks. As early as 1847 he complained about elders who, despite their glorious calling to preach and minister, were dancing "as niggers... they will hoe down all, turn summersets, dance on their knees, and haw, haw, out loud," unmistakably describing energetic minstrel-style dancing. (Young added, "I don't mean this as debasing the negroes by any means.")

Minstrelsy often used grimacing and facial contortions for comic effect, a practice which he generally denounced in the theater unless it produced "pleasurable emotion." Young appears to have been most troubled by the blacking of the face to perform pseudo-Negro skits and music. He did not object to burnt cork makeup when it was called for in legitimate plays, for he insisted upon authenticity of theatrical detail. But when he visited a four-man Mormon minstrel show in the late 1860s he is said to have insisted that the elders who performed in it stop darkening their faces, adding that if any of them should die suddenly with their faces in burnt cork they would be disgraced. Undoubtedly, gratuitous blacking suggested to Young a mockery of God since he understood dark skin to be God's curse on blacks, an affliction that would bar them from the priesthood and, consequently, the highest degree of celestial glory.

---

6 "Flora's Festival," ibid., June 17, 1857.
7 See Clarance Merrill, Autobiography, typescript in Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, p. 326.
9 As Young put it, "the distortion of the muscles of the face and body... should... be studiously avoided." See "Theatres," Deseret News, January 11, 1865.
11 See the excerpt from the Laura McBride Smith Papers in Robert Sayers, "Sing Anything: The Narrative Repertoire of a Mormon Pioneer," Journal of the Southwest 29 (Spring 1987): 76-77. A photo in this article (p. 43) shows the minstrel group after they abandoned blackface makeup.
12 Young, with many of his contemporaries, believed that Cain was the first black man, being so cursed after slaying Abel. Ironically, minstrelsy provided its own version of Cain's curse: Cain was really the first white man, according to blackface lore, because when the Lord spoke to him after he killed Abel, he was so terrified that he turned pale. See "The First White Man," in Jack Haverley, Negro Minstrelsy (Chicago: Frederick J. Drake & Co., 1902), p. 67.
But minstrel music so captivated the Saints that Wilford Woodruff warned in 1855 that scripture reading was being neglected in Mormondom in preference for "negro songs," which he placed in the same category as French novels. Such songs came in several types. First and most popular were the sentimental minstrel songs, of which Stephen Foster composed the best known—songs that celebrated lost love and innocence or the beauties of plantation life. Several of Foster's songs were widely played in Utah during the 1850s and 60s, and Brigham Young reportedly liked to hear Eliza Snow's "O My Father" sung to the tune of Foster's "Gentle Annie." (Indeed, after the Civil War, Young's daughter recalled, he became quite fond of such "Negro melodies." ) A song of this type written by John Hugh McNaughton became quite popular among nineteenth-century American religious groups, including the Mormons. Popularized by Christy's Minstrels in the late 1850s, the song depicted the tender feelings of plantation servants bound together by family ties. It began:

There is beauty all around when there's love at home.
There is joy in every sound when there's love at home.
Peace and plenty here abide, smiling sweet on every side;
Time doth softly, sweetly glide when there's love at home. 

Anti-slavery songs, though relatively few, also appeared in minstrel shows. One of these, Henry Clay Work's "Babylon Is Fallen" beguiled the Saints with its militant religious dialect:

Don't you see de black clouds risin' ober yonder
Whar de Massa's old plantation am?
Neber you be frightened, dem is only darkies.
Come to jine an' fight for Uncle Sam.
Look out dar, now! We's a gwine to shoot!
Look out dar, don't you understand?
Babylon is fallen! Babylon is fallen!
An' we's agwine to occupy de land.

14See Augusta Joyce Crocheron, Representative Women of Deseret (Salt Lake City: J.C. Graham, 1884), pp. 1-2.
16The earliest known imprint of "When There's Love at Home" is dated 1859. A photocopy of an undated imprint bearing the printed subscript "Christy Minstrel's Song" is in the Church Music Department Subject and Correspondence Files, Library-Archives of the Historical Department of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, Salt Lake City, Utah. Hereafter cited as HDC.
17The chorus to "Babylon Is Fallen" appears in the George Careless cornet part book (labeled "Dramatic Music"), HDC.
A third type of minstrel song was the jubilant “walk-around” type used for minstrel finales, of which Dan Emmett’s “Dixie” was the most popular. “Dixie” was so popular in Mormondom that it was sung in the general conference priesthood meeting at Salt Lake City in April 1863. Poet W. W. Phelps also wrote new lyrics to “Dixie” as a tribute to Brigham Young, in order that Young and his children might sing the song. Phelps effusively wrote, “in that spirit that sounds like heaven, and swells the soul to thoughts that breathe, by words that burn, with sense and sound.” One verse is suggestive of the whole:

We love the words of the prophet Joseph,
While the gentile only knows of
War and wo, war and wo, war and wo,
Israel reigns.
Up, up! ye royal priesthood holders,
Joseph’s robe’s on Brigham’s shoulders,
Clear the way, clear the way, clear the way,
Israel reigns.

At the dedication of the Salt Lake Theatre in 1862 Brigham Young asked that only entertainment of the highest literary and moral value should appear on its stage. But raucous blackface shows flourished there nonetheless. Productions at the theatre throughout the Civil War years, featured blackface skits and entr’actes, with local singers and comedians presenting their own pseudo-Negro songs. The theatre also began collecting undershirts, calico coats, and curly black wigs for the portrayal of blacks in these comedic sketches. (These coats and wigs also appeared in the productions of The Octoroon and Uncle Tom’s Cabin, dozens of which were mounted between 1862 and 1877.) Mormon blackface entertainment reached a milestone in the December
1868 performances of the territory's self-acclaimed first "professional" minstrel company, the six-member "Salt Lake Minstrels." This group appeared for the three final nights of the year and were praised for introducing a new "sensation" to a city, many of whose residents claimed never to have seen such a thing before—an entertainment filled with brilliant banjo music, fresh jokes, and agile clog dancing. But this group was short-lived and a few days after its premiere was already being referred to as "defunct." It remained for the transcontinental railroad to feed the public's appetite for blackface entertainment.

Two and a half months after the driving of the golden spike, the Salt Lake Theatre managers closed the theatre because, they said, the public had become "satiated" with drama and needed some new sort of attraction. To remedy this they contracted with Murphy and Mack's twenty-eight-member minstrel troupe to come to Utah from San Francisco for a ten-day engagement, provided the visitors promised not to breach the local morals or mingle too freely with the public. News of the engagement caused a commotion in the city and prompted the Deseret News to observe that if its readers did not pack the house to overflowing, "they will manifest a most unparalleled lack of taste and appreciation." The troupe, like most minstrel companies, played a

---

24 See the notices in Deseret News, December 28, 1868-January 2, 1869; also The Curtain, December 29 and 31, 1868.
25 See Clawson and Caine to Sheridan Corby, July 31, 1869, Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC.
26 "The Minstrels," Deseret News, August 27, 1869; compare the various notices in Deseret News, August 18-26, 1869.
fresh program every night and did very good business for late summer in Salt Lake City when the hot, poorly ventilated theatre was quite uninhabitable. The newspapers claimed that the only fault that could be found in this gentile minstrelsy was that "we could not have more of it." The minstrels' success troubled some of the city's intellectuals, however, who argued that not only did it speak ill of the public's taste, but that it also may have constituted a breach of President Young's admonitions to cultivate "home talent." Could not the Saints appreciate their own George Careless and Ebenezer Beesley playing classical music, one critic asked, as much as they did gentiles in blackface.

In 1870 and 1872, respectively, two more professional minstrel troupes came to Utah. The first of these, Duprez and Benedict's, was also the first East Coast company to visit the territory. On their arrival in Salt Lake City they drew huge crowds and tumultuous applause, especially for their clog dancing, stump preaching, and female impersonations. Their return visit that September was regarded as nothing short of miraculous, since it had been reported in the Utah press that the minstrels had been massacred by highwaymen on their way to San Francisco. Duprez and Benedict's minstrel parade through the streets of Salt Lake City in September 1870 delighted the citizens with the news that the troupe had not been, as the Deseret News put it, "dispatched to the spirit world." When the Purdy, Scott, and Fostelle Minstrels arrived in 1872, the press and public lavished them with praise. The Salt Lake Tribune observed that "there's a good deed in the darkey when properly brought out, and the present minstrels appear to have got all of his interesting points." But a scandal erupted when the minstrels' manager breached agreements with theatre employees who painted the scenery and scored the music for the entire show. The minstrels also left huge unpaid debts in town—especially for cigars—and, to add insult to injury, the troupe complained in the eastern press about Utah's backwardness. Some Salt Lakers reversed their earlier assessments of the minstrels and took the episode as further confirmation that home talent was the only safe sort. This minstrel scandal appears to have fostered the brief reemergence of the Salt Lake

30 "The Minstrels Ho!" ibid., September 16, 1870.
Minstrels, who toured the Wasatch Front shortly after Purdy, Scott, and Fostelle’s left the region.\(^{32}\)

At about this time Utahns, like the rest of the nation, were beginning to clamor to have real blacks perform for them on the stage. To employ black entertainers was seen as something of a philanthropic enterprise during Reconstruction years, but it was also a chance to see the novelty, some people felt, of blacks imitating whites imitating blacks. Real black entertainers were referred to as “colored” to distinguish them from the more common “negro” or “Ethiopian” entertainers, i.e., white men in burnt cork. Such a “colored” novelty act was the Hyers Sisters, two black, classically trained vocalists who were brought to Utah in 1871 and billed as “musical wonders” with the qualifier “colored” beneath their names. It quickly became evident that in interpreting classical music the sisters were more than equal to their white peers. In this light the theatre changed its billing from the novelty oriented “musical wonders” to the more respectful “wonderful musical artistes.” Mormon music critic John Tullidge declined even to mention that the sisters were black in his glowing review of their concerts, and near the end of their run the theatre dropped the word “colored” from its advertisements. In a final turn of events a coalition of Mormon and gentile musicians and businessmen arranged a benefit concert to raise money for the sisters to continue their vocal training in Italy.\(^{33}\)

The blind, reputedly retarded black pianist Thomas Bethune fared less well in Utah. This former slave toured the nation after the Civil War under the name “Blind Tom,” displaying his strange musical abilities, which ranged from playing by ear works by Liszt, Chopin, and other luminaries, to imitating various instruments with his voice, to singing minstrel-style plantation songs of his own composing, to duplicating at first hearing any piece played by an audience member. In April 1873, three years after Blind Tom’s exploits first had been publicized on the front page of the \textit{Deseret News}, the Salt Lake Theatre managers wrote to Bethune’s agent that there was “considerable anxiety” in the city to hear this phenomenon.\(^{34}\) They set an engagement for May, billing Tom as the “Most Wonderful Living Curiosity of the Nineteenth Century.”

\(^{32}\)On Purdy, Scott, and Fostelle’s visit see also the notices in \textit{Deseret News}, February 17 and 21, 1872; \textit{Salt Lake Tribune}, February 20, 1872; and \textit{The Footlights}, February 19, 1872, and March 11-14, 1872. On the Salt Lake Minstrels tour see notices in \textit{The Footlights}, March 11, 13, and 18, 1872.

\(^{33}\)On the Hyers (or Hyer) Sisters’ visits see John Tullidge’s review in \textit{Deseret News}, August 16, 1871, the notices in \textit{Footlights}, August 12, 16, and 17, 1871, and the theatre posters on file in HDC. See also the racism-tinged review of a subsequent concert in \textit{Salt Lake Times}, February 4, 1879.

\(^{34}\)See George Reynolds to Thomas Warwick, April 30, 1873, Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC. Bethune was publicized in \textit{Deseret News}, April 13, 1870.
But Blind Tom failed to meet the public's expectations. His performances were mediocre, and because he spoke clearly many patrons doubted that he was really the imbecile he was said to be. The audiences' greatest disappointment came when Joseph Daynes, one of Utah's most prominent “home composers,” played one of his own pieces for Bethune to imitate. As the Deseret News noted, Blind Tom's version was similar to Daynes's but “no musical ear could consider it anything like an exact reproduction of the original.” Although Blind Tom did return to Salt Lake City twice more in the next twenty-one years, he drew only small crowds of fans willing to pay rather high prices.

From 1873 to 1877 indigenous Mormon minstrelsy continued to thrive in local parties and entertainments. But during those years—the last five years of Brigham Young’s life—gentile minstrel troupes appeared only twice at the Salt Lake Theatre. The Purdy, Scott, and Fostelle affair had left lingering ill will in Utah toward gentile minstrels. Moreover, the Panic of 1873 curtailed touring for many minstrel groups, and few were willing to venture as far as Salt Lake City from either coast. The Salt Lake Theatre itself encountered hard times for a variety of reasons, including rumors of smallpox infections at the theatre, complaints about the dirty seats in the hall, a horse epidemic that hampered travel to the theatres, and worst of all, the opening of a bawdy house where curious patrons flocked to see, as one LDS apostle put it, “brazen women dance lewd dances.”

One of the minstrel companies that came during these years was also the first group of authentic black minstrels to play in the state. All-black minstrel troupes had begun to appear with greater frequency throughout the nation since the Civil War. Not wanting to disappoint their audiences, black minstrels retained the style and content of blackface minstrelsy. And because they were “authentic” Negroes, these players lent an air of genuineness to the portrayals of blacks to which people had grown accustomed in the previous decades. Like most Americans, Utahns were impressed with the authenticity real blacks gave to their mannered performances. When the Original Georgia Minstrels came to Utah in 1876, local observers concluded that

36 Blind Tom returned to the Salt Lake Theatre, June 20-21, 1876, and August 13, 1894. See especially Salt Lake Tribune, June 21, 1876, and Utah Musical Times 1 [July 15, 1876]: 77.
37 See for example the notices in Utah Musical Times 1 [April 15, 1876]: 29 and 2 [April 1, 1877]: 11. While these were local church-sponsored affairs, it is not known whether gentiles also attended.
38 For the quote and a discussion of the theatre’s problems, see George Reynolds to Brigham Young, February 5, 1873, in Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC.
their performances were cruder and less polished than those of burnt cork minstrels but that "they are superior for the reason that they are genuine negroes, and nothing unnatural to them is assumed," and "the whole is probably perfectly characteristic of negro amusements away down south in Dixie." But the most oft-mentioned aspect of

---

39 "The Minstrels," Salt Lake Tribune, April 28, 1876. See also the following day's notice, which credits the group with "extreme naturalness."
40 Deseret News, April 28, 1876. See also the detailed notice in Utah Musical Times 1 (May 15, 1876): 45.
these first black minstrel shows in Utah was not their authenticity but rather the oral contortionism of Billy Wilson who, the Salt Lake Times indelicately noted, “has the most expansive [food trap] of any nigger we ever saw,” a mouth which the Deseret News likened to that of a hippopotamus.41

The novelty of such acts quickly wore off in Utah, and subsequent black minstrel groups attracted less attention than their white counterparts, perhaps because of what one Salt Lake newspaper called the “Ethiopian uncouthness” that blacks inherently conveyed.42 But during this same period Utahns faced a new and troublesome form of blackface minstrelsy. Scantily costumed female minstrels began to replace the traditional blackface female impersonators in the 1870s. Less concerned with imitating blacks than with exciting exotic male fantasies, the most famous national female minstrel troupe began to appear in Salt Lake City early in 1878. The Rentz-Santely Female Minstrels drew crowds of elders, but Mormon leaders balked at the obvious eroticism of the shows. When the troupe returned to the Salt Lake Theatre on the Monday night following the April 1878 general conference, the Deseret News refused to review the show and church leaders forbade the minstrels from using the theatre for any further engagements. The following January the group played at Salt Lake’s Liberal Institute where many scrutinized the troupe to see how bad they really were. Some protested that nothing the female minstrels did was any more vulgar than the burlesque opera troupes who were among the Salt Lake Theatre’s most popular attractions. The theatre managers, however, insisted that the Rentz-Santley troupe was “a perfect stink” and that it was “suicidal” to foist them on the predominantly Mormon public.43 Nevertheless, the female minstrels returned to the Salt Lake Theatre in

41 See “The Georgia Minstrels,” Salt Lake Times, April 28, 1876, and Deseret News, April 28, 1876. The Ogden Junction review of the troupe, April 27, 1876, does not refer to Wilson by name but simply closes with the words, “oh! that mouth.”

42 See “The MInstrels,” Salt Lake Tribune, May 10, 1876. For notices on other black troupes see especially those surrounding engagements at the Salt Lake Theatre during September 18-20, 1878, March 14-15, 1879, and April 18-19, 1882. The last of these engagements was by Callendar’s Georgia Minstrels whose elaborate stage show impressed Salt Lake audiences. The Tribune noted that the whole show was so varied that it was “like a minstrel show, circus, camp meeting and picnic combined” (April 19, 1882). The most stunning aspect of this show was its opening panorama of Africa in which the minstrels were shown in their “natural” state (Deseret News, April 18, 1882).

43 This treatment of the Rentz-Santley Minstrels is based on Deseret News notices for January 23 and April 9, 1878, and the editorial “Debasing Performances,” June 29, 1888; Salt Lake Tribune, January 11-12, 1879, and March 11, 1885; Wilford Woodruff’s Journal, 8:506 [June 28, 1888]; and especially the following letters from the Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC: To J. T. Maguire, March 12 (?), 1881; Messrs. Spies and Smart, July 3, 1882, M. B. Leavitt, March 6, 1884, June 10, 1884, and March 15, 1885, and W. D. Mann, February 20, 1885. See also the editorial, “The Nude Drama,” published in direct response to the performance of Rentz-Santley, Ogden Junction, January 11, 1879.
1885 with a show called “An Adamless Eden,” a show vulgar enough that the *Salt Lake Tribune* now accused the Mormon theatre of corrupting the city, even though the performance garnered the lowest receipts of any show held in the theatre up to that time. Astonishingly, the Rentz-Santley minstrels returned once again to the Salt Lake Theatre in 1888 with a show entitled “Adam and Eve.” Even Mormon president Wilford Woodruff was seduced by the title into attending the performance—much to his outrage—and the *Deseret News* expressed horror that “sacrilege” had now been added to these already immodest shows. With the performance of “Adam and Eve” church leaders at last decisively banished the Rentz-Santley minstrels from the Salt Lake Theatre.

By the 1880s Utah audiences, who only a few years earlier had not known professional minstrelsy, were well versed in the genre. Groups that did not meet their high standards were flouted at the box office and scorned in the press. By the middle of the decade many Utahns regarded minstrel entertainments as generally stale and predictable; only exceptional virtuosity and spectacle could get their attention. Like many Americans the Mormons had developed a taste for grandiosity, one that was reflected not only in their holding of massive music festivals but also in their passion for “mastodon” minstrel shows of the sort popularized by Jack Haverley, the late nineteenth century’s most prominent minstrel entrepreneur. Haverley transformed the raucous caricaturing of early minstrelsy into the slick, pseudo-aristocratic extravaganzas that dominated the minstrelsy of the 1880s. His minstrel troupes had been featured performers at the Salt Lake Theatre during both general conferences of 1878, and his brand of entertainment was known to be “of the most chaste character.” In 1879 he brought his first forty-man mastodon minstrel show to Utah. This new troupe became so popular that it soon found itself at the center of Mormon-gentile competition in Salt Lake City.

In June 1882 the Walker brothers, the city’s most affluent ex-Mormons, opened the Walker Opera House. To attract a predominantly Mormon clientele the owners announced that not only would its house orchestra be led by “home talent” George Careless, the former Salt Lake Theatre music director who had refused to unionize, but also

---

44 See for example the reviews in *Deseret News*, November 15-17, 1880, and February 11, 1881.
45 See “Barlow and Wilson’s Minstrels,” ibid., July 8, 1885.
46 This characterization is from *Salt Lake Tribune*, June 5, 1879. See also the reviews in *Deseret News*, April 4-5, 1878, and October 5, 1878.
that Jack Haverley and his minstrels would book exclusively through the Opera House for the next two years. Determined not to be upstaged by the Walkers, the Salt Lake Theatre managers leased their hall to Haverley for three years on the condition that he would alternate his attractions between the two houses.\textsuperscript{17} The Salt Lake Theatre managers took this unusual step because they were worried that they would lose general conference business to apostates, especially since, as the

\textsuperscript{17}On the Haverley dealings see David McKenzie's letters to Charles Frohman (December 7, 1881), J. H. Haverley (February 2, 1882); Charles McConnell (June 12, 1882), Frederick W. Bert (November 2, 1882, and February 13, 1883); and to M. B. Leavitt (November 7, 1882), all in the Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC. See also the account in Pyper, Romance of an Old Playhouse, pp. 295-97. The Walker Opera House also tried to secure the exclusive rights to minstrel performances by Leavitt's minstrels, Haverley's chief rivals. But Leavitt declined, partly out of loyalty to the Salt Lake Theatre managers and partly because he doubted that any non-Mormon house could survive in Salt Lake City. See M. B. Leavitt, Fifty Years in Theatrical Management (New York: Broadway Publishing, 1912), pp. 411-12.
managers wrote, “the best attraction for Conference is a first class Minstrel Company.”

But the move was unpropitious. Anti-polygamy prosecution began to drive many potential ticket buyers into hiding or into prison. Because of the intensity of the prosecution the church held no general conferences in Salt Lake City from 1884 to 1887. The succeeding years saw the rise of vaudeville or “specialty” shows in theatres throughout the nation, generally at the expense of minstrelsy. By the early 1890s Utah was preparing for statehood and Salt Lake City aspired to be a metropolis with its own big-city-style minstrel companies: the Salt Lake Mastodon Minstrels and the Deseret Minstrels. In 1895 the women of Salt Lake City high society began producing their own female minstrel shows, only more chaste and benevolent than earlier such incarnations had been. The “Minstrel King,” Jack Haverley, retired from show business and settled in Deer Creek, Utah. His death in Salt Lake City in 1901 signalled the end of an era. Professional minstrelsy gradually succumbed, but the blackface genre thrived as an amateur entertainment of the sort produced in countless Mormon church socials at least through the 1950s.

In their affection for blackface entertainment, nineteenth-century Mormons showed themselves to be more or less in step with the nation at large. Yet one wonders if certain features of minstrel entertainment did not have a special appeal for the Saints. First, Mormons were fond of spoofing sectarian beliefs and practices. This they did not only in songs, recitations, and holiday toasts but also in tracts and, most potently, in their temple ritual, where sectarian ministers were portrayed as loquacious buffoons. Minstrelsy also satirized sectarian religion as in this blackface character’s definition of faith: “Faith am a compounded conglomeration ob phantasmagorical whichness, absolved from some- ness by a liberal infusion ob de impossibly mixed up when.” Thus, minstrelsy helped augment a well-established Mormon repertoire of

---

48 David McKenzie to Frederick W. Bert, February 13, 1883, Deseret Dramatic Association Letterpress Copybooks, HDC.

49 Minstrel scenes were also staged by Mormon polygamists in prison. See Abraham H. Cannon, Journal, July 5, 1886, photocopy of holograph in Manuscripts, Harold B. Lee Library.


51 See “Minstrel King Dead,” Salt Lake Tribune, September 29, 1901.

Minstrels

religious parody. Second, Mormons needed the attention of outsiders to help reinforce their sense of self-importance and maintain their identity as a distinctive people. Minstrels, like cartoonists and comic writers, regarded Mormonism and its people as apt subjects for topical humor. References to themselves in minstrel shows allowed the Saints who attended them to see their own reflection in the mirror of gentile culture. And it was undoubtedly of some comfort to see outsiders thinking of them in a non-threatening way. Third, while they espoused the virtues of high culture in building up Zion, Mormons also depended on simple, popular entertainment to help bind them together as a community. Cooperation and social equality being among Mormonism's highest values, blackface entertainment united most Mormons around images that were common to even the least of Saints.

Admittedly, these images were caricatures; in the white American tradition Mormons built a sense of community partly on the foundation of bad faith toward blacks. This is ironic when one considers the underlying affinities of Mormons and blacks in nineteenth-century America. In Mormon Nauvoo, Heber C. Kimball had expressly connected the Saints' plight to that of non-whites: "We are not accounted as white people, and we don't want to live among them." But pioneer Utahns seem not to have exploited that implied empathy nor to have discerned the theme that tied together black American culture and white Mormon culture: their common use of imagery from ancient Israel. Blackface music and theatre regularly used images of captive Israel to articulate the sense of oppression and loneliness that blacks in nineteenth-century America felt. In their songs and sermons Mormons used similar images to express their frustration at persecution and their estrangement from American Babylon. In the domain of metaphor, then, Mormondom and the world of minstrelsy converged. Hence, one can regret that white Mormons seem not to have discovered a simile of themselves on the minstrel stage, since, like blacks at large, they saw themselves as unjustly hated and pitied, forever unable either to separate from or to combine with the nation of their captivity.

---

53 See, for example the joke mentioned in Wittke, Tambo and Bones, p. 162.
54 Times and Seasons 6 (November 1, 1845): 1012.
Once Camp Douglas was established in October 1862 non-Mormons entered the Salt Lake Valley in greater number than ever before. Alexander Caldwell Badger, Jr., of St. Louis, Missouri, was one of the people who came as a direct result of this military presence. Badger arrived in Salt Lake City on January 1, 1863, traveling by stagecoach from San Francisco. A civilian employee of the United States Army,
Badger came to Utah as the secretary to Capt. George Wallace of the California Volunteers who assumed the duties of quartermaster at Camp Douglas.¹

According to family documents,² Badger was born on March 13, 1840, in Paducah, Kentucky. The only son of Alexander C. and Mary Ann Cable Badger, "Alex," as he signed his letters, was one of three surviving children. His sister Alice Eudora was born in 1838 and Cora Gertrude in 1842. His father was a river boat captain, and in 1850 the family moved to St. Louis so he could be nearer to the largest river port of the day. Captain Badger piloted river boats along the Mississippi, Ohio, and Tennessee rivers and was killed in July 1855 when a boat he was on exploded.

Alex and his family remained in St. Louis after the death of his father. His sister Alice married Francis Marion "Frank" Cayton, who was also a river boat pilot, and his mother and sister Cora lived with the Caytons. Alex at age eighteen or nineteen decided to go west, accompanied by Frank Cayton's brother Will and his wife Parma. They began their trip by taking a train to New York City where they boarded a ship to Panama, crossed the Isthmus, and traveled by steamer to San Francisco. After spending some time there, all three went to Fort Vancouver, Washington Territory, where Alex was employed by Col. E. B. Babbitt, deputy quartermaster general, United States Army. Alex worked as an accountant, maintaining ledgers and supply records, and earned the respect of his superior, as noted in a glowing letter of recommendation dated February 28, 1862, in which Colonel Babbitt wrote that Alex "... is a neat and rapid penman, and accurate accountant, and a man of sterling integrity of character and in all the above particulars, I confidently recommend him to any firm or company who may need his services."³

¹Deseret News, January 7, 1863.
²The letters and other supporting documents were donated to the Missouri Historical Society in St. Louis, Missouri, by Cora Mary Badger, the daughter of Alexander C. Badger Jr., in 1951. Biographical information on a number of family members is also included in the collection, along with letters written to "Alex" while he was in the West.
³Babbitt to To Whom It May Concern, February 28, 1862, Badger Collection, Missouri Historical Society, St. Louis. Edwin B. Babbitt was born in Connecticut and graduated from the United States Military Academy on July 1, 1826. After a long and distinguished career, including service against the Pawnee Indians in 1829, in the Florida War in 1837-38, and the Mexican War 1847-48, Babbitt was promoted to lieutenant colonel on August 3, 1861, and assigned the duties of quartermaster of the Department of the Pacific on September 13, 1861. For meritorious duty during the Civil War, Babbitt was promoted to brevet brigadier general on March 13, 1865, and retired from the military on July 29, 1866. For more information see Brevet Major General George W. Cullum, Biographical Register of the Officers and Graduates of the U.S. Military Academy, from 1802 to 1867, revised edition, with a Supplement Continuing the Register of Graduates to January 1, 1879 (New York: James Miller, Publisher, 1879), p. 300.
A letter to his mother dated June 17, 1862, places Alex on the Columbia River. Sometime between that date and December 1862, Alex left Fort Vancouver and went to San Francisco. Upon his arrival he learned of a position with the California Volunteers and decided to accompany Captain Wallace as his secretary to Camp Douglas. When Badger arrived in Salt Lake City at the age of twenty-two, he had been away from home for a number of years.

Alex entered the city at a time when many of its inhabitants believed they were under siege by the federal government. Established three months before Badger’s arrival, Camp Douglas, overlooking Salt Lake City, was ostensibly there to protect the overland mail from hostile Indians, but the citizens had no doubts that the military was there to keep an eye on the Saints. LDS leaders feared that the federal government, doubting Mormon intentions, wanted to ensure that Utah Territory remained loyal by establishing a permanent military presence. A major challenge to Mormon authority in Utah Territory was about to take place, and Alex was there at the beginning.

Leaving the quartermaster’s service, Alex remained in Salt Lake City for perhaps two years. During this time he became acquainted with many of the local citizens, including Brigham Young. He never converted to Mormonism but upon his departure, Brigham Young gave him two photographs: one of himself taken on July 9, 1863, and a second photograph of seven of his daughters. Unfortunately, the photograph of Young’s daughters could not be located.

Alex left Salt Lake City and returned to St. Louis where he was married to Annie Elizabeth “Bettie” Johnson on November 27, 1873, Thanksgiving Day, in the “Eighth Street” Methodist Church. Both Alex and his wife came from devout Methodist backgrounds and were involved in church activities all their lives. The Badgers had four children, Cora Mary, Florence, Richard Scruggs, and Alexander Caldwell III. The boys died in infancy, but the daughters survived to adulthood.

Because of his wife’s poor health, Alex and his family moved to Leadville, Colorado, hoping the change of environment would benefit her condition. She did not improve, however, and the family returned to St. Louis where Bettie Badger died in 1881 at twenty-nine years of age. Several years after the death of his wife, Alex married Sara Luella Craig of Jacksonville, Illinois. They had two sons, Charles Craig Badger, who died in infancy, and Robert Caldwell Badger, who was born on January 5, 1894, and lived to adulthood.
Alexander Caldwell Badger, Jr., died at age seventy-eight on April 17, 1917, and was buried next to his father in Bellefontaine Cemetery in St. Louis. He served in many official and social capacities with the Methodist church, including Sunday school superintendent, steward, and teacher. An announcement of his death written by his pastor, Elmer T. Clark, noted that “In the death of Brother Alexander C. Badger,... St. Louis Methodism lost one of her landmarks and faithful servants. He was not as prominently before the Church as certain of his contemporaries, yet he had a loyalty as strong and a knowledge as wide as any Methodist who has served the Church in St. Louis in the past two generations.”

The following five letters relate Badger’s journey to Salt Lake City and his impressions over the five months between January and May 1863. Having come of age in Missouri, Alex was well aware of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, and like most gentiles of the time had an opinion regarding Mormon propriety. His letters reflect the thoughts of an often homesick young man, writing to his family, and not those of a rabid Mormon hater bent on their destruction. Alex notes the accomplishments of the Mormons in the building of their city and in their ability to prosper in Utah Territory. He also describes the barter system used by some to gain admission to the Salt Lake Theatre. While writing in a generally positive manner, Alex notes with some disgust the political situation and the impact of polygamy on at least some of the Mormon people. Perhaps as important as what he writes is what he does not. During Alex’s stay in Salt Lake City, Brigham Young was arrested on bigamy charges, but Alex mentions nothing of this. Also, nothing on the Civil War and its impact upon his family in St. Louis will be found in his letters. What Alex did write and the accompanying sketches illustrating Camp Douglas and the Salt Lake Valley provide an important record of the Mormon and the military ways of life. It is important to note that very few firsthand accounts of Utah during the Civil War exist. Alex’s letters add to the understanding of this period of Utah’s history.

The letters are from a collection of materials donated by Alex’s daughter, Cora Mary Badger, to the Missouri Historical Society, a private society in St. Louis, Missouri. Unfortunately, a photograph of Alex could not be located in any of the donated materials. The transcription follows Badger's spelling, but the punctuation has been

1A typed copy of the death notification written by Elmer T. Clark is in the Badger Collection at the Missouri Historical Society. The typed copy is from a notification that appeared in a Methodist newspaper, titled “On The Death Of Brother A.C. Badger,” The St. Louis Christian Advocate, n.d.
altered slightly to achieve uniformity; words added for clarification are placed in brackets; dashes have been omitted where commas were present; periods have been added at the end of sentences; capital letters have been used to begin sentences, and varied forms of “Miss” and "and" have been standardized. Otherwise the letters remain as Alex wrote them.

Salt Lake City
January 2d 1863

Dear Ma

I arrived at this place yesterday afternoon and after a good nights rest proceed to give you a little account of my journey. After mature preparations and deliberation Capt Wallace and I left San Francisco on the afternoon of the 23d Dec. and arrived at Sacramento about 2 o’clock next morning. It was dark when we arrived and so we left at daylight on the cars for Folsom. I did not see much of Sacramento. The ride to Folsom was over a level country and we saw nothing very interesting. At Folsom we had our baggage weighed and paid 75 cents a pound extra for all weight over 25 pounds. The Capt. and I paid $150.00 extra, but mine cost me nothing as the Capt arraigned so as to pay for mine. Our party in the stage (we took two stages here for Carson City) consisted of eight persons, Col. Evans, Capt. Wallace, Mr. Nolan, Mr. Norton wife and daughter, Miss Mollie and myself. I took the outside seat with the driver as the day was fine, and I wished to see the country. From Folsom we begin to ascend the Sierra Nevada mountains. We drove over hill and valley getting higher and higher all the time, the views at most times being very beautiful—we could see for miles in all directions successions of hill mountain and valley. After a pleasant ride all day we ascended a high hill and right at our feet in a cosy valley lay the town of Placerville—we could see every house and street in it. Placerville is a mining town and in the vicinity we saw numbers of placer diggings. We stayed here all night and it being Christmas eve, they had a party at the Cosy House in which we stopped. I went to bed early so as to have a good night rest, and so did the Captain, but the Capt snored awfully and the musicians down

\(^3\)George Wallace was born in Pennsylvania but was living in California at the outbreak of the Civil War. He was mustered into the U.S. California Volunteers at the rank of captain on July 14, 1862. Assigned as assistant quartermaster, he was ordered to Salt Lake City to assist with the establishment of Camp Douglas. Arriving on January 1, 1863, Captain Wallace was at Camp Douglas at least through May 1863 and resigned his commission on February 13, 1864. For more information see Francis B. Heitman, *Historical Register and Dictionary of the United States Army, from 1802 to 1867* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1903), p. 998.

\(^6\)Other than Captain Wallace, only Col. George S. Evans can be positively identified. The third commander of the Second California Cavalry, Evans was commissioned a major on October 16, 1861, and promoted to full colonel on February 1, 1863. On March 13, 1865, Evans was promoted to brevet brigadier general. His stay in Utah ended on May 31, 1863, at which time he was honorably mustered out of the Second California Cavalry. While in Utah he was involved in both the Battles of Bear River and Spanish Fork Canyon. Evans was appointed adjutant-general of the state of California on May 1, 1864, and served until April 30, 1868. He was also elected state senator, serving three terms. For more information on Evans and the Second California Cavalry see Brigadier General Richard H. Orton, *Records of California Men in the War of the Rebellion, 1861 to 1867* (Sacramento: State Office, J.D. Young, Superintendent State Printing, 1890), pp. 168-305.
stairs piped away incessantly and a lot of gossiping women in the hall talked away so that I slept but little that night. In the morning we again took the stage and began to climb higher up into the mountains—about noon we reached the first snow. After climbing a long ways up we came in full view of the pass in the mountains, through which we were to go—known as Johnsons Pass. After dinner we reached the South Fork of the American River—a wild mountain stream. From this place the ascent became more abrupt and the road was cut along the sides of the mountain, and the drive was I think a rather perilous one. The mountain sides were rather abrupt, and of course there was but little foot hold any where except on the road. If the horses had become unmanageable or the stage upset, we would have tumbled down about five or six hundred feet below into the canyon. Late in the afternoon we had a Christmas dinner in the stage. I shall never forget that dinner—we had as fine a turkey as I ever saw, and other edibles. Just imagine us away up on the side of the mountain on a narrow road—a merry party of nine persons, jolting about shouting and singing as merry as larks and enjoying a high old Christmas dinner in every sense of the word. It was very romantic, and all of us thought of our absent friends, and hoped they were enjoying themselves as well as we. After dark we arrived at the famous “Strawberry” station away up in the heart of the mountains—here we stayed during the night, and in the morning at 3 1/2 o'clock we all bundled into a sleigh for a sleigh ride of twelve miles to “Yanks”.3 We had just eighteen souls in the sleigh—that is the load of two stages we were in the day before—we were packed in tight and couldn't fall out—it was an uncomfortable ride and had it not been for the romance and novelty of the thing, we would all have got out-of-temper, but we managed to keep in excellent spirits. Arrived at “Yanks” we found a blazing log fire and had a hot breakfast. Here we got into Stages again and after an interesting drive of 20 or 25 miles we came in sight of Carson Valley. It was a grand sight, viewed from away up in the mountains—it is 30 miles long and about 15 wide. The descent from away up in the mountains into the valley was about the most fearful perilous drive I ever made. The road wound down the mountain in a zig-zig way—we could see the road right below us as it wound back and forwards, and it seemed as though it might be a thousand feet to the bottom. After getting into the valley we drove some eighteen miles up it to Carson City where we stayed all night. Carson City is a flourishing little place just at the foot of the mountains on the broad valley of Carson or rather Eagle valley (which is a continuation of Carson valley) here we parted with all our travelling companions except Col. Evans. We stayed all

3Strawberry and Yanks are the names of the last two stations on the stagecoach route in California. The reasons for Alex’s description of the Strawberry station as “famous” could not be discovered. However, the station in Strawberry Valley, El Dorado County, has an interesting history. The station was not named for wild strawberries but for a Mr. Berry who founded a roadhouse in the same area. Stories of the naming vary, but at least two possibilities exist. One story states that the mattresses used by Berry at the roadhouse were not the most comfortable and travelers would constantly cry: “More straw, Berry.” Another story claims that the teamsters traveling along the route called him “Straw” Berry because he kept oats and barley and fed straw to their animals. For more information see Erwin G. Gudde, California Place Names: The Origin and Etymology of Current Geographical Names (Berkeley and Los Angeles: University of California Press, 1962).
night in Carson and took the stage of Overland Mail Co. The journey from Carson to Salt Lake occupied over five days and nights, during which time, I think I did not sleep 15 minutes, as all the sleep we got was what we could get sitting in the stage. We changed teams every 15 miles or about that, and drivers about every sixty miles and stages every two hundred miles. Every time we changed horses we had time to get out and get warmed at the stations. At certain stations we got our meals—not very regularly but whenever we got hungry. I cannot give you a detailed account of this part of the journey as it would be very long, will give you the general features etc. We crossed in succession, mountains, valley, deserts, and but seldom saw a stream of water. The appearance of the country was dry, barren and desolate. The deserts were covered with sage plants and alkali. No settlements or signs of life are met with except at the stations, which are 15 or 20 miles apart. At these stations we see a few men and horses and that is about all. The station houses are rudely constructed of lumber or adobes and covered with poles and dirt—the floors generally being the mother earth. You relish the meals you get because you are hungry and not because they are good. The ground scenery that you see serves to employ your mind and you generally make the journey without becoming tired, although a little sleep would be relished very much.

We got into Salt Lake City on the afternoon of New Years day, and I have not looked around much yet as I have been here but about 12 hours most of which has been devoted to sleep. I expect I will be able to write you some interesting letters from here, and will tell you in my next about the city of the saints. I feel very tired after my long and sleepless journey and you must excuse this badly written letter as I have no facilities for writing except a miserable lead pencil and a cold room.

I cannot state to you as yet where we will be placed on duty, whether in this city or at Camp Douglas. My love to all dear Ma and a better letter after I am rested.

Alex

---

The central route of the Overland Mail Company was originally laid out from the Missouri River over the North Platte River trail by way of Fort Kearny, Fort Laramie, South Pass, Salt Lake City, Placerville, and Sacramento. This route almost exactly paralleled the older Pony Express route and used many of the same stations. The Overland Mail Company sublet the greater portion of the two thousand mile route, retaining an operating interest only in the five hundred fifty mile intermediate section between Salt Lake City, Utah, and Virginia City, Nevada. Frederick K. Cook was in charge of the office at Salt Lake City, while Hiram Runfield was employed as agent. Alex met and knew both these men. The eastern division between the end of the Hannibal and St. Joseph Railroad, completed in 1859, and on to Salt Lake City, was leased to the Central Overland California and Pike's Peak Express Company. The western section from Virginia City to Sacramento was leased to the Pioneer Stage Company. During the time covered by Alex's letters the passenger fare from Atchison, Kansas, or St. Joseph, Missouri, to Placerville, California, was $200; and from Placerville to San Francisco $100. Only twenty-five pounds of baggage was carried free. Meals were extra and the charge for each varied at the different stations from one dollar to a dollar and fifty cents. For more information see, Roscoe P. Conkling and Margaret B. Conkling, *The Butterfield Overland Mail, 1857-1869*, 3 vols. (Glendale, Calif.: Arthur H. Clark Company, 1947).
72 Badger Letters

Salt Lake City, U.T.

January 11th 1863

Dear Mother,

I am getting very anxious for a letter from home— I have been very long without one— over a month. I begin to feel much nearer home— I am about 900 miles nearer than I was in San Francisco. I have been in the City of the Saints just 11 days, and will try and tell you something about it. I am getting to be quite a traveller— I will really get to be famous as one, I think, before I get back home. I won’t venture to say where I will turn up next. But about the Saints— I am certainly amongst a curious people— they are a riddle to me— and all other Gentiles and I suppose to themselves. There is quite a large City here in the valley— spread over a large space, and entitled to the name of “City of Suburbs or Magnificent Distances,” as much so, as Washington City. The streets are all about as wide as Washington AV in St. Louis they are not graded, nor, are the sidewalks paved. Ditches are dug on each side of the streets, through which water runs, to supply the wants of the people, cattle, dogs, ducks etc. The water is introduced from City Canyon, a mountain stream, and is very cool and pure where it enters the city, but I cannot vouch for its purity where it leaves it. Shade trees are planted in pretty good numbers throughout the city. The houses are, with but few exceptions, built of adobes, resembling in color very much, the houses we lived in on fourteenth street Every dweller or inhabitant has a large lot on which he raises about all the vegetables and fruit he uses, if he chooses. (no rhyme intended). The people, are about the commonest looking set of beings I ever saw, awful homely— men and women— with scarcely an exception. There doesn’t seem to be much intelligence among them, to look at them— they look as though they were made to labor and not to think— and you may be sure they do labor. Brigham does the

---

*Washington City cannot be positively identified. During this time the nation’s capital was often referred to as Washington City. However, it seems likely that the area around Washington University in St. Louis may be the area described.

*City Creek Canyon lies northeast of Salt Lake City. During the floods of 1983, it was City Creek that was diverted down State Street through downtown Salt Lake City.*
thinking for them all—he directs, controls and owns everything. Most of the people are in a state of abject poverty—and they are kept so. So long as they are poor they cannot leave the valley, and Brigham can use them to effect all his purposes. Brigham has a very perfect system of government for them—there are the three Presidents Brigham, Heber Kimball, and Daniel Wells— the twelve Apostles, then there are the Bishops and the teachers. All have their appropriate duties to perform. The teachers visit the people and instruct and correct them—through them, every man, woman and child, their occupation and actions are known to the heads of the church. There are no liquor saloons in the place, nor are there any places of bad repute. I have walked around town considerably since I was here and have "knocked down a few of the lions." The residence of the "Grand Turk" was the first lion. It occupies about two blocks of ground—that is the houses and grounds. It has one large two story building where he and his first wife live. There is another large building where he keeps the balance of his wives—his harem or the "lion house" as it is called, owing to there being a large carved lion over the bay window. Between these two buildings he has his offices. In the south west corner of the lot is the Deseret store or Tithing store—here all the people come pay their tithes—one tenth of all their gains. There are other buildings in the enclosure, for what purposes used, I know not. The whole is enclosed by a high stone wall, about ten or eleven feet high. West of his residence is Temple Block, enclosed by a stone or adobe wall, about ten feet high. Here they are building the great temple. It was begun in 1851 but has not been worked upon constantly. At present, they have almost completed the foundations. It will take them about ten years to finish it if they ever do. It is being built of granite, of a beautiful grey color. When finished it will be a grand and magnificent building. In the south west corner of this enclosure is the present place of worship, called the park. It is a spacious unpretending looking building. Here it is, that Brigham and his staff harangue the people. It will hold about three thousand people. I shall mention it in some future letter more fully. We have a fine large theatre here, that Brigham

---

11Heber Chase Kimball was born June 14, 1801, at Sheldon, Franklin County, Vermont, and died in Salt Lake City on June 22, 1868. During his life he was a close friend and confidant of Brigham Young. Their friendship went back to a time before either had converted to the Mormon faith and would continue until Kimball's death. Kimball served missions to the New England states and went to England twice in this capacity. His greatest influence on the LDS church was between the years of 1847 and 1868 when he served as first counselor to President Brigham Young. Kimball also served as a member of the legislative council and as lieutenant-governor of the provisional state of Deseret. For more information see Stanley B. Kimball, Heber C. Kimball: Mormon Patriarch and Pioneer (Urbana: University of Illinois Press, 1981); Daniel Hamner Wells was born at Trenton, Oneida County, New York, on October 27, 1814, and died on March 24, 1891, in Salt Lake City. Baptized on August 9, 1846, Wells became an important and influential Mormon. He took an active part in the organization of the provisional state of Deseret and was elected to the first legislative council and appointed as state attorney. Wells was also elected major general of the Nauvoo Legion by the General Assembly on May 26, 1849. He was appointed second counselor to President Brigham Young on January 4, 1857, after the death of Jedediah M. Grant. Possessed of a sharp legal mind, Wells was a member of several constitutional conventions prior to Utah statehood. For more information see Bryant S. Hinckley, Daniel Hamner Wells and Events of His Time (Salt Lake City, Utah: The Deseret News Press, 1942); The First Presidency of the LDS church is made up of the president and his first and second counselors. Each of these individuals is referred to as president which explains Badger's comment.

12Construction began on the Salt Lake City Temple in 1853 and was completed in 1893.

13The Salt Lake Theatre opened in March 1862 and was located on the northwest corner of State Street and First South.
erected at a cost of over a hundred thousand dollars. Performances are had every Wednesday and Saturday evenings. Here it is you see all the sights, as everybody attends the theatre. Brigham and his wives and a good number of his children are always present. Some of his daughters perform on the stage. For instance, last evening, in the afterpiece, two of his married daughters the Mrs. Clawsons (Both married to the same man, Mr. Clawson, who was also on the stage) performed. They have splendid music—the finest orchestra I ever heard. Good order is preserved throughout the house, for wherever Brigham is, they have got to behave. Comedies form the principal plays, as Brigham don't like tragedies. It is the most attractive place in town.

The Captain and I are yet in the City, but will have to move out to the Camp before long. I will say something about the Camp and other things in my next.

I do want to hear regularly from you all, and the Lord knows I would like to see you all. I do want to see the babies and my Ma. God bless you all. I forgot to mention that I received a very handsom Christmas gift from Will and Parma of a set of gold and enamel sleeve buttons and shirt studs. I also received from the Colonel, a very handsom letter of acknowledgment of the receipt of an ivory and gold lead pencil, that I gave him.

Alex

Salt Lake City, U.T.
January 19th 1863

My Dear Sister,

How I should like to see you and the "babies," Ma and Cora and Frank— O I am so tired of staying away from home. I must be at home before much more time rolls away. I can't understand that worldly gain of any kind is a compensation for a good home. There are times when I think of home—many times. When I sit down alongside of the fire at night, I think of the dear ones encircling the cheerful fire at home—when I tumble into a hard bed with questionably clean sheets and pillow cases—when I wake up to eat a boarding house breakfast—when I hand a washwomen my clothes to be done up "grey as a badger," and on a hundred other occasions my mind reverts to home, and think how different it would be at home.

\[^{11}\] Hiram B. Clawson's involvement with dramatic performances began before the organization of the first theatrical company in Salt Lake City. The Musical and Dramatic Company grew out of the need for social amusements and recreation. Clawson had four wives of whom two were daughters of Brigham Young. Clawson married Ellen Curtis Spencer in 1850; Margaret Gay Judd in 1851; Alice Young in 1856; and Emily Young in 1868. At the time Alex saw the production at the Salt Lake Theatre, Clawson was married to only one of Brigham Young's daughters. For more information see Edward W. Tullidge, _History of Salt Lake City and Its Founders_ (Salt Lake City, 1880), pp. 735-39; Roberta R. Asahina, "Brigham Young and the Salt Lake Theater, 1862-1877" (Ph.D. diss., Tufts University, 1980).
Did you ever think I would turn up amongst the “Latter Day Saints.” They are a queer people to me. When I go to the theatre and see a man sitting in a seat with six or seven women around him all his wives—it looks odd. Some people think it strange, that a man should marry his wife’s sister, after his wife is dead, but here a man marries the whole family—the mother, daughters and all. Brigham says he don’t know how many wives he has got—that is, spiritual wives. He says that he has never refused yet to marry any respectable woman that wanted to marry him. Some that he marries he never sees again after the marriage ceremony is performed. These spiritual wives may become the temporal wives of other men, but in the next world, they are Brighmans.

The people of this valley have to rely a good deal upon home manufacture for their wants. They make a good deal of their clothing, furniture etc. Everything raised or manufactured in the valley, is called “Valley tan.” They have no market for anything they raise except among themselves, and as all their cash has to be sent abroad to pay for such things as they can’t produce the consequences is, that they haven’t any money. In trading with one another, they exchange one article of produce for another. If they want to go to the theatre they take along a couple dozen eggs, a pumpkin, peck of apples or any “plunder” they may have, to trade for a ticket. They have looms for weaving rag carpets, and carding machines, and spinning wheels and all those old style “notions.” It makes me think of old times to see the people going about with home spun clothes on, and the women without hoops. I went to the Tabernacle yesterday and heard Brigham preach. He is a very good speaker—he has a clear voice, and pronounces distinctly. His discourse was short, and about the manner in which the people received the ordinances of the church. He was not in a talkative mood and didn’t spread himself. In the evening I went to one of their ward meetings, and heard Orson Pratt speak. His discourse was about the future expectations of the “Saint.” I judged from his discourse that the Mormons believe in a future kingdom on earth—that is, they expect to enjoy an eternal life on earth with their houses and lands, cattle and wives (wives last) but in a more perfect state than now. Orson said that the Saints would go back to Jackson County Missouri and build the city of Zion after the pattern the Lord should give them, and if any poor miserable Gentiles wanted to associate with them then, he would say to them “that there was stone to quarry and choice timbers to hew for the temple, and when they went and quarried the stone and hewed the timbers and built the City of Zion, then he would think of receiving them into the Company of Saints.” You had better come out here and be numbered with the Saints, or you will have to work like a slave some day, to be enabled to associate with them.

Orson Pratt was born in Hartford, New York, on September 19, 1811, and died in Salt Lake City on October 3, 1881. During his life he was one of the most influential of the early Mormon leaders. His writing and oratory influenced Mormon doctrine and history in the formative years of the church. Pratt was the first of the original Mormon pioneers to enter the Salt Lake Valley and dedicated the site of Salt Lake City before Brigham Young saw it. Pratt was an indefatigable missionary, filling seven missions to Europe, establishing the first LDS missions in Austria and Scotland, and filling at least eleven missions to the eastern United States. For more information see Breck England, The Life and Thought of Orson Pratt (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985).
There are but few Gentile families here. There are a number of Gentile men, but they won't bring their families here to live, and they are right. What few Gentiles there are, are here on business. My acquaintance is principally amongst them and the officers at the "Camp." I have made the acquaintance of Gov. Doty Supt. of Indian Affairs, Mr. Frdk Cook Asst. Treas. of Overland Mail Co., Mr. Livingston merchant, Mr. Roomfield bookkeeper of O.M. Co., Judge Drake of the U.S. Dist. Court, and the officers in "Camp" generally. Among the "Saints" I have made the acquaintance of Mr. Stenhouse Post-Master and Bro. Townsend hotel keeper.16

The officers at the "Camp" give a ball to night, to which I am invited. I will delay this letter until tomorrow and tell you about it.

January 21st I attended the ball last night and had a pleasant time. Gov. Harding17 of this territory was present and "all went merry as a marriage bell." They danced until

"The wee small hours [not legible]."

An excellent supper was served, and I think all enjoyed themselves very much.

16Not all of the people named by Alex could be identified; however, those that can be include: James Duane Doty, who appeared on the western scene at age nineteen in 1818 and was destined to become an important personality in frontier America. He had extensive political experience in Wisconsin Territory, including congressional representative and territorial governor. Abraham Lincoln appointed Doty as Indian agent for Utah in 1861. Two years later he was appointed territorial governor of Utah and, on June 13, 1865, died in office and was buried in the Fort Douglas Cemetery. For more information see Alice E. Smith, James Duane Doty: Frontier Promoter (Madison: State Historical Society of Wisconsin, 1954). Frederick K. Cook, treasurer of the Overland Mail Company, left New York City for Salt Lake City around July 24, 1861. Letters dated December 19, 1861, place Cook at the Deep Creek Station about 173 miles west of Salt Lake City. As part of his employment obligations, Cook traveled the mail line visiting the various stations and taking care of business. He remained treasurer of the Overland Mail Company during the period of time covered by Badger's letters. Livingston, merchant, is most likely James Monroe Livingston, a partner of the firm of Livingston and Kinkead which began operation in 1849 and imported the first regular stock of goods for the Utah market. The stock for 1849 was valued at $20,000. The firm went through some changes becoming Livingston, Kinkead & Company and then Livingston and Bell. For more information see Tullidge, History of Salt Lake City, p. 155. Hiram S. Rumfield of Tiffin, Ohio, was assistant treasurer and agent of the Overland Mail Company in Salt Lake City between 1861 and 1866. The letters written by Rumfield to his wife are important source materials regarding the conflict between federal authorities and the Mormons during the Civil War. For information regarding the operation of the Overland Mail Company and the people involved, see Archer B. Hulbert, ed., Letters of an Overland Mail Agent in Utah (Worcester, Mass.: American Antiquarian Society, 1929). Judge Thomas J. Drake was appointed to the first or central district and as chief justice to the third or northern district of Utah and arrived in Salt Lake City at the same time as Governor Harding. For more information see Gustive O. Larson, "Utah and the Civil War," Utah Historical Quarterly 33 (1965): 55-77. Stenhouse is most probably the Mormon critic Thomas Brown Holmes Stenhouse (1825-82). He was a Mormon missionary in England where he married in 1850. Coming to Utah, the couple fell away from the Mormon faith because of the belief in polygamy. Embittered, both undertook the writing of books to expose to the world the outrages of the Saints. Stenhouse published The Rocky Mountain Saints: A Full and Complete History of the Mormons, from the First Vision of Joseph Smith to the Last Courtship of Brigham Young (New York: D. Appleton and Company, 1873). Mrs. Stenhouse also published a volume denouncing the institution of polygamy and the Mormon leadership that advanced it. See An Englishwoman in Utah: The Story of a Life's Experience in Mormonism (London: Sampson Low, Marston, Searle & Rivington, 1882). Brother Townsend can not be positively identified.

17Stephen H. Harding was appointed territorial governor, replacing John W. Dawson. Harding arrived in Salt Lake City in July 1861 and set popular feeling against him when he petitioned Congress to alter the territorial Organic Act to restrict the local courts and give federal officials the responsibility of juror selection and the appointment of militia officers. In response to petitions from Mormon representatives, President Lincoln removed Harding as territorial governor in June 1863, and he left Salt Lake City the same month. For more information see Richard D. Poll, ed. Utah's History (Provo, Utah: Brigham Young University Press, 1978); and Larson, "Utah and the Civil War."
Dear Moother,

Yesterday and to-day have been beautiful Spring days—very appropriate for the first days of Spring. Nothing of particular interest has transpired since the Indian fight on Bear River. The total number of Indians killed in the fight is 255—the number of soldiers killed is 25. Expeditions will leave the post in the latter part of this Spring to hunt up Pocatello and his band of Indians. Pocatello is a very bad Indian and has been guilty of much mischief. Among the plunder captured in the fight, was a scalp of a white woman attached to a spear, quite a quantity of letters supposed to have been taken from some expressmen killed by the Indians a few weeks before, were also captured, and various articles taken from emigrants they had killed. There is a general desire amongst the people here to have them all killed off.

I am at present well satisfied with my situation—that is, I am satisfied that I had better be here than in the States, and now that I am here and settled, I had better hold on for a while. Running around don't pay.

I have been boarding with Mr. Hopper a Lieutenant of the 2d Cavalry, but he and his wife are going to Sacramento, so I will mess for the future with Liet. Ustick of the 3d Infantry. I don't like this business of running around,

---

18 On January 29, 1863, members of the California Volunteers stationed at Camp Douglas attacked a village of Northwestern Shoshoni Indians encamped on the Bear River near present-day Preston, Idaho. Estimates vary, but at least 250 Indians died in this encounter, while the lives of 25 soldiers were lost. For the most recent examination of the Shoshoni-white conflict resulting in the massacre on Bear River, see Brigham D. Madsen, The Shoshoni Frontier and the Bear River Massacre (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1985).

19 Pocatello was born around 1815 and became a leader of the Northwestern Shoshoni. Between 1859 and 1864 he earned a national reputation as a "dangerous and intransigent" leader of a band of renegade Indians. He survived this Indian-white conflict to die an old man in 1884. For more information see Brigham D. Madsen, Chief Pocatello, the "White Plume" (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1986).

20 William Burchell Hooper, born in Vermont, was mustered into the California Volunteers on July 28, 1862, in Sacramento and was assigned as a second lieutenant, Company F, also known as the "Sacramento Rangers," Second California Cavalry. After a promotion to first lieutenant, Hooper resigned on March 18, 1863, to return to Sacramento to accept a captaincy, United States Volunteers. On March 13, 1865, he was promoted to major for meritorious service in his department during the Civil War and was honorably mustered out of the service on July 13, 1866. Hietman, Historical Register and Dictionary of the United States Army, p. 541.

21 William L. Ustick joined the California Volunteers at Stockton, California, on October 10, 1861, and was assigned as a second lieutenant to the Third Regiment of Infantry. While at Camp Douglas he was transferred from Company A to Company G and promoted to first lieutenant on December 2, 1862. Ustick remained in Salt Lake City at least through March 1864 when he resigned his commission. For more information see Orton, Records of California Men in the War of the Rebellion, 1861 to 1867, pp. 505-94.
and I want to squat on some little patch of Uncle Sams' domain and stick there. "A rolling stone gathers no Moss." I never dare to think of procuring any comfort of any kind, for such a thing is unknown to a person travelling about. If I succeed in inducing anybody to let me board with them (no matter what kind of grub I get) I conclude that I am all right and console myself with the promise of a better time coming—wait a little longer.

I enclose you a sketch of the camp of the 3d Infty. with the Great Salt Lake in the distance. There are three sides of our Camp occupied by quarters—the north side by the camp of the 3d Infty. — the east side by the officers of the Command and the south side by the Camp of the 2d Cavy. The west side looks toward the valley and the Lake. The lake is about sixteen miles from the Camp. Only a portion of it is visible. The water of the lake are very salt, only three barrels of water are required to make a barrel of salt—that is in the winter when the lake is high, but in the Summer, two and a half barrels will make one barrel of salt. No living thing is known to exist in it, and it is said that birds will not fly over it. The sketch I send will give you some idea of the appearance of the country. When the weather gets warm and the grass comes up so that I can get about, I will make some sketches of the valley, lake, Camp and other objects of interest. I received a letter from [not legible] Campbell a few days ago. He is teaching school again in Aberdeen Ohio. I am well and at present am busy making up papers.

You wouldn't know your "boy" now, he has such stunning whiskers, and the mustachios is about as far advanced as mustard is, when fit for "greens." There are no girls in Camp to appreciate them so I am not very careful as to style. We are to have a "shin dig" in "Camp" on St. Patricks Day in the Morning O. You know that most of the 3d Infty. are Irish and of course, St. Patrick is a great as man as Fourth of July. No more a present.

From your affectionate Son
Alex

Camp Douglas U.Ty.
May 10th 1863

Dear Mother:

Having mailed my papers for the last month and recruited myself by a pleasant ride yesterday up Parleys Kanyon, I feel like having a talk with the folks at home. I have been busy for a month and had quite a big pile of papers to send off; but now I am free until Brigham gets back to the City from his summer tour, which will be in a week or so, then, I have a lot of accounts to settle with the old fellow, which together with my usual office duties will busy me for near two months; after which, I hope the Lord will deliver me from the land of Zion. Excuse my impiety—but if this is the valley where the Lord intends to corral the Saints, I would rather dwell with the lost sheep somewhere in the Mississippi valley or California.
I don't think I have ever given you a good description of this valley, and will endeavor now to give you some idea of the place. The valley is about thirty miles long and fifteen or twenty wide, running nearly north and south. On the north it is bounded partly by the Wasatch mountains and partly by a dreary desert stretching in a north-westerly direction to Great Salt Lake. On the west side lies the Oquirrh mountains— on the south, the Traverse range and on the east the Wasatch range. The soil of the valley is miserably poor being considerably mixed with alkali in some places and with gravel and boulders in all places. Irrigation is necessary to insure a crop of anything. This irrigating is very easily accomplished here, owing to the formation of the land—it being a series of benches, as they are called here—I enclose a diagram for a better illustration. A great deal of fruit is raised in the valley also grain. Grasshoppers, Crickets, ants owls, cyotes, crows, badgers, (I am ashamed of the rascals) skunks and Mormons are the principal inhabitants. Milk and honey do not flow down the mountain sides as some have asserted. I have however, seen the women drive the cows down the mountain sides in the evening, which is the nearest approach to milk and honey I have seen. The valley is bare of timber. I can stand in front of the office, and as far as the eye can see in any direction, not a tree or bush, save that planted by the Mormons, can be seen—all is bare and sterile in appearance. The Mormons have made the City and the lands bordering the Jordan to bloom and blossom as the rose. The City at present is very beautiful in appearance. On each side of the streets, locust and cottonwood trees are planted and are green and shady. Grass grows on each side of the gutters and gives the streets a fresh appearance. Every house or family has a large garden—most of them full of peach and apple trees. The fragrances

Drawing included in Badger's letter of May 10.
from the blooming peach trees is delightful. I often think though, that the city is like a whitened sepulcher—fair without, but within—full of rottenness and dead men's bones.

I am acquainted with a Mormon woman in town, who said to a friend of mine the other day, “that now her husband had gone east, she felt contented in mind for he was free from temptation and evil”—that is, he was free from the temptation of taking a second wife. Poor woman, she has lived in an agony of fear while her husband was here, for fear he (whom she loves with all her heart) would take a second wife. Just think—she has lived with him for a number of years—has borne him seven children—and at this late day to have a rival share his love—to bad—would you, could any woman of spirit bear it? And yet this is but one case of hundreds—some, many much sadder.

I went up Parly Kanyon yesterday with a party of folks, to meet some friends coming from the east by stage. We had a carriage and four horses, and three horsemen. There were six in the carriage—Billy Gilbert, Horace Wheat, Miss. Samareux, Mrs. Belt, the driver and myself. Messrs. Carleton, Ellsworth and Fippin rode horseback. Mr. Gilbert (Billy Gilbert's father) and Mrs. Belts' daughter Nannie Belt were the parties we went to meet and escort into town. We had a gay time and were happy. The ride up the Kanyon was charming—the scenery grand. We found the folks we went after, and you may be assured that Mrs. Belt was glad to meet her daughter after an absence of a year or so, and so was I, for she was a mighty nice little gal—blue eyes, light hair, and fair complexion—charming.

I have an old Danish woman to cook for me, who gets up some very queer but good dishes, and Col. Evans and Capt. Wallace have a woman to cook for them, who they say beats everything cooking nice dishes. We occasionally send the colonel and captain some of our nice dishes, and they return the compliment by sending some of theirs. Mrs. Reid also exchanges with us occasionally. This morning I was considerably amused by the following occurrence. It so happened that we all had batter cakes for breakfast, and Jenny (Mrs. Reid's colored girl) took some of hers up to Col. Evans, when Mrs. James (the Colonels' Cook) got "mifty" and wanted to know what Jenny brought cakes up there for, as she could bake a good deal better, so Mrs. James sent some of her cakes down to me, when my cook got "mifty" and said she guessed she bake as good Cakes as anybody. So to keep peace in the family I had to eat my cooks cakes—but it required considerable self denial. Capt. Wallace, who has just gone up to the Colonels tells me to give you his compliments and to say, that he thinks I am getting fat on the good thing that the ex-cook of the King of Denmark cooks for me. My cook came from Denmark.

Remember me to my dear Grandmother and to my relations. I hope Grandma is well and that she is well cared for. You don't write for any money you surly must want some. Don't you? Say to Alice that she shall have the next letter.

Your ever affectionate son
Alex

None of the people named by Alex can be positively identified.
In February 1887 the U.S. Supreme Court ordered the release from prison of seventy-three-year-old polygamist and Mormon apostle Lorenzo Snow. In one of the few appellate court victories won by the Mormons, the court rejected the prosecutorial theory of segregation which could have allowed prosecutors to rack up life sentences on polygamists for the misdemeanor crime of unlawful cohabitation. The victory brought a shift of Mormon defense strategy from one of flight on the underground to what amounted to a policy of civil disobedience, hoping to fill up federal prisons with faithful Mormon husbands and win over public sympathy.

The legal landscape was bleak for the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints in 1886. The next four years would be even bleaker. The national uproar over polygamy and the Utah theocracy had been mobilized into an effective federal prosecutorial mechanism. The third of four anti-Mormon laws passed by Congress, the Edmunds Act of 1882, disqualified Mormons from serving on juries, effectively denied them the vote, provided for the seizure of all church properties over $50,000, reenacted the felony crime of polygamy, and added the new misdemeanor offense of unlawful cohabitation. Mormon lawyers began a series of largely futile appellate protests that one by one were denied by the U.S. Supreme Court.

Mr. Driggs is completing a master of laws degree at the University of Wisconsin.
The government's segregation theory had seemed but one more blow of the hammer, and the Latter-day Saints saw little hope for relief. Mormon historians attribute the theory of segregation to Territorial District Judge Charles S. Zane who supposedly first instructed a grand jury on it in September 1885. Reportedly, Zane complained out loud in a May 1885 cohabitation sentencing that he could not give polygamists long enough prison sentences under the misdemeanor provisions of the Edmunds Act. After court U.S. attorney for Utah William H. Dickson suggested the substance of the segregation theory to him. Both liked it and in the next grand jury session worked together to implement it.

Under the segregation theory the Edmunds Act crime of unlawful cohabitation became a continuing offense. The period of time that an individual defendant engaged in it could be divided, with each segment giving rise to a separate misdemeanor count. In Snow's case, he was charged, convicted, and sentenced on three counts (1883, 1884, and the first eleven months of 1885), receiving the maximum $800 fine and six months in prison on each. The indictments were returned by a Territorial First District Court grand jury in Ogden on December 5, 1885. Carried to its logical limit, Zane's theory would have permitted a separate count for each month, week, day, or less, each carrying a separate six-month prison sentence. Contemporary historian Andrew Jenson reflected the prevailing Mormon belief when he stated that segregation permitted imprisonment for life for a misdemeanor offense. Small wonder that Mormon men and women preferred flight on the underground to facing the increasingly hostile courts.

“Going on the underground could mean anything from simply hiding in a secret room at home, extensive traveling, or moving all or part of the family to a nearby community or another state,” according to one historian. Some wives fled to Europe where they had relatives or friends in order to remove themselves as evidence. Many families moved to Mexico where the government prized industrious Mormon farmers and declined to prosecute. Others moved to western Canada,

---

1 The Edmunds Act, ch. 47, 22 Stat. 30 (1882), sec. 3 reads: “That if any male person, in a Territory or other place over which the United States have exclusive jurisdiction, hereafter cohabits with more than one woman he shall be deemed guilty of a misdemeanor, and on a conviction thereof shall be punished by a fine of not more than three hundred dollars, or by imprisonment for not more than six months, or by both said punishments, in the discretion of the court.”

2 Desert Evening News, February 11, 1887; Andrew Jenson, Church Chronology (Salt Lake City, 1899), p. 124.

3 In Re Snow, 120 U.S. 274, 276, 7 S. Ct. 556, 30 L.Ed. 658, 660 (1887).

but because antipolygamy laws were enforced there a man could be accompanied by just one wife and family. Church leaders were called on special missions to evade the authorities, often to Arizona Territory where they lived under assumed names.\(^5\) Those who remained in Utah lived in constant fear of the "deps" or deputies and of government informants known as spotters. Elaborate and usually effective Mormon lookout systems warned of approaching strangers and known federal agents, allowing families to hide.\(^6\) Like all prominent polygamous Mormons, Snow found his life much disrupted by the persistence of federal authorities.

Snow's involvement with the Latter-day Saints was about as comprehensive as it could be. Born in Ohio in 1814, he first met the Mormon prophet Joseph Smith, Jr., as a guest in his parent's home in 1831, and in 1836 joined his sister, the remarkable Eliza R. Snow, in the Mormon community of Kirtland, Ohio. There he received instruction from Smith and other leaders of the faith and in June was baptized by Apostle John F. Boynton in the Chagrin River. Snow became a devoted member, serving missions in Europe and the United States. He lived in Nauvoo, Illinois, and suffered the privations of the Saints when they were driven west in 1846-47 after the murder of Smith and his brother Hyrum by an anti-Mormon mob. In 1848 Smith's successor, Brigham Young, called Snow to the church's Council of the Twelve Apostles. Snow continued his periodic European missions, served in the Utah Territorial Legislature, and organized one of the most successful United Order communities in Brigham City, Utah. In 1898 Snow would himself become president of the church upon the death of Wilford Woodruff. During his tenure as president he would urge Mormons to comply with Woodruff's 1890 Manifesto discontinuing the practice of polygamy, and he would save the church from financial collapse with his institution of a cash tithe. He died in 1901 at age eighty-seven, having served for fifty-three years as apostle or church president.

When first indicted for unlawful cohabitation Snow was seventy-one years old and second only to Wilford Woodruff in seniority within

---


\(^6\) Embry, *Mormon Polygamous Families*, pp. 17-27. Spotters were very unpopular with the Mormons, and direct action was sometimes taken against them. See *Deseret Evening News*, May 22, 1885.
the Council of the Twelve Apostles. He had been married to nine wives, seven of whom were living during his three trials.7 His lead defense attorney was Franklin Snyder Richards.8

Indicted by the grand jury on December 5, 1885, Snow pleaded not guilty on December 11 and was tried in the reverse order of the periods covered by the indictments. The curious filled the courtroom in Ogden for all three trials. As one reporter noted, “The Snow cases draw well.”9 On December 13, 1885, Snow was convicted on the 1885 charge. On January 5, 1886, he was convicted on the 1884 indictment and convicted on the 1883 indictment later that same day. It is interesting to note that the important test case of Cannon v. United States,10 defining the minimum evidence necessary for the government to convict for unlawful cohabitation, came on December 14, 1885, just after the first Snow trial. News of the decision reached Utah the next day.11

Zane, the trial judge, ruled that because Snow had married his first two wives, Adaline Goddard and Charlotte Squires, in the same 1845 Nauvoo ceremony both marriages were unlawful. Therefore, Sarah Prichard, whom Snow had married later in 1845, was the lawful wife. Sarah testified that she had been married to Snow about forty years, had grown children by him, and had lived at a compound known as “the old homestead” with wives Harriet Squires and Eleanor Houtz, for nearly thirty years. She said Snow called on her occasionally, two or three times in 1885, but no room was kept for him at the homestead; and since he had moved into a new brick house with his most recent and youngest wife, Sara Jensen, he had not slept at the homestead. Other wives also appeared on the witness stand. Harriet testified as to her December 1846 marriage to Snow. She apparently had a separate house at the

---


8A son of Mormon Apostle Franklin D. Richards, he was born in Salt Lake City in 1849; married Emily S. Tanner, his only wife, in 1868; and shortly thereafter moved to Ogden where he became clerk of the county and probate courts and county recorder. In 1874 he was admitted to the territorial bar. He worked to untangle the gordian knot of Brigham Young's estate following the church leader's death in 1877 and in 1880 was retained as general attorney and counsel for the church, a position he held for most of the rest of his life. He and his attorney brother, Charles C. Richards, were among a group of attorneys retained throughout the territory to defend Mormons charged under the Edmunds Act. He would eventually be the attorney of record in a great many Utah trials and in eighteen U.S. Supreme Court decisions, eleven of which concerned polygamy. See Jenson, LDS Biographical Encyclopedia, 4:55-59; “Address Delivered by President Franklin S. Richards to the High Priests Quorum of Ensign Stake,” November 13, 1932, typescript, LDS Church Library-Archives, Salt Lake City.

9Salt Lake Tribune, January 5, 1886.

10116 U.S. 55, 6 S. Ct. 278, 29 L. Ed. 561 (1885).

11Salt Lake Tribune, December 15, 1885.
compound. Snow continued to support her but did not visit her much. Mary Houtz testified Snow rarely visited her either. Eleanor reported that she saw less of Snow over the years as his responsibilities increased and he traveled more.

The court heard testimony from Dr. J. B. Carrington as to Snow's public appearances with his wives and from an unidentified officer who had arrested Snow after discovering a concealed trap door in his house leading to two small apartments where Snow was hidden. Upon his arrest Snow was reported to have told the officers, "That is all right, boys; you have done your duty. Come and take a drink with me."

Apparently Snow had lived at the homestead with at least six wives until 1882 when he and Minnie moved to the new brick home a short distance down the block. Sarah testified that "when the gates were left open, it is the same yard." The court also made much of the fact that in the community reference to the "Snow family" was understood to include all the wives and children.

Before the second trial Snow's attorney argued that the initial conviction barred further prosecutions, but the trial court brushed that argument aside and proceeded with the selection of a second jury. The defense had raised this question earlier and would later have to take it to the U.S. Supreme Court before getting relief.

Snow appeared before Judge Orlando W. Powers for sentencing on January 16, 1886. Richards first argued for a lighter sentence based upon the apostle's age and "his previous good standing in the community." Then Snow addressed the court, his first comment since the proceedings began. The anti-Mormon Salt Lake Tribune wrote: "When the court asked him if he proposed to obey the law in the future, he said that considering the fact that he had been convicted without evidence when he had been obeying the law since its passage, he was surprised that the court should ask such a question, and that he did not care to answer it." Judge Powers apparently saw defiance in these words and awarded Snow the maximum sentence: six months in the territorial penitentiary and a $300 fine on each of the three convictions, a total of eighteen months and $900.

Less than a month after sentencing, the territorial supreme court affirmed in all respects. Zane wrote the opinion, affirming his own

18Salt Lake Tribune, January 17, 1886.
earlier trial rulings, saying, "the evidence against the defendant shows one of the most aggravated cases and worst examples of polygamy." He then characterized Snow:

It appears from the evidence that the defendant is 72-years old, and has married nine wives, and that seven of those wives are still living. To the first he was married in his youth. As his passion for one wife became satiated and dulled by the appearance of a younger and fresher, or possibly a more attractive, one, he would marry again, until his marriages had been repeated nine times.\textsuperscript{16}

In affirming Snow's conviction Zane relied on the recent Cannon decision and his understanding of the purpose of the Edmunds Act.

The next opinion was written by territorial district judge and supreme court justice Jacob Boreman, affirming Snow's conviction for 1884. This opinion notes that most testimony in polygamy cases is extracted from "unwilling witnesses" who "are generally members of the different households of the defendant, under his influence, and also subject to powerful church pressure to compel them to shield the accused." Boreman also observed:

In the case under consideration, we find a state of affairs which, by the facts developed in this class of trials, is coming to be well known to have a common existence in this territory. The wife of a man's youth, and all other women with whom he had lived as husband more or less of the time, and who have reared children to him, are, as they grow old, pushed off to lead a more lonely life, and the principal attention of the man is given to the youngest and most favored of his women. It is the natural result of a system founded in sensualism, and is the same here as in every other country where polygamy or any other system exists to shield the lust of man.\textsuperscript{17}

The third territorial district judge and supreme court justice, Orlando Powers, wrote the third opinion affirming a trial conviction, stating: "The American idea of government is founded on the Christian idea of home,—where one father and one mother, each equal of the other, happy in the consequences of mutual and eternal affection, rear about the hearthstone an intelligent and God-fearing family."\textsuperscript{18} Most of this opinion traces the history of antipolygamy efforts and makes almost no comment on the facts elicited in Snow's trial.

Interestingly, Zane dissented from both the Boreman and Powers affirmances. His dissent did not express any change of heart on the

\textsuperscript{16} United States v. Snow, 9 P. at 503 and 505. Zane did not define which of Snow's indictments and trials his opinion relates to.

\textsuperscript{17} United States v. Snow, 9 P. at 687-688.

\textsuperscript{18} United States v. Snow, 4 Utah 313, 9 P. 697, 698 (Utah Terr. 1886).
theory of segregation, but he felt that the evidence of cohabitation presented at trial fell short of what he would require to convict.19

By the time the Snow case moved into the appellate courts Mormons and federal judges were well acquainted with each other, and there was not much affection in that relationship. The three territorial district courts were presided over by generally hostile federal appointees. Under the act that organized Utah Territory in 1850 the three district court judges also served as the Utah Territorial Supreme Court, reviewing their own lower court decisions on appeal.20 By the late 1880s this court had established an antagonistic relationship with the Mormons. Aside from early affirmances of the 1874 Poland Act and a ruling on the bitter legal disputes over the Brigham Young estate,21 however, it was 1885 before much Mormon business came before this court, partly the result of the Mormon preference for resolving disputes in ecclesiastical courts.22 The U.S. Supreme Court decision in Cannon v.

19United States v. Snow, 9 P. at 696 and 705.
20An Act to Establish a Territorial Government for Utah, ch. 51, 9 stat. 453 (1850). Section 9 organizes the territorial court system.
21Shepperd v. District Court, 1 Utah 340 (Utah Terr. 1876) and People v. Lee, 2 Utah 411 (Utah Terr. 1877) on the Poland Act, and Young v. Cannon, 2 Utah 561 (Utah Terr. 1879).
United States triggered a flood of cohabitation appeals in the territory to go with the few polygamy cases and other related matters.\footnote{Cohabitation appeals to the Utah Territorial Supreme Court included: United States v. Musser, 4 Ut. 153, 7 P. 389 (Utah Terr. 1885); United States v. Groesbeck, 4 Ut. 487, 11 P. 542 (Utah Terr. 1886); United States v. Clark, 5 Ut. 226, 14 P. 288 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Smith, 5 Ut. 232, 14 P. 291 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Peay, 5 Ut. 263, 14 P. 342 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Harris, 5 Ut. 436, 17 P. 75 (Utah Terr. 1888); United States v. Clark, 6 Ut. 120, 21 P. 463 (Utah Terr. 1889). Polygamy cases included United States v. Miles, 2 Ut. 19 (Utah Terr. 1879); United States v. Clawson, 4 Ut. 34, 5 P. 629 (Utah Terr. 1885); and United States v. Simpson, 4 Ut. 227, 7 P. 257 (Utah Terr. 1885). Other related cases included Ex Parte Clawson, 5 P. 74 (Utah Terr. 1884); Wener v. United States, 4 Ut. 239, 9 P. 293 (Utah Terr. 1886); People v. Hampton, 4 Ut. 258, 9 P. 508 (Utah Terr. 1886); United States v. Eldridge and Another, 5 Ut. 161, 15 P. 673 (Utah Terr. 1887); and United States v. Brown, 6 Ut. 115, 21 P. 461 (Utah Terr. 1889).}

Appeals from the territory were taken directly to the U.S. Supreme Court, which usually ruled within a very brief period by modern standards. Since first rejecting the Mormons’ claim of First Amendment protection for religiously based polygamy in 1879, the U.S. Supreme Court had ruled on claims involving spousal immunity, the right to bond for polygamy defendants, general challenges to the Edmunds Act of 1882, congressional repeal of the voting rights of polygamists, and had finally approved an extremely broad sufficiency of the evidence standard for the new federal crime of cohabitation.\footnote{Reynolds v. United States, 98 U.S. 145, 25 L. Ed. 244, 10 Rose Notes (1879); Miles v. United States, 103 U.S. 803, 26 L. Ed. 481, 11 Rose Notes (1880); Clawson v. United States, 113 U.S. 143, 5 S. Ct. 395, 28 L. Ed. 597 (1885); Clawson v. United States, 114 U.S. 15, 5 S. Ct. 747, 29 L. Ed. 47 (1885); Joseph H. Grober, “The Mormon Disfranchisements of 1882 to 1892,” Brigham Young University Studies 16 (Spring 1976): 399-408; Cannon v. United States, 116 U.S. 55, 6 S. Ct. 278, 29 L. Ed. 561 (1885) and 4 Ut. 222, 7 P. 369 (Utah Terr. 1885); and Ken Driggs, “The Prosecutions Begin: Defining Cohabitation in 1885,” Dialogue: A Journal of Mormon Thought 21 (Spring 1988): 109-25.}

Having lost his case in Utah, Snow took the next step. Richards and a second attorney, George T. Curtis, took the cause directly to the U.S. Supreme Court where it was argued in April and decided in May 1886.\footnote{Deseret Evening News, May 21, 25, June 1, 1886.} The court ducked a ruling on Snow’s substantive arguments by finding that it lacked jurisdiction, even though the government had not raised that issue in defending the territorial supreme court’s affirmance. Jurisdiction was lacking based on the language of an 1853 federal statute concerning appellate jurisdiction from territorial supreme courts to the nation’s high court. The court acknowledged that for the same reason it should not have accepted jurisdiction in the earlier Cannon decision and would almost immediately recall the Cannon mandate.\footnote{Snow v. United States, 118 U.S. 535, 6 S. Ct. 1064, 29 L. Ed. 562 (1886).}

\footnote{United States v. Musser, 4 Ut. 153, 7 P. 389 (Utah Terr. 1885); United States v. Groesbeck, 4 Ut. 487, 11 P. 542, 543 (Utah Terr. 1886); United States v. Clark, 5 Ut. 226, 14 P. 288, 289 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Smith, 5 Ut. 232, 14 P. 291, 293 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Peay, 5 Ut. 263, 14 P. 342 (Utah Terr. 1887); United States v. Harris, 5 Ut. 436, 17 P. 75, 77 (Utah Terr. 1888); United States v. Kuntze, 2 Id. 480, 14 P. 407 (Idaho Terr. 1889); and United States v. Clark, 6 Ut. 120, 21 P. 463, 464 (Utah Terr. 1889).}
Associate Justice Samuel Blatchford wrote that a direct challenge to the validity of the statute, here the Edmunds Act, was required in order for the high court to have jurisdiction. Snow's argument had not challenged the constitutionality of the statute, no doubt believing the Cannon decision disposed of that. The opinion did state that writs of habeas corpus involving the question of personal freedom did meet the requirements of the statute to establish Supreme Court jurisdiction.\(^28\)

Through Richards, Snow began the habeas corpus process with a petition to the territorial courts in October 1886 after serving the first six months of his eighteen-month prison sentence. Snow's petition was denied,\(^29\) and he returned to the U.S. Supreme Court. Richards and Curtis filed on November 22, 1886; the case was argued in January 1887 and decided on February 7, again in an opinion by Blatchford.

In their brief Richards and Curtis stressed that "The question presented by this appeal is not on the word 'cohabit', in reference to the character and kind of intercourse supposed to constitute the offense, but it is on the meaning of the word 'cohabit', in reference to the continuity or duration of that intercourse."\(^30\) They framed the question as to "whether that continuous cohabitation constituted one offense or three, and whether the prosecutor was at liberty, on his own option, to divide up the entire period of time into separate periods." They then argued that "If three indictments can legally be found in a case where the offense is manifestly and according to all reasonable construction, but a single one, the same reasoning or ruling will justify the finding of thirty or three hundred." They calculated that charging a single count for each day of the period, the logical extension of the government's theory, would result in "imprisonment of 547 years and fines amounting to $328,500."\(^31\)

The government responded with a rather weak twelve-page brief by Assistant Attorney General William A. Maury. His primary argument was that Snow's present complaint should be barred because of his failure to raise these issues in his initial writ of error, that a writ of habeas corpus was the wrong vehicle.\(^32\)

Writing for a unanimous court, Blatchford said that unlawful cohabitation was "inherently a continuous offense, having duration, and not an offense consisting of an isolated act." Furthermore,
The division of the two years and eleven months is wholly arbitrary. On the same principle there might have been an indictment covering each of the thirty-five months, with imprisonment for seventeen years and a half and fines amounting to $10,500 or even an indictment covering every week, with imprisonment for seventy-four years and fines amounting to $44,000; and so on, ad infinitum, for smaller periods of time. It is to prevent such an application of penal laws, that the rule has obtained that a continuing offense of the character of the one in this case can be committed but once, for the purposes of indictment or prosecution, prior to the time the prosecution is instituted.\textsuperscript{33}

The opinion went on to note that the government could not produce any case law supporting the kind of prosecutorial theory applied to Snow. The court remanded the matter to the territorial court with instructions to grant Snow's petition for habeas corpus and order his immediate release from prison.\textsuperscript{34}

Under the headline “Lorenzo, ‘The Martyr,”' the Salt Lake Tribune described Snow's release from the Utah Penitentiary of February 8, 1887. A party of about a hundred Mormons in twenty-five wagons, carriages, and one “four horse drag” met “the apostle of unrighteousness” late in the afternoon, escorting him to the Gardo House, the official residence of church president Wilford Woodruff. Later in the evening Snow preached to a priesthood meeting in the Assembly Hall on Salt Lake City's Temple Square. The Tribune noted that N. H. Groesbeck had also been released that day due to the Supreme Court decision and that about eighteen others would soon follow.\textsuperscript{35} In another sermon a few days after his release Snow said “he thanked God that he had been imprisoned” and that he would be willing to “go back a thousand times rather than disgrace and dishonor those women he had sworn to live with and protect.”\textsuperscript{36}

U.S. attorney for Utah W. H. Dickson soon received directions from the attorney general concerning the impact the decision would have on other cohabitation prisoners. The government begrudgingly began releasing these men at the six-month mark of their sentences. The Tribune observed that “the joy over the decision in the Snow case is most profound among all classes of Mormons.”\textsuperscript{37}

\textsuperscript{33}In Re Snow, 120 U.S. at 281-282.
\textsuperscript{34}Ibid., at 286-287.
\textsuperscript{35}Groesbeck had earlier appealed his conviction and sentence to the Utah Territorial Supreme Court without success. He raised the same objections to segregation on appeal as Snow did. United States v. Groesbeck, 4 Utah 487, 11 P. 542 (Utah Terr. 1886). The case was decided on July 8, 1886.
\textsuperscript{36}Salt Lake Tribune, February 15, 1887.
\textsuperscript{37}Salt Lake Tribune, February 10, 11, 1887.
Appellate Court Victory

An editorial in the Mormon Deseret Evening News called the decision “a tremendous snub at that despotic functionary [Dickson], who had been acting the role of judicial dictator to the courts of Utah.” The newspaper characterized it as “not a common reversal” and, further, as “the overthrow of a deliberate attempt to prostitute the law for the gratification of personal malice.”

Years later, in a 1932 church address, attorney Richards, who because of his role as chief architect of the Latter-day Saints’ legal defenses likely was involved in most key decisions, recalled that In Re Snow “caused a change of policy.” He explained:

Men who had been in hiding, because they were unwilling to incur the results of numerous prosecutions, came forward and pleaded guilty to one offense and paid the penalty. They were glad to terminate the trying condition of constant fear and apprehension, under which they had been obliged to live, and realized that after their terms of imprisonment expired they would come forth free men, without having made any promises. Hence they were ready and willing to accept the counsel and follow the examples of their leaders in pursuing this course. So numerous were they that the penitentiary was practically filled. Among them were George Q. Cannon, Francis M. Lyman, and other high church officials.

President Cannon was one of the first to take this important action. His keen, sagacious mind saw that it was the initial step toward reconciliation with the government, so he courageously led the way to prison, realizing that his voluntary surrender, followed by numerous others, would elicit sympathy at Washington, and hasten the solution...

What Richards seemed to be describing was the abandonment of a church policy of flight on the underground to avoid prosecution. As a result of In Re Snow the new policy became one of civil disobedience in defiance of what were seen as unjust laws but with humble submission to the legal consequences.

Richards’s analysis seems to be supported by a 1932 compilation of Edmunds Act prosecutions by assistant church historian Andrew Jenson, except as to the leadership of George Q. Cannon. “Prisoners for Conscience Sake” is a compilation of information on 883 individuals prosecuted between 1884 and 1892. The study is not comprehensive and probably only contains defendants in Utah Territory who were imprisoned; however, it appears to be a reliable measure of the timing and nature of the cases brought against some polygamous Mormons in Utah. The chronological listing shows Salt Lake Stake President Angus

---

91 Deseret Evening News, February 15, 22, 1887.
93 Handwritten original in LDS Church Library-Archives. The listing contains the details of the sentencing of 859 individuals and lists the remainder by name and place of imprisonment.
M. Cannon, brother of George Q. Cannon and the subject of the important 1885 test case on the new crime of cohabitation, as only the 6th individual imprisoned. Snow was the 73rd. George Q. Cannon, cited by Richards for his leadership, is shown as the 436th to be imprisoned, entering the Utah Territorial Penitentiary on September 17, 1888, for an unusually light seventy-five-day sentence and a $450 fine. The U.S. Supreme Court had decided *In Re Snow* on February 7, 1887, a year and a half before George Q. Cannon’s sentence. The Jenson compilation does show a marked increase in successful prosecutions after *In Re Snow*. Through February 1887 only 186 imprisoned individuals are listed, the great majority for unlawful cohabitation. By the end of 1889, 764 are shown as having been imprisoned.\(^1\)

Prosecutors again attempted to double up on the sentences of Mormon polygamists by using amendments to the Edmunds-Tucker Act of 1887. Section three of the act added the federal crime of adultery, punishable by up to three years imprisonment. The law provided that “when such act is committed between a married man and a woman who is unmarried, the man shall be deemed guilty of adultery.” The woman was not designated for punishment in such instances, only the man. Polygamist Hans Neilsen, prosecuted in 1888 for his two wives, Lavinia and Caroline, pleaded guilty to the misdemeanor unlawful cohabitation and received a sentence of three months in prison and a $100 fine. A second indictment charged him with the felony crime of adultery to which he pleaded not guilty. He was later convicted and sentenced to an additional term of 125 days.

Again Franklin S. Richards led the defense, and again the matter was taken to the U.S. Supreme Court on a petition for habeas corpus. Drawing liberally from their opinion *In Re Snow*, the Supreme Court ordered Neilsen freed. The opinion of Associate Justice Joseph P. Bradley was apparently adopted by the other eight justices. On the facts presented he ruled that Neilsen could be found guilty of and sentenced for only one, not both, of the offenses charged.\(^2\)

Beginning with Woodruff’s 1890 Manifesto and its adoption by a general conference of the church shortly thereafter, Mormons began a painful generation-long process of abandoning polygamy. Today it is

---


\(^2\) *Re Neilson*, 131 U.S. 176 9 S. Ct. 672, 33 L. Ed. 188 (1889). By this time polygamy prosecutions were winding down.
practiced only by fundamentalist splinter groups and is completely disavowed by the main body of the LDS church. The abandonment of polygamy was rewarded in 1896 with Utah statehood and an end to the relentless federal anti-Mormon campaign.

Most of the United States Supreme Court's nineteenth century polygamy decisions have fallen into disrepute, their continued validity questioned by legal scholars. The most famous case, *Reynolds v. United States*, supra, clings to life mostly for lack of a good set of facts on which to challenge. In *Re Snow* is perhaps the most alive of the polygamy cases. A discussion of *In Re Snow* was the starting point for the logic of the very important criminal decision of *Blockburger v. United States*. Most recently it has been cited as authority in other habeas corpus cases where an appellate court must decide if prosecutors abused the law by charging multiple counts for essentially one criminal episode.

With the death of Wilford Woodruff in 1897, Lorenzo Snow became president of the LDS church. Plural marriages under Woodruff had declined in the years leading up to and just after the Manifesto in 1890, but by 1896 they had begun to increase again and, in general, continued to increase through the administration of President Snow. His death in 1900 was followed by the administration of Joseph F. Smith, and plural marriages continued to increase until the so-called Second Manifesto of 1904. At that point the practice began to die out.

With or without *In Re Snow* it is probable that the Mormons would have had to abandon polygamy as the power of the federal forces arrayed against them were just too great to resist. It is not the major appellate court decision of the struggle, but it is a very important one that until now has largely been overlooked by historians.

---


I love the Great Basin and I hate books like *The Sagebrush Ocean*. Accounts such as Stephen Trimble’s or John McPhee’s *Basin and Range* should be banned. Why? Just basic selfishness. Trimble has come close to capturing the majestic diversity of the Basin in an exquisite language of written and photographic imagery, and I am terribly afraid he will attract the casual visitor to places that I find it impossible to be casual about. I much prefer those accounts that give the usual cursory view of the Basin as an “abomination of desolation.” As Trimble notes, the Great Basin is “only a vague notion as a public place . . . . Too dry to farm, too cold to retire to, too harsh for most seekers of beauty, even today the Great Basin remains sparse in population—a blank spot on vacation maps.” Until now that is; *The Sagebrush Ocean* may, unfortunately, fill in those maps.

Trimble’s natural history of the Great Basin is yet another in the fine Fleischmann Series in Great Basin Natural History being produced by the University of Nevada Press. Previous works include books on trees, birds, geology, shrubs, and fish. While the entire series is uniformly excellent, Trimble’s emotional account of the Great Basin as place stands alone in giving feeling to often dry scientific explanations. What I do not understand is why someone who clearly cares about the Basin as much as I do could produce something that is sure to attract the L. L. Bean crowd.

I have worked in the Basin for twenty-five years as an archaeologist and paleoecologist, and until now I thought the only way to explain my own attachment to visiting friends and colleagues was let them experience the variation which characterizes this land of extremes. For someone with eclectic tastes, the Great Basin is the only place to be. Until now I would have to take friends (only very close friends) to the Delamar Mountains where an army of junipers marches down into a sea of joshua, to a hot springs in Grass Valley to soak as the sky grows dark and you can see “a million stars with one eye and two million with both,” to sit on the Gilbert Beach in the Silver Island Range and watch a lightning storm roll across the endless playa of the Great Salt Lake Desert in a thousand shades of gray, to the White Mountains to hike above the current tree line among the silent sentinels of long-dead bristlecones, or to any of a thousand other places each equally different. As one colleague from a large eastern metropolis exclaimed to me as we walked in awe up an isolated tributary of Meadow Valley Wash, “If this place was within two hundred miles of Philadelphia it would be a National Park; here it’s just another damn canyon.” Now, unfortunately,
we have Great Basin National Park and books like Trimble's. If we keep this up the Basin will be just like California.

While *The Sagebrush Ocean* can hold its own with the best in the environmental genre in terms of esthetics, what truly sets it apart is that it actually provides a scientifically valid and readily grasped review of the natural history of the Great Basin. Geomorphology, climate, flora, and fauna are all knowledgeably treated and, moreover, are integrated into understandable patterns that give the general reader an accurate sense of what the Great Basin is all about. What is especially good about Trimble's approach is that the ever changing nature of Basin ecosystems is fully integrated into his explanations of Great Basin environments. Most natural histories are limited to static descriptions of current conditions when, in nearly all cases, the present is merely one moment in a constantly changing mosaic of rainfall, rock, raptor, and reptile.

There are some drawbacks to *The Sagebrush Ocean* despite its overall excellence. Principal among these is Trimble's failure to include a major species—*H. sapiens*—in his discussion of the interplay of landscape and life. While he does include descriptions of how industrial societies have affected Great Basin environments over the last century, he provides virtually nothing on the way that prehistoric farming and hunter-gatherer groups interacted with other plant and animal species to produce the "natural" environmental settings of the modern Great Basin. For example, a major theory concerning the migration of pinyon through the Basin during the last ten thousand years is that people were the principal agent of dispersal. He might also have mentioned people in his discussion of the limited number of plants and animals in the iodine bush communities which rim Great Basin playas, since prehistoric hunters and gatherers used the plant as a major winter storage resource throughout the length of human occupation of the Basin. In short, people are as "natural" as sagebrush, and the failure to include them in a natural history is a serious omission.

Despite this I fell in love with Stephen Trimble's account of the Great Basin, and I suspect that on those occasions when I sit too long in front of my word processor writing reviews like this or I have been in too many meetings to leave for a weekend of searching for woodrat middens in the Deep Creek Mountains, I will pick up *The Sagebrush Ocean* just to see Lamoille Canyon or Steens Mountain through the eyes of a photographer whose feeling for the Great Basin is almost a match for its wonder. I just hope the University of Nevada Press had enough sense to limit the printing to a single digit number.

---

**DAVID B. MADSEN**  
*Utah Division of State History*

---

*Lake Powell: Virgin Flow to Dynamo.* By **LOREN D. POTTER** and **CHARLES L. DRAKE.**  
(Albuquerque: University of New Mexico Press, 1989. xviii + 310 pp. Cloth, $35.00; paper, $17.95.)

If you're off to Lake Powell to fish, swim, hike, camp, or just enjoy the spectacular scenery, then you do not need this book. A tourist who pores over its contents may find 10 percent of it interesting. But visitors with probing minds and scientific awareness may want to "see" the bottom of the lake as
well as the surface, may yearn to be able to read the geologic record of its shoreline strata, may hope to become intimate with its verdure and its creatures. For those persons this is the book. It should be required reading for National Park Service rangers and other specialists who might serve Glen Canyon National Recreation Area (in which Lake Powell stands in southern Utah and northern Arizona) for a lifetime without being able to absorb all this information from other sources.

Most of the more than three million people who visit Lake Powell each year appreciate it as a red-rock, blue-water wonderland where boating, fishing, hiking, swimming, and camping can be enjoyed beneath a seemingly ever-present sun. Conversely, the authors of this book regard the huge reservoir and its environs as a scientific conundrum that must be taken apart rock by rock, plant by plant, fish by fish and scrutinized for resolutions to any and all questions concerning the region’s past and present. The future is left, as the insurance companies say, to those who prepare for it.

Likening the lake behind Glen Canyon Dam to a “storage battery” from which water and power are drawn when needed elsewhere, the authors include chapters on geology, biota, prehistoric uses by man, shoreline surface features, physical-biological effects of fluctuating water levels, sedimentation history, dynamics of reservoir temperatures, and many more subjects. A mini-biography of John Wesley Powell, the scientist for whom the lake is named (and who if alive today would be ecstatic over this book’s publication), plus a bit about the building of the great dam are also included.

The purpose of their well-written text is “to provide the most complete description possible of the past and present ecology of the Lake Powell environment,” the learned authors state. They include some good color and black-and-white photographs of just about everything except what Lake Powell is most noted for: recreation.

The average reader who enjoys the subject of Lake Powell Country may find himself skip-reading this book because he feels it stresses minor or trivial points (eight pages are devoted to the effects of inundation on tamarisk shrubs). The more inquisitive person will recognize and appreciate the long and commendable research that was necessary to its publication. An intellectual will comprehend the depth and degree of the dedicated investigations necessary to the many disciplines that apply to this work.

The handsome cover of this high quality paperback volume may tempt those who seek new information on recreational opportunities as Lake Powell. But, alas, no such data is within its pages; this is a textbook, a pedantic tome coauthored by a professor emeritus of plant ecology at the University of New Mexico (Potter) and a professor of geology at Dartmouth College (Drake). But if you are turned on by mossback sandstone or the Shinarump conglomerate, paradox evaporites, brome grasses and fescues, phreatophytes, advective currents or spotted smearmophiles, then hasten to the bookstore for a copy of this one.

This reviewer found the texts, although basically treatises on ecology, to be factual and surprisingly unbiased, so much so that their material could be used by adversaries such as the Sierra Club and the U.S. Bureau of Reclamation to support the stand of either.

Much of the information in Lake Powell, Virgin Flow to Dynamo has been
published before by others (including this reviewer) but never in a single-volume summary that includes new scientific data gleaned from fifteen years of ecosystem monitoring by the authors. Of special interest is the revelation that sixteen pairs of endangered peregrine falcons and perhaps fifty bald eagles use Lake Powell as a habitat. Further, in newly discovered Bechan Cave the dung of mammoths, together with evidence of sloth occupation (perhaps 30,000 years ago), have been revealed. Man, the authors say, may have lived in Glen Canyon as long ago as 7,700 years.

Such recent findings and other potential scientific breakthroughs prompt the two professors to end their book with a plea for additional grant funds to continue monitoring of the region.

Stan Jones
Page, Arizona


This book covers an important phase in twentieth-century western history. Its scope ranges far beyond uranium mining on the Colorado Plateau.

Fortunately the main people involved are still alive and Ringholz had personal interviews with most of them. She does a commendable job of presenting the personalities and events surrounding uranium prospecting during the boom of the 1950s.

Three main themes dominate the book. The first is the prospecting for and development of uranium deposits. This was set off by the government's need for a domestic supply of uranium in order to stay ahead of Russia in the Cold War. Frenzied activity followed newspaper and magazine reports of Charlie Steen's rich strike in southeastern Utah. The rags-to-riches account of Steen and his Mi Vida mine threads its way through the book. Would-be miners swarmed to the area. In little over a year Moab, Utah, jumped from a population of 1,200 to over 7,000. It became a boom town reminiscent of the Yukon gold rush. Some, like Steen and Vernon Pick, made it big. Others made lesser amounts. Many went away broke without finding any of the elusive metal.

Second is the colorful story of the over-the-counter uranium stock boom and the proliferation of new brokerage houses in Salt Lake City. Money was needed to develop the mines. Brokers and stock dealers were swept up in uranium fever. They conceived the idea of penny stock issues to fill this gap. The idea caught on like wildfire, driving stock prices up to many times their issue value. Salt Lake City became the uranium stock center of the country. Money came in from all over America before this bubble burst too.

Third is the concern and frustration of research personnel in the Public Health Service. They were aware of the high casualty rate of uranium miners in Europe and were concerned about the risk of lung cancer in local miners. It took long-term exposure to radiation by the European miners to bring on sickness. Research indicated that proper ventilation in the mines would minimize the danger, but this would mean an added cost of production. Warnings about the ill effects of radiation on uranium miners were disputed...
or ignored by mine operators. The Atomic Energy Commission and mine operators wanted nothing to interfere with the production of uranium. They would only allow the Public Health Service to continue research and monitor radon levels in the mines if they would not talk to miners about the possible danger to their health or release any of their findings to the press.

Ringholz could have related how the AEC in Washington had to be petitioned repeatedly by such men as Howard W. Balsley, Fendoll A. Sitton, Ray A. Bennett, and Colorado Senators Milikin and Johnson before they would even consider the Colorado Plateau as a source of uranium. She did not address the difference, if any, in the risk of lung cancer between smokers and non-smokers exposed to long-term radiation. The Atlas Mill is located across the river from Moab, not on the town side. These things are of minor importance in an interesting, well-written work.

_Uranium Frenzy_ is must reading for students or laymen interested in any of the three main thrusts of the book.

**Richard E. Westwood**

Scottsdale, Arizona

---


For the past decade and a half, it has been common to refer to Gerald Nash's _The American West in the Twentieth Century_ as "the best textbook in the field." The "in" joke about Nash's pathbreaking volume was that it was also virtually the _only_ textbook in the field. Now it has been joined by an outstanding new synthesis of the western experience since the turn of the century.

Michael Malone and Richard Etulain have had, of course, another decade since Nash last revised his survey to draw from the burgeoning literature and develop a fresh perspective. The result, _The American West: A Twentieth-century History_, is a book worthy of superlatives. While it is properly classified as a textbook since it eschews footnotes in favor of extensive bibliographic essays for each chapter, the book is written with clarity and verve and will appeal to scholars and buffs alike. The organization is a mixture of chronological and topical, beginning with "The Emerging Postfrontier Economy, 1900-1930" and the "Politics of the Postfrontier Era" for the same period and concluding with the "Politics of the Modern Era, 1945-1987" with chapters in between on social patterns, culture, and the multifaceted economy of the American West.

The region under examination is defined as the seventeen adjacent states from the tier straddling the 98th meridian (North Dakota-Texas) west to the Pacific Ocean, thus excluding Alaska and Hawaii. One of the most remarkable achievements of the book is the way in which it maintains a truly regional perspective, pick and choosing illustrative examples from this vast and diverse territory wherever they happen to appear. Indeed, the most appropriate adjectives to describe this study are _comprehensive_ and _balanced_; hardly any person or event of importance in the last nine decades of western American history is missing, and only
those seeking polemical support for
previously held views on specific sub-
jects will be disappointed. The authors
are well aware, for example, of the toll
western insensitivity and greed has
taken on the environment (logging
operations in the late nineteenth cen-
tury are described as “wasteful in the
familiar frontier manner”), but there is
also an undercurrent of admiration for
the energy and imagination that went
into many aspects of regional develop-
ment. The introduction seeks to define
the West’s distinctive characteristics,
from aridity to a commonly shared
history, the legacy of “colonialism,”
explotation of natural resources, the
high concentration of lands owned by
the federal government, and the
mystique of the “wild” frontier past,
but the variations within that con-
ceptual framework are not ignored.
The cultural complexity of the region is
honored with attention to the multi-
plicity of racial and ethnic groups re-
siding in it, and a genuine effort is made
to lend visibility to the role of women.

Students of Utah history will find the
contributions of the state well repres-
tented. Due coverage is given to the
important technological innovations
associated with Bingham Canyon and
Kennecott Copper early in the century
and to the rise of Geneva Steel (with
$200 million worth of federal assist-
ance) in World War II. The changing
face of Mormonism since the Woodruff
Manifesto of 1890 is noted, culminat-
ing in the current status of the Latter-
day Saints as “one of America’s most
dynamic and fastest-growing churches.”
This observation comes in a fascinating
chapter, “Culture in the Modern West,”
impressive for its comprehensiveness.

All in all, The American West is an
entertaining and amazingly informa-
tive book and a “must” for anyone
interested in the history of the region
since Utah achieved statehood.

F.AlanCoombs
University of Utah

The Twentieth-century West: Historical Interpretations. Edited by Gerald D. Nash and
454 pp. Cloth, $40.00; paper, $17.50.]

As I write this review, we are less than
six months away from the centennial of
the year that, according to Frederick
Jackson Turner, the United States ceased
to have a frontier. Both the general
public and American historians have
long associated the West with the fron-
tier, but for academic historians this
connection has proved less and less
fruitful. Turner’s frontier interpretation
of American history is no longer of
much academic significance, and
western history has become more and
more an academic backwater. As a
result, historians seeking to revitalize
the field have tended to emphasize the
West as a region; once the West is
viewed as a region, the twentieth cen-
tury logically deserves as much atten-
tion as the nineteenth. Over the last
twenty years or so there has been a
boom in studies of the twentieth-
century West.

This collection of essays on the
twentieth-century West is an attempt to
summarize and assess this scholarship
and to shape its future direction.
Etulain, in his introduction, phrases
the distinction between the older and
newer history in terms of a “to the
West” history with its stress on migration and what he calls the “in the West,” or regional, history largely emphasized here. Divided into five parts—people, economy, politics, environment, and culture—the book includes both the staples of the older western history and topics largely ignored until the last twenty years. Thus there are essays on resource issues, demography and population growth, politics, Indians, and reform movements alongside articles on Mexican Americans, women, the metropolitan West, the environment, and western art and literature.

As in any such collection, the essays themselves are something of a mixed bag. Most of these essays attempt some combination of a review of the existing literature with a schematic summary of their particular topic, but the emphasis varies from author to author. The best of them manage to merge these two concerns relatively smoothly; others ramble or get lost in a numbing detail that will interest only the specialist. Karen Anderson’s essay on women in the West and William Robbins’s article on the lumber industry are particularly useful; both manage to provide a guide to the literature and a capsule history of the subject while providing a penetrating critique of the field and its issues.

Perhaps the best essays in the book—Carl Abbott on the “Metropolitan Region” and Paul Kleppner’s “Politics without Parties”—are original and striking pieces of work that move beyond synthesis to offer important formulations of western trends and developments. Abbott’s essay demonstrates a grasp of larger issues of metropolitan growth, impressive command of the literature, and a keen sense of how these pertain to a western regional history. His work is a convincing example of how western historians can break out of their old parochial concerns without losing a sense of the West as a distinct region. Kleppner’s article is perhaps the single most important piece of work in the collection. It will certainly become the standard for evaluating western regional politics. Surveying voting patterns from the Populists to Reagan, Kleppner provides a suggestive interpretation of how the West evolved from the most “radical” to the most “conservative” section of the nation. Although certain to be questioned in its specifics, it provides the first compelling analysis of western voting behavior over the century as a whole. It is a gem of an essay.

In addition to the essays, and a prologue and an epilogue by the editors, a useful bibliography is also included. The volume provides an excellent place to start for anyone interested in an overview of and a background to the issues that confront the modern West.

Richard White
University of Utah


The history of Utah’s metal mining and its labor has often been overshadowed by the wealth of the Comstock Lode and the violent class warfare of Colorado. In Workers’ Health, Workers’ Democracy, Alan Derickson weaves the activity of Utah’s metal miners, primarily the Park City local of the Western Federation of Miners (WFM), into the overall story of the endeavor of
western miners to achieve self-reliance in improved working conditions, health care, and mutual assistance. Derickson's study looks at the local hard-rock unions throughout the West and their strategy of establishing and controlling hospitals, the administration of nursing programs, regulation of dangerous working conditions, and the engagement in various other mutual-aid endeavors. This strategy was one of “grassroots self-help” and embodied a history of what Derickson has labeled “working-class history from an institutional perspective.”

Western miners worked to declare an independence—highlighted in 1893 with the establishment of the Western Federation of Miners of which Utah miners were a part. According to the author, such an attitude of independence stemmed from actual working and social conditions. For example, the Cornish system of leasing—working ground in a mine that was leased from a company or individual—helped “to foster and sustain a sense of independence.” This practice, most evident in Utah, led to self-reliance and self-confidence, allowing miners to “sink roots in a community.” Miners also built grassroots strength by creating “scab lists,” having union leaders recruit members, establishing community libraries, and sponsoring parades and celebrations. Many Utah mining communities buzzed with labor union parades and Labor Day festivities. For Derickson, these elements of self-help were funneled into programs in health and welfare.

Occupational hazards necessitated such action. Evident were hoisting and dynamite accidents, falls, fire, fatalities caused by worker fatigue, and disease, primarily silicosis. In fact, Derickson found that in the late nineteenth century conditions of lead poisoning in the district surrounding Park City were “perhaps the worst in the industry. By the turn of the century miners “had more to fear from a wide range of work-induced diseases” than from job-related accidents.

Mutual aid became of primary significance to western miners. For Derickson, mutualism “integrated protective measures on the job with benevolent activities outside the workplace.” There were union sick committees that were charged with making regular calls on those ill. In this regard the WFM considered sickness and accident compensation as an essential part of unionism, a legacy that continues. Furthermore, such aid in death was viewed as most significant—“the primary purpose of union death benefits was to avoid burial in a potter’s field.” Funerals were important. As in Utah, many local unions had member ribbons, colorful on one side and black on the other, for use in funeral processions. This fear, and the need for mutual aid, transcended ethnic lines.

Following from the above situations came the need of the union to establish its own hospitals. Here, Derickson maintains, “a desire for independence from employers’ dictation was a major factor underlying the hospital initiative.” In all, at least twenty-five local affiliates of the WFM established their own hospitals. The Park City Local 144 was included. The author describes the efforts that led to the establishment of the Park City Miners’ Hospital in 1904. Park City miners actually attempted such a feat in the 1880s but, according to Derickson, their efforts were blocked by “local Salt Lake hospitals.” While union-sponsored health care functioned reasonably well, the “decentralization” of these efforts and strategy proved to
be a limitation. From here the union struggled for “prevention” measures; coupled with the “new paternalism” of company-sponsored programs, labor and management had, by 1920, begun to “integrate the determination of health and welfare benefits into the general collective bargaining process.”

Alan Derickson’s thoughtful and well documented study illuminates a very important aspect of western mining history. For the Utah historian the work places Utah miners in the mainstream of activity. In this regard, Derickson could have looked beyond Park City, although he does mention some activity in Bingham and elsewhere. The work makes excellent use of a wide variety of both primary and secondary sources. It is highly recommended for students and those interested in Utah mining and labor history.

PHILIP F. NOTARIANNI
Utah State Historical Society
Lewis and Clark journals, summarizing the party's geographical progress while emphasizing its scientific accomplishments. Each chapter concludes with a list of new species of flora and fauna discovered, new Indian tribes encountered, and topographical features named.


This hefty text is designed to encourage critical thinking about history by introducing students to both primary sources and analytical essays on important topics in western American history. The documents range from a Chippewa narrative recorded in 1855 to Helen Mar Whitney's 1884 defense of plural marriage to David Brodsly's view of Los Angeles freeways. The essays are equally diverse. Arranged in fifteen chapters, the documents and essays cover such topics as land policy, frontier violence, the fur trade, overland migration and family structure, and the federal influence, among others.


Essays include discussions of partisanship in Idaho, the rise of the Democratic party in Montana in the last twenty years, David Leroy's 1986 bid for the governorship of Idaho, and feminist issues in the Rocky Mountain legislatures. Frances Farley, currently serving in the Utah State Senate, is the author of an essay entitled: "A Woman's Place is in the House and in the Senate," which includes a discussion of the evolution of her career from housewife to politician.


A veritable encyclopedia of North American Indian dances in their social and religious contexts, this work, published in hard cover in 1977, includes a fifty-page historical survey, an exploration of principal pan-tribal dance forms, and a partial area survey of dances unique to particular tribes. The Laubins, authors of important works on the Indian tipi and American Indian archery, have devoted their personal and professional lives to the preservation and interpretation of American Indian dances and culture. Their book conveys the deeply religious import of the dances and is a treasure trove of cultural background material. Almost fifty pages are devoted to the Sun Dance, perhaps the dance most misinterpreted by outsiders.

To have read any of the prolific Manfred’s novels of what he calls Siouxland would be enough motive to read this collection of 271 letters from the formative period of his college years and early literary career up to the appearance of what many consider his masterpiece, Lord Grizzly. But those who know Manfred personally or who have read John R. Milton’s Conversations with Frederick Manfred (Salt Lake City: University of Utah Press, 1974) will expect and find an added literary zest in his extraordinary outspokenness and frankness of self-examination.

Manfred is known among western writers for his cooperativeness with literary critics; he wants his works to be subjected to the most informed critical analysis possible. Thus he has been consistently available for interviews and critical symposia and has made his early papers accessible to scholars. Manfred assisted the editors in selecting the letters included here and requested only the most minimal deletions where harm could be caused to living persons.

Bacavi: Journey to Reed Springs. By Peter Whiteley. ([Flagstaff, Ariz.: Northland Press], 1988. xvi + 166 pp. paper, $14.95.)

Meant as a popular history of Bacavi, a Hopi village in Arizona, this volume runs parallel to another work, Deliberate Acts: Changing Hopi Culture through the Oraibi Split (University of Arizona Press). Both books come out of the same research. Deliberate Acts is non-academic and is meant to be a village history. Even though Bacavi was formed in 1909, the history of its people goes back to the sixteenth century. Bacavi, a Third Mesa Hopi village, was founded after factionalism brought about a split in Oraibi in 1906. This volume contains chapters on the mythological origins of the Hopi, the Spanish and Mexican periods, the arrival of the Anglo-Americans, the Oraibi split and the founding of Bacavi, the founders of Bacavi, the building of the village, ceremonial organizations and practices, way of life, and present living conditions.

STATEMENT OF OWNERSHIP, MANAGEMENT, AND CIRCULATION

The Utah Historical Quarterly (ISSN 0042-143X) is published quarterly by the Utah State Historical Society, 300 Rio Grande, Salt Lake City, Utah, 84101. The editor is Max J. Evans and the managing editor is Stanford J. Layton with offices at the same address as the publisher. The magazine is owned by the Utah State Historical Society, and no individual or company owns or holds any bonds, mortgages, or other securities of the Society or its magazine.

The following figures are the average number of copies of each issue during the preceding twelve months: 3,497 copies printed; 123 paid circulation; 2,649 mail subscriptions; 2,772 total paid circulation; 246 free distribution (including samples) by mail, carrier, or other means; 3,018 total distribution; 479 inventory for office use, leftover, unaccounted, spoiled after printing; total, 3,497.

The following figures are the actual number of copies of single issue published nearest to filing date: 3,500 copies printed; 36 paid circulation; 2,704 mail subscriptions; 2,740 total paid circulation; 266 free distribution (including samples) by mail, carrier, or other means; 3,006 total distribution; 494 inventory for office use, leftover, unaccounted, spoiled after printing; total, 3,500.
The Utah State Historical Society was organized in 1897 by public-spirited Utahns to collect, preserve, and publish Utah and related history. Today, under state sponsorship, the Society fulfills its obligations by publishing the *Utah Historical Quarterly* and other historical materials: collecting historic Utah artifacts; locating, documenting, and preserving historic and prehistoric buildings and sites; and maintaining a specialized research library. Donations and gifts to the Society's programs, museum, or its library are encouraged, for only through such means can it live up to its responsibility of preserving the record of Utah's past.

This publication has been funded with the assistance of a matching grant-in-aid from the Department of the Interior, National Park Service, under provisions of the National Historic Preservation Act of 1966 as amended.

This program receives financial assistance for identification and preservation of historic properties under Title VI of the Civil Rights Act of 1964 and Section 504 of the Rehabilitation Act of 1973. The U.S. Department of the Interior prohibits discrimination on the basis of race, color, national origin, or handicap in its federally assisted programs. If you believe you have been discriminated against in any program, activity, or facility as described above, or if you desire further information, please write to: Office of Equal Opportunity, U.S. Department of the Interior, Washington, D.C. 20240.